

**STUDIES IN
CHURCH HISTORY**

VOLUME 43

**DISCIPLINE
AND DIVERSITY**

**EDITED BY KATE COOPER
and JEREMY GREGORY**

**For the Ecclesiastical History Society
BOYDELL & BREWER**

STUDIES IN CHURCH HISTORY

Volume 43

Discipline and Diversity

Edited by KATE COOPER
and JEREMY GREGORY

The tension between discipline and diversity is perennial within the history of Christianity, and this volume explores the variety of strategies across that history for reconciling these apparently polar tendencies.

Ranging in period from the early Church to contemporary British and global Christianity, these essays discover both contrasts and continuities in how Christian communities have structured the relationship between those in authority responsible for the pursuit of Christian unity, and those 'on the ground' whose often centrifugal energies are both the source of Christian vitality and of the Church's ability to engage creatively with pastoral reality.

Topics covered comprise theology and high politics on the one hand and 'grass-roots' realities on the other, from definitions of heresy, the Inquisition, and monastic discipline to the issues of canon law, marriage, and religious attitudes to domestic violence.

Central, recurring questions are explored, including: how were orthodoxy, conformity and discipline defined and enforced? What role did written texts play in imposing or subverting the dominant order? What were the tensions between the needs of the Church and the needs of the state? How successful were attempts to stifle the impulses of diversity, and what did it take for these impulses to be perceived as divinely inspired?

Highlighting as they do indirect as well as direct means of imposing discipline – through, for

(continued on back flap)

DISCIPLINE AND DIVERSITY

DISCIPLINE AND DIVERSITY

PAPERS READ AT
THE 2005 SUMMER MEETING AND
THE 2006 WINTER MEETING OF
THE ECCLESIASTICAL HISTORY SOCIETY

EDITED BY

KATE COOPER

AND

JEREMY GREGORY

PUBLISHED FOR
THE ECCLESIASTICAL HISTORY SOCIETY
BY
THE BOYDELL PRESS

2007

© Ecclesiastical History Society 2007

All Rights Reserved. Except as permitted under current legislation no part of this work may be photocopied, stored in a retrieval system, published, performed in public, adapted, broadcast, transmitted, recorded or reproduced in any form or by any means, without the prior permission of the copyright owner

First published 2007

A publication of the Ecclesiastical History Society
in association with The Boydell Press
an imprint of Boydell & Brewer Ltd
PO Box 9, Woodbridge, Suffolk IP12 3DF, UK
and of Boydell & Brewer Inc.
668 Mt Hope Avenue, Rochester, NY 14620, USA
website: www.boydellandbrewer.com

ISBN 978-0-9546809-3-0

ISSN 0424-2084

A CiP catalogue record for this book is available
from the British Library

Details of previous volumes are available from Boydell & Brewer Ltd

This book is printed on acid-free paper

Typeset by Pru Harrison, Hacheston, Suffolk
Printed in Great Britain by
Antony Rowe Ltd, Chippenham, Wiltshire

CONTENTS

Preface	ix
List of Contributors	xi
List of Abbreviations	xv
Introduction	xvii
Enforcing Orthodoxy in Byzantium AVERIL CAMERON	I
An Exegesis of Conformity: Textual Subversion of Subversive Texts M. C. STEENBERG	25
Hippolytus and the Cabbage Question: beyond Acceptable Discipline and Diversity CHRISTINE TREVETT	36
The Canons of Antioch C. W. B. STEPHENS	46
Imperial Law or Councils of the Church? Theodosius I and the Imposition of Doctrinal Uniformity E. D. HUNT	57
Patristic Divergences about the Image of God in Man STUART GEORGE HALL	69
Rod, Line and Net: Augustine on the Limits of Diversity GILLIAN CLARK	80
Council Proceedings and Juridical Process: the Cases of Aquileia (AD 381) and Ephesus (AD 431) THOMAS GRAUMANN	100
'Ad sedem episcopalem reddantur': Bishops, Monks, and Monasteries in the Diocese of Worcester in the Eighth Century MARTIN RYAN	114

CONTENTS

Taming the Muse: Monastic Discipline and Christian Poetry in Hermann of Reichenau's <i>On the Eight Principal Vices</i> HANNAH WILLIAMS	130
Varieties of Monastic Discipline in Southern Italy during the Eleventh and Twelfth Centuries G. A. LOUD	144
Kings, Bishops and Incest: Extension and Subversion of the Ecclesiastical Marriage Jurisdiction around 1100 CHRISTOF ROLKER	159
Discipline and the <i>Rule of Basil</i> in Walter Daniel's <i>Life of Ailred of Rievaulx</i> MICHELE MOATT	169
'Tempering the wind . . .': Moderation and Discretion in Late Twelfth-Century Papal Decretals ANNE J. DUGGAN	180
'Danger, Stupidity, and Infidelity': Magic and Discipline in John Bromyard's <i>Summa for Preachers</i> CATHERINE RIDER	191
Discipline and Diversity in the Medieval English Sunday DIANA WOOD	202
Mary and the Middle Ages: From Diversity to Discipline MIRI RUBIN	212
The Dangers of Diversity: Heresy and Authority in the 1405 Case of John Edward IAN FORREST	230
Defining Heresies: Catholic Heresiologies, 1520–50 DAVID BAGCHI	241
In Defence of Magisterial Reformation: Martin Bucer's Writings against the Spiritualists, 1535 PHILIP BROADHEAD	252
Religious Exiles and the Tudor State PETER MARSHALL	263
Thomas Walbot: the Last 'Freewiller' in Elizabethan England? BRETT USHER	285

CONTENTS

Disciplined Disobedience? Women and the Survival of Catholicism in the North York Moors in the Reign of Elizabeth I EMMA WATSON	295
Discipline and Domestic Violence in Edinburgh, 1560–1625 MELISSA HOLLANDER	307
Literature and Church Discipline in Early Modern England NIGEL SMITH	317
‘Contrarie to the Directorie’: Presbyterians and People in Lancashire, 1646–53 ALEX CRAVEN	331
‘The clergy who affect to call themselves orthodox’: Thomas Secker and the Defence of Anglican Orthodoxy, 1758–68 ROBERT G. INGRAM	342
Disciplining Diversity: the Roman Inquisition and Social Control in Malta, 1743–98 FRANS CIAPPARA	354
Charles Haddon Spurgeon, the Pastors’ College and the Downgrade Controversy IAN RANDALL	366
Discipline and Comprehensiveness: the Church of England and Prayer Book Revision in the 1920s JOHN G. MAIDEN	377
Discipline in Dispute: the Origins and Early History of the Methodist Sacramental Fellowship MARTIN WELLINGS	388
‘A Church without discipline is no Church at all’: Discipline and Diversity in Nineteenth- and Twentieth-Century Anglicanism FRANCES KNIGHT	399
The Anglican Experience of Authority STEPHEN SYKES	419

IN MEMORY OF
MICHAEL KENNEDY