



ISSN 0269-0403

PUBLISHED FOR THE  
ROYAL MUSICAL  
ASSOCIATION

JOURNAL OF THE  
**ROYAL  
MUSICAL  
ASSOCIATION**

VOLUME 145, PART 1, 2020



**CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS**

# JOURNAL OF THE Royal Musical Association

## EDITOR

Freya Jarman, *Department of Music, University of Liverpool, 80-82 Bedford St South, Liverpool, L69 7WW* ([f.jarman@liverpool.ac.uk](mailto:f.jarman@liverpool.ac.uk))

## REVIEWS EDITOR

Sarah Collins, *Conservatorium of Music, The University of Western Australia, Crawley, Perth, Western Australia 6009, Australia* ([sarah.collins@uwa.edu.au](mailto:sarah.collins@uwa.edu.au))

## ASSISTANT EDITOR

Ian Rumbold, *33 Selly Wick Drive, Selly Park, Birmingham, B29 7JQ, UK* ([ianrumbold@aol.com](mailto:ianrumbold@aol.com))

## PROOFREADER

Marija Đurić Speare, *111 Fyfield Road, Walthamstow, London, E17 3RE, UK* ([marijads111@gmail.com](mailto:marijads111@gmail.com))

## EDITORIAL BOARD

Naomi André, *University of Michigan*

Ian Biddle, *University of Newcastle*

Davinia Caddy, *Naxos Records*

Christopher Chowrimootoo, *University of Notre Dame*

Lisa Colton, *University of Huddersfield*

Ben Curry, *University of Birmingham*

Melanie Fritsch, *Independent Scholar*

Roni Granot, *Hebrew University of Jerusalem*

Matthew Head, *King's College London*

Thomas Hilder, *Norwegian University of Science and Technology*

Brian Inglis, *Middlesex University London*

Elaine King, *University of Hull*

Deirdre Loughridge, *Northeastern University*

Miguel Mera, *City, University of London*

Grant Olwage, *University of the Witwatersrand*

Gascia Ouzounian, *University of Oxford*

Catherine Tackley, *University of Liverpool*

Bettina Varwig, *University of Cambridge*

The *Journal* is provided free to members of the Royal Musical Association. For further information on membership, or to apply for membership, visit [www.rma.ac.uk/members/](http://www.rma.ac.uk/members/), or contact the Executive Officer of the RMA, Dr Jeffrey Dean, 4 Chandos Road, Chorlton-cum-Hardy, Manchester, M21 0ST, UK; fax +44 (0)161 861 7543; email [jeffrey.dean@stingrayoffi ce.com](mailto:jeffrey.dean@stingrayoffi.ce.com).

The annual membership subscription for 2020 for individuals is £75.00; students/retired £37.50; joint (one copy of the *Journal* to two members at the same private address) £112.50.

# JOURNAL OF THE Royal Musical Association

VOLUME 145 PART 1 2020

---

## CONTENTS

Bound Together: The Intimacies of Music-Book Collecting in the Early American Republic <i>Glenda Goodman</i>	1
Appropriations of Gregorian Chant in <i>Fin-de-siècle</i> French Opera: <i>Couleur locale</i> – Message-Opera – Allusion? <i>Benedikt Lefsmann</i>	37
Microtonal Restraint <i>Annika Forkert</i>	75
<i>Treatise</i> and the <i>Tractatus</i> <i>David Cline</i>	119
Maskanda, <i>Umkhosi wokukhahlela</i> and the Articulation of Identity in South Africa <i>Nanette De Jong and King Madzikane II Thandiszwe Diko</i>	167
Involving Experiences: Audiencing and Co-reception in <i>Pleasure Garden</i> <i>Joseph Browning</i>	191
<b>Review Articles</b>	
The Ambiguous Ethics of Music's Ineffability: A Brief Reflection on the Recent Thought of Michael Gallope and Carolyn Abbate <i>Martin Scherzinger</i>	229
Not in their Minds Mary Ann Smart, <i>Waiting for Verdi: Opera and Political Opinion in Nineteenth-Century Italy, 1815–1848</i> <i>Francesca Vella</i>	251
The Dent Medal	259
Contributors	263