

THE BULLETIN OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC

Edited by

James Cummings, *Managing Editor*
Guram Bezhanishvili Salma Kuhlmann
Katalin Bimbó Øystein Linnebo
Peter Dybjer Arno Pauly
Ali Enayat

Reviews Editors

Graham Leach-Krouse, *Managing Editor for Reviews*
Albert Atserias Antonio Montalbán
Mark van Atten Valeria de Paiva
Clinton Conley Christian Retoré
Johanna Franklin Marion Scheepers
Dugald Macpherson Nam Trang

Thesis Abstracts Editor

Sandra Müller

VOLUME 30 • NUMBER 3 • SEPTEMBER 2024 • ISSN 1079-8986

Copyright © 2025 by the Association for Symbolic Logic. All rights reserved.
Reproduction by photostat, photo-print, microfilm, or like process by permission only.



PUBLISHED BY CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS & ASSESSMENT FOR
AND ON BEHALF OF THE ASSOCIATION OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC.

The BULLETIN, the JOURNAL and the REVIEW OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC are the official organs of the Association for Symbolic Logic, an international organization for furthering research in logic and the exchange of ideas among mathematicians, computer scientists, linguists, and others interested in this field. The BULLETIN encourages submissions of *Articles* and *Communications* in all areas of logic, including mathematical or philosophical logic, logic in computer science or linguistics, the history or philosophy of logic, and applications of logic to other fields. It also encourages the submissions of abstracts for doctoral level theses in logic. The BULLETIN also publishes reviews of publications in logic.

Editors

James Cummings (Managing Editor), Department of Mathematical Sciences, Carnegie Mellon University, Wean Hall 6113, Pittsburgh, PA 15213, USA

jcumming@andrew.cmu.edu

Guram Bezhanishvili, Department of Mathematical Sciences, New Mexico State University, Las Cruces, NM 88003, USA

guram@nmsu.edu

Katalin Bimbó, Department of Philosophy, University of Alberta, 2-40 Assiniboia Hall Edmonton, AB T6G 2E7, Canada

bimbo@ualberta.ca

Peter Dybjer, Department of Computer Science and Engineering, Chalmers University of Technology, SE 412 96 Göteborg, Sweden

peterd@chalmers.se

Ali Enayat, Department of Philosophy, Linguistics, and Theory of Science, University of Gothenburg, Box 200, SE 405 30, Gothenburg, Sweden

ali.enayat@gu.se

Salma Kuhlmann, Fachbereich Mathematik und Statistik, Universität Konstanz, Konstanz 78457, Germany

salma.kuhlmann@uni-konstanz.de

Øystein Linnebo, Department of Philosophy, IFIKK, 0315 Oslo, Norway

oystein.linnebo@ifikk.uio.no

Arno Pauly, School of Mathematics and Computer Science, Swansea University, Bay Campus, Swansea SA1 8EN, UK

arno.m.pauly@gmail.com

Reviews editors

Graham Leach-Krouse (Managing Editor), Kansas State University, Kansas, USA, g_leachkr@ksu.edu

Albert Atserias atserias@cs.upc.edu,

Mark van Atten mark.vanatten@univ-paris1.fr,

Clinton Conley clintonc@andrew.cmu.edu,

Johanna Franklin johanna.n.franklin@hofstra.edu,

Dugald Macpherson pmthdm@maths.leeds.ac.uk,

Antonio Montalbán antonio@math.berkeley.edu,

Valeria de Paiva valeria.depaiva@gmail.com,

Christian Retoré christian.retore@limm.fr,

Marion Scheepers mscheepe@boisestate.edu, and

Nam Trang namtrang35@gmail.com.

Thesis abstracts editor

Sandra Müller sandra.mueller@tuwien.ac.at

Articles present topics of broad interest in a way that is accessible to a large audience. They can be purely expository, survey, or historical articles or they may contain, in addition, new ideas or results or new approaches to old ones.

Communications should be announcements of important new results and ideas in any aspect of logic; they may be short papers in their final form or preliminary announcements (extended abstracts, position papers) of longer, full papers that will be published elsewhere. In any case, they should include, in addition to a description of the new results or ideas, enough history, background, and explanation to make the significance of the work apparent to a wide audience. *Communications* will be quickly refereed and published within six months of the submission of final version.

To submit *Articles* or *Communications* please follow the procedure described at <https://asonline.org/journals/the-bulletin-of-symbolic-logic/the-bulletin-of-symbolic-logic-submission-guidelines>.

To submit *Thesis Abstracts* please follow the procedure described at <https://asonline.org/journals/the-bulletin-of-symbolic-logic/logic-thesis-abstracts-in-the-bulletin-of-symbolic-logic>.

Books for review in the BULLETIN should be sent to **ASL, Department of Mathematics, University of Connecticut, 341 Mansfield Road, U-1009, Storrs, CT 06269-1009, USA.**

The BULLETIN, the JOURNAL and the REVIEW OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC are the official organs of the Association for Symbolic Logic, an international organization for furthering research in logic and the exchange of ideas among mathematicians, computer scientists, linguists, and others interested in this field. The BULLETIN encourages submissions of *Articles* and *Communications* in all areas of logic, including mathematical or philosophical logic, logic in computer science or linguistics, the history or philosophy of logic, and applications of logic to other fields. It also encourages the submissions of abstracts for doctoral level theses in logic. The BULLETIN also publishes reviews of publications in logic.

Editors

James Cummings (Managing Editor), Department of Mathematical Sciences, Carnegie Mellon University, Wean Hall 6113, Pittsburgh, PA 15213, USA

jcumming@andrew.cmu.edu

Guram Bezhanishvili, Department of Mathematical Sciences, New Mexico State University, Las Cruces, NM 88003, USA

guram@nmsu.edu

Katalin Bimbó, Department of Philosophy, University of Alberta, 2-40 Assiniboia Hall Edmonton, AB T6G 2E7, Canada

bimbo@ualberta.ca

Peter Dybjer, Department of Computer Science and Engineering, Chalmers University of Technology, SE 412 96 Göteborg, Sweden

peterd@chalmers.se

Ali Enayat, Department of Philosophy, Linguistics, and Theory of Science, University of Gothenburg, Box 200, SE 405 30, Gothenburg, Sweden

ali.enayat@gu.se

Salma Kuhlmann, Fachbereich Mathematik und Statistik, Universität Konstanz, Konstanz 78457, Germany

salma.kuhlmann@uni-konstanz.de

Øystein Linnebo, Department of Philosophy, IFIKK, 0315 Oslo, Norway

oystein.linnebo@ifikk.uio.no

Arno Pauly, School of Mathematics and Computer Science, Swansea University, Bay Campus, Swansea SA1 8EN, UK

arno.m.pauly@gmail.com

Reviews editors

Graham Leach-Krouse (Managing Editor), Kansas State University, Kansas, USA, g_leachkr@ksu.edu

Albert Atserias atserias@cs.upc.edu,

Mark van Atten mark.vanatten@univ-paris1.fr,

Clinton Conley clintonc@andrew.cmu.edu,

Johanna Franklin johanna.n.franklin@hofstra.edu,

Dugald Macpherson pmthdm@maths.leeds.ac.uk,

Antonio Montalbán antonio@math.berkeley.edu,

Valeria de Paiva valeria.depaiva@gmail.com,

Christian Retoré christian.retore@limm.fr,

Marion Scheepers mscheepe@boisestate.edu, and

Nam Trang namtrang35@gmail.com.

Thesis abstracts editor

Sandra Müller sandra.mueller@tuwien.ac.at

Articles present topics of broad interest in a way that is accessible to a large audience. They can be purely expository, survey, or historical articles or they may contain, in addition, new ideas or results or new approaches to old ones.

Communications should be announcements of important new results and ideas in any aspect of logic; they may be short papers in their final form or preliminary announcements (extended abstracts, position papers) of longer, full papers that will be published elsewhere. In any case, they should include, in addition to a description of the new results or ideas, enough history, background, and explanation to make the significance of the work apparent to a wide audience. *Communications* will be quickly refereed and published within six months of the submission of final version.

To submit *Articles* or *Communications* please follow the procedure described at <https://asonline.org/journals/the-bulletin-of-symbolic-logic/the-bulletin-of-symbolic-logic-submission-guidelines>.

To submit *Thesis Abstracts* please follow the procedure described at <https://asonline.org/journals/the-bulletin-of-symbolic-logic/logic-thesis-abstracts-in-the-bulletin-of-symbolic-logic>.

Books for review in the BULLETIN should be sent to **ASL, Department of Mathematics, University of Connecticut, 341 Mansfield Road, U-1009, Storrs, CT 06269-1009, USA.**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ARTICLES

| | |
|--|-----|
| A club guessing toolbox I by TANMAY INAMDAR AND ASSAF RINOT..... | 303 |
| Pour-El's landscape by TAISHI KURAHASHI AND ALBERT VISSER..... | 362 |
| A note on continuous functions on metric spaces by SAM SANDERS..... | 398 |

REVIEWS

| | |
|---|-----|
| J. Kirby. <i>An invitation to model theory</i> Reviewed by A. Martin-Pizarro..... | 421 |
| E. Mares. <i>The Logic of Entailment and its History</i> Reviewed by Tore Fjetland Øgaard..... | 422 |
| S. Iaquinto and G. Torrenço. <i>Fragmenting Reality: An Essay on Passage, Causality and Time</i> Reviewed by Lorenzo Azzano..... | 424 |
| T. Piecha and P. Schroeder-Heister. <i>Incompleteness of Intuitionistic Propositional Logic with Respect to Proof-Theoretic Semantics</i> Reviewed by Will Stafford..... | 427 |
| M. Bodirsky. <i>Complexity of Infinite-Domain Constraint Satisfaction</i> Reviewed by Andrei Krokhin..... | 431 |

IN MEMORIAM

| | |
|--|-----|
| Saul Kripke (1940–2022) by SERGEI ARTEMOV, JOHN P. BURGESS, MELVIN FITTING AND ANANDI HATTIANGADI..... | 433 |
|--|-----|

MEETING REPORTS

| | |
|--|-----|
| The Second International Conference on Homotopy type Theory (HoTT 2023), Pittsburgh, USA, May 22–25, 2023..... | 443 |
| Model Theory Conference in Seoul, Seoul, South Korea, August 28–30, 2023..... | 444 |
| Model theory workshop and Conference 2023, Wrocław, Poland, September 15–23, 2023..... | 445 |
| Conference: Model theory and Groups, A conference on the occasion of Katrin Tent's 60th Birthday, Münster, Germany, September 25–29, 2023..... | 446 |
| The fourteenth PHD's-in-Logic International, Conference (PHD's in Logic 2023), Granada, Spain, October 4–6, 2023..... | 447 |
| Australasian Logic Colloquium, Brisbane, Australia, 6–8 November 2023..... | 448 |
| NOTICES..... | 449 |