

European Constitutional Law Review

2019 VOLUME 15 ISSUE 2

Contributions by

Jure Vidmar, Araceli Turmo, Jorrit J. Rijpma, Patricia Popelier, Michał Krajewski, Cedric Jenart & Mathieu Leloup, Jussi Jaakkola, Eleni Frantziou, Giacomo DelleDonne, Aurelia Colombi Ciacchi

Subjects

BREXIT: unilateral revocation of the article 50 notification in *Wightman*. EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS: procedural rationality review after *Animal Defenders*; and alternative dispute resolution in the context of the domestic separation of powers. FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS IN THE EUROPEAN UNION: horizontal applicability of the Charter; and recognition of same-sex marriage as a matter of free movement. EUROPEAN UNION JUDICIAL PROCEDURE: highest national courts' duty to refer; and participation of the parties in annulment proceedings. ITALY: the Constitutional Court's decision on the 4% threshold for European elections. FRANCE: asylum, solidarity between states and *fraternité*. DEMOCRACY AND THE ECONOMIC CONSTITUTION: market rights and political citizenship.



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

EuConst
2019/2

BOARD OF EDITORS

Leonard F.M. Besselink, co-editor-in-chief
University of Amsterdam

Monica Claes, co-editor-in-chief
Maastricht University

Jan-Herman Reestman, co-editor-in-chief
University of Amsterdam

W.T. Eijbouts
University of Milan

John W. Sap
Open Universiteit and VU Amsterdam

Thomas Beukers
European University Institute, Florence

Jan Komárek
University of Copenhagen

Gerhard van der Schyff
University of Tilburg

Mattias Wendel
University of Bielefeld

Aida Torres Pérez
Universitat Pompeu Fabra, Barcelona

François-Xavier Millet
Court of Justice of the European Union

Thomas A.J.A. Vandamme
University of Amsterdam

Matteo Bonelli
University of Milan

Bastian Michel, managing editor
University of Amsterdam

Andrew Faughman, language editor
Amsterdam

Special language advisers
Jeremy B. Bierbach
Amsterdam

Russell E.M. Lawson
Oxford

BOARD OF ADVISERS

Andreas Auer
Professor emeritus of public law, Universities of
Zurich and Geneva

Marta Cartabia
Vice-president of the Italian Constitutional Court
and Professor of constitutional law, Università
Milano-Bicocca

Paul Craig
Professor of English law, St. John's College, Oxford

Gráinne de Búrca
Professor of law, New York University School of Law

Bruno De Witte
Professor of European Union law, Maastricht
University, and part-time professor, European
University Institute, Florence

Olivier Duhamel
University Professor, IEP (Sciences Po), Paris

Spyridon Flogaitis
Professor of administrative law, University of Athens

Jörg Gerkrath
Professor of European law, University of
Luxembourg

P.J.G. Kapteyn
Former judge at the Court of Justice

Rick Lawson
Professor of European law, Leiden University

Koen Lenaerts
President of the Court of Justice and Professor of
European law, KU Leuven

Ingolf Pernice
Professor of public law and of international and
European law, Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin

Jit Peters
Professor emeritus of public law, University of
Amsterdam

Lucas Prakke
Professor emeritus of comparative constitutional
law, University of Amsterdam

Sacha Prechal
Judge at the Court of Justice and Professor of
international and European institutional law,
Utrecht University

W.H. Roobol
Professor emeritus of European history, University
of Amsterdam

Dominique Rousseau
Professor of public law, Université Paris I
Panthéon-Sorbonne

Wojciech Sadurski
Professor in jurisprudence, University of Sydney and
professor extraordinary, University of Warsaw

András Sajó
University Professor, Central European University,
Budapest

Mirosław Wyrzykowski
Professor of constitutional law, University of
Warsaw

Peter G. Xuereb
Judge at the Court of Justice and
Professor of European and comparative law,
University of Malta

Jiří Zemánek
Judge at the Czech Constitutional Court and
Professor of European Union law, Charles
University, Prague

EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW REVIEW

2019 VOLUME 15 ISSUE 2

CONTENTS

Editorial

FRATERNITÉ – Editorial – 183

Articles

Jussi JAAKKOLA – Enhancing Political Representation Through the European Economic Constitution? Regressive Politics of Democratic Inclusion – 194

Michał KRAJEWSKI – The Many-faced Court: The Value of Participation in Annulment Proceedings – 220

Cedric JENART and Mathieu LELOUP – Separation of Powers and Alternative Dispute Resolution before the European Court of Human Rights – 247

Patricia POPELIER – Procedural Rationality Review after *Animal Defenders International*: A Constructively Critical Approach – 272

Case Notes

Aurelia COLOMBI CIACCHI – The Direct Horizontal Effect of EU Fundamental Rights – ECJ 17 April 2018, Case C-414/16, *Vera Egenberger v Evangelisches Werk für Diakonie und Entwicklung e.V.* and ECJ 11 September 2018, Case C-68/17, *IR v JQ* – 294

Eleni FRANTZIOU – (Most of) the Charter of Fundamental Rights is Horizontally Applicable – ECJ 6 November 2018, Joined Cases C-569/16 and C-570/16, *Bauer et al* – 306

Jorrit J. RIJPMAN – You Gotta Let Love Move – ECJ 5 June 2018, Case C-673/16, *Coman, Hamilton, Accept v Inspectoratul General pentru Imigrări*. – 324

Araceli TURMO – A Dialogue of Unequals - The European Court of Justice Reasserts National Courts' Obligations under Article 267(3) TFEU – ECJ 4 October 2018, Case C-416/17, *Commission v France* – 340

Jure VIDMAR – Unilateral Revocability in *Wightman*: Fixing Article 50 with Constitutional Tools – ECJ 10 December 2018, Case C-621/18, *Andy Wightman and Others v Secretary of State for Exiting the European Union* – 359

Giacomo DELLEDONNE – 'A Goal that Applies to the European Parliament No Differently From How It Applies to National Parliaments': The Italian Constitutional Court Vindicates the 4% Threshold for European Elections – Italian Constitutional Court, Judgment of 25 October 2018 no. 239/2018 – 376

EDITORIAL POLICY & GUIDELINES FOR CONTRIBUTORS

The *European Constitutional Law Review* (EuConst) follows the classical approach of constitutionalism, to discuss EU law's developments as well as comparative public law of European states, political and constitutional theory and history. The journal is a platform for scholarly discussion of European constitutional events and evolution. It is open to contributions in this field from any country in the world and from any discipline. These contributions should satisfy as to substance, apart from the common scholarly criteria, two specific conditions, to a) have a distinctly European relevance and b) include a reference to and discussion of legal aspects involved.

Submitting an article, case note or book review

The editors of the *European Constitutional Law Review* are happy to receive contributions on relevant subjects at any time. Before submitting, authors should ensure that their contribution falls within the scope of EuConst as stated above.

Manuscripts should be sent in Microsoft Word format (and not, specifically, in PDF format) to enable editing, anonymisation and comments. EuConst has an exclusive submission policy. Authors are required to state clearly, when submitting, that their contribution is not under consideration elsewhere.

Articles and case notes can be sent by email to euconst@uva.nl. Authors of article contributions are asked to aim for a length of no more than 10,000 words (including footnotes). Case notes should not exceed 5,000 words. Upon request, the editors will consider whether relaxation of these limits is justified.

Book reviews can be sent to our book review editors Nik de Boer, Vestert Borger and Paul Post at euconst-books@uva.nl. Book reviews should not exceed 5,000 words. For more information on the EuConst book review section, see cambridge.org/euconst under Information – Book review info.

All submissions must be written in good English. Authors who are uncertain whether their English is of sufficient quality, should have their manuscript reviewed and edited by a native speaker with a background in law. Accepted contributions will be edited, linguistically and substantively, subject to authors' approval. Authors should ensure that their submissions conform to the house style. A style sheet is available on the journal website, cambridge.org/euconst under Information – Instructions for contributors.

Special sections

Sets of several articles stemming from a research project or conference can be published as a special section of the journal. Special sections are published under full responsibility of the editorial board and each article to be included is assessed on its own merits through the usual peer review process. Proposals for special sections can be sent to euconst@uva.nl.

Copyright, licence to publish and open access policy

Contributors retain copyright. By submitting to EuConst, authors agree that upon acceptance of their contribution they will grant an exclusive licence to publish by signing and returning the appropriate Licence Form. Authors can make their contributions available through academic repositories. For more information, including terms and conditions of publication and authors' rights of reuse, see cambridge.org/euconst under Information – Grant of licence.



The *European Constitutional Law Review* is edited at the G.K. VAN HOGENDORP CENTRE FOR EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL STUDIES, a Jean Monnet centre of excellence at the University of Amsterdam.