

VOLUME 28

NUMBER 1

JANUARY 2019

CQ

Cambridge

Quarterly of

Healthcare

Ethics

*A Quarterly Journal Devoted to
Engaging a World Community
of Bioethicists*

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS



Cambridge
Quarterly of
Healthcare
Ethics

A Quarterly
Journal Devoted
to Engaging a
World Community
of Bioethicists

EDITORS

Thomasine Kushner, PhD, *University of California, Berkeley*
Steve Heilig, MPH, *San Francisco Medical Society*

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Matti Häyry, *Aalto University, Helsinki, Finland*
Tuija Takala, *University of Helsinki, Finland*

David C. Thomasma, PhD, Co-Editor, 1992–2002

EDITORIAL BOARD

Akira Akabayashi, *Kyoto University, Japan*
William Andereck, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*
Daniel Callahan, *The Hastings Center, Garrison, New York*
Arthur Caplan, *Division of Medical Ethics, NYU Langone Medical Center, New York*
Andrew Dobson, *Keele University, England*
Denise Dudzinski, *Department of Bioethics and Humanities, University of Washington School of Medicine*
Joseph J. Fins, *Division of Medical Ethics, Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York*
Leonard M. Fleck, *Center for Ethics and Humanities, Michigan State University*
Paul J. Ford, *Department of Bioethics, Cleveland Clinic*
James Giordano, *Georgetown University Medical Center*
John Harris, *University of Manchester, England*
Gerrit K. Kimsma, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*
Eric M. Meslin, *Indiana University Center for Bioethics, Indianapolis*
Christine Mitchell, *Center for Bioethics, Harvard Medical School*
Jonathan D. Moreno, *Center for Bioethics, University of Pennsylvania School of Medicine, Philadelphia*
Rosamond Rhodes, *Mount Sinai School of Medicine, New York*
Pablo Rodriguez del Pozo, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University in Qatar*
Doris Schroeder, *Centre for Professional Ethics, University of Central Lancashire, England*
Robyn Shapiro, *Center for the Study of Bioethics, Medical College of Wisconsin*
Pavel Tichtchenko, *Institute of Philosophy, Academy of Science, Moscow, Russia*
Griffin Trotter, *Center for Health Care Ethics, Saint Louis University*
Mark R. Wicclair, *University of Pittsburgh & West Virginia University*

The Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Groups: Connecting Bioethics Educators Around the World

The purpose of the Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Groups is to encourage people and institutions to work together on developing bioethics education in their countries. These focus groups invite others to share their information and develop mutual projects to further how bioethics is taught in universities, hospitals, and for the general public.

<https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/cambridge-quarterly-of-healthcare-ethics/cambridge-bioethics-education-working-groups>

CLINICAL NEUROETHICS ADVISORY BOARD

EDITOR

Thomasine Kushner, *University of California, Berkeley*
kushnertk@gmail.com

ASSOCIATE EDITOR

James Giordano, *Georgetown University Medical Center*

EDITORIAL BOARD

Yves Agid, *Institut du Cerveau et de la Moelle Épineière, France*
Jennifer Chandler, *University of Ottawa, Canada*
Markus Christen, *University of Zurich, Switzerland*
Joseph J. Fins, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York*
Paul J. Ford, *Department of Bioethics, Cleveland Clinic*
Grant Gillett, *University of Otago Medical School, New Zealand*
John Harris, *University of Manchester, England*
Stephen Hauser, *University of California, San Francisco*
Judy Illes, *The University of British Columbia, Canada*
Philipp Kellmeyer, *University of Freiburg Medical Center, Germany*
Catherine Madison, *California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*
Christine Mitchell, *Harvard Medical School*
Erik Parens, *The Hastings Center, Garrison, New York*
John R. Shook, *University at Buffalo*
Alan Yee, *California Pacific Medical Center*

Neuroethics Network/Cambridge Consortium for Bioethics Education/International Bioethics Retreat

<http://www.icmbioethics.com/cambridge-home.html>

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics

Volume 28, Number 1, January 2019

CONTENTS

Contributors 1

Special Section: Genome Editing: Biomedical and Ethical Perspectives

Guest Editors: VOJIN RAKIĆ AND ARTHUR CAPLAN

Introduction: The Ethical Frontiers of Gene Editing

ARTHUR CAPLAN AND VOJIN RAKIĆ 4

Why We Should Defend Gene Editing as Eugenics

NICHOLAS AGAR 9

Commentary: From Liberal Eugenics to Political Biology

NATHAN EMMERICH AND BERT GORDIJN 20

Gene Doping—in Animals? Ethical Issues at the Intersection
of Animal Use, Gene Editing, and Sports Ethics

CAROLYN P. NEUHAUS AND BRENDAN PARENT 26

Commentary: Setting the Bar Higher

NICOLAS DELON 40

Genome Editing for Involuntary Moral Enhancement

VOJIN RAKIĆ 46

Commentary: The Implementation Ethics of Moral Enhancement

NICHOLAS AGAR 55

Can the Thought of Teilhard de Chardin Carry Us Past Current
Contentious Discussions of Gene Editing Technologies?

MÁRIA ŠULEKOVÁ AND KEVIN T. FITZGERALD 62

Regulating Genome Editing: For an Enlightened Democratic
Governance

GIULIA CAVALIERE, KATRIEN DEVOLDER, AND
ALBERTO GIUBILINI 76

Commentary: Enlightened Democracy in Practice

OLIVER FEENEY 89

Gene Drives and Genome Modification in Nonhuman
Animals: A Concern for Informed Consent?

JOANNA SMOLENSKI 93

Let Us Assume That Gene Editing Is Safe—The Role
of Safety Arguments in the Gene Editing Debate

SØREN HOLM 100

Contents continued

Contents continued

A Defense of Limited Regulation of Human Genetic
Therapies
JAMES J. HUGHES 112

Symposium on Ethics Dumping

Editorial: Looking for Justice from the Health Industry
DORIS SCHROEDER AND JULIE COOK 121

Continued Access to Investigational Medicinal Products
for Clinical Trial Participants—An Industry Approach
ARIELLA KELMAN, ANNA KANG, AND BRIAN CRAWFORD 124

Healthy Volunteers for Clinical Trials in Resource-Poor Settings:
National Registries Can Address Ethical and Safety Concerns
FRANCOIS BOMPART 134

Involving Patients in Research? Responsible Research and
Innovation in Small- and Medium-Sized European
Health care Enterprises
KALYPSO IORDANOU 144

Working Together to Make the World a Healthier Place:
Desiderata for the Pharmaceutical Industry
KLAUS M. LEISINGER AND KATE CHATFIELD 153

Departments and Columns

Responses and Dialogue
John Harris: An Appreciation
JOHN J. PARIS, SJ 165

Research Ethics
“Go Ask Alice”: The Case for Researching Schedule I Drugs
KENNETH V. ISERSON 168

Bioethics and Information Technology
Advance Directives and Code Status Information Exchange:
A Consensus Proposal for a Minimum Set of Attributes
CHRISTOPH U. LEHMANN, CAROLYN PETERSEN, HARESH BHATIA,
ETA S. BERNER, AND KENNETH W. GOODMAN 178

CQ Review
The Future of Bioethics; International Dialogues
Edited by Akira Akabayashi
REVIEWED BY SHUMA YOSHIDA AND SHINTARO TAMATE 186

EDITORIAL OFFICE: Editorial correspondence, including manuscript submission, should be addressed to Thomasine Kushner, PhD. To facilitate review, please submit manuscripts as electronic copy, preferably in MS Word, to kushnertk@gmail.com. Books for review should be sent to Greg Loeben, 2532 N. 4th Street, #442 Flagstaff, AZ 86004. Books for review on neuroethics should be sent to Thomasine Kushner, 1001 Bridgeway #A1, Sausalito, CA 94965.

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION: *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* (ISSN 0963-1801) is published quarterly, in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006/ Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK. Annual subscription rates for volume 28 (2019) USA, Canada, and Mexico/Elsewhere: Institutional rates, print and online: \$670/£417; online only: \$532/£331; print only: \$665/£415. Individual rates, print only: \$139/£84. Single part: \$191/£119. Students and retirees: \$115/£72. American Society for Bioethics and Humanities members: \$96/£57. Prices include postage. Subscription offices: One Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA; outside the USA, Canada, and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK. Claims for missing issues should be made immediately after receipt of the next issue. *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* and other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics is a partner journal of the American Society for Bioethics and Humanities.

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes in the USA, Canada, and Mexico to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA. Send address changes elsewhere to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK.

© Cambridge University Press 2018. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics is indexed in Index Medicus and in the ASSIA, ISI, MEDLINE, Philosopher's Index, and Proquest databases.

Permission to copy (for users in the USA) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: info@copyright.com.