

---

## REVIEWS

---

FOUNDATIONS OF A PLANNED ECONOMY, 1926–1929, vol. 3, parts 1 and 2.  
By Edward Hallett Carr. A HISTORY OF SOVIET RUSSIA. New York:  
Macmillan, 1976. Part 1: x, 313 pp. Part 2: 330 pp. (pp. 315–644). \$17.50, each  
volume.

Scholarly landmarks, like cathedrals, often take years to be completed. Edward Hallett Carr, having begun work in the 1920s on his historical analysis of Germany and Russia, here continues putting stones in place for his great edifice, *A History of Soviet Russia*, the first volume of which appeared in 1951. The work under review covers the period 1926–29 and focuses on foreign relations. Volumes 1 and 2 of *Foundations of a Planned Economy, 1926–1929* dealt in great detail with domestic matters. These two parts of volume 3 review, respectively, Soviet relations with the capitalist world and developments within the Communist parties of seven capitalist countries.

The main features of Soviet foreign relations in the late 1920s are well known, and Professor Carr finds no need to propose major corrections to our interpretation of these events. What does emerge, however, from an immense amount of intricate detail, is a vivid sense of the fear and feeling of external insecurity that colored the environment shaping Soviet decisions after 1927. With hindsight it is easy to recognize the grim atmosphere that spread over Europe with Hitler's coming to power in 1932, and thus to assume that international affairs were relatively placid until then. Whatever the case may have been in London and Washington, this was not the situation in Moscow. Soviet authorities were deeply alarmed by the breaking off of diplomatic relations with the United Kingdom in May 1927. Together with other developments in 1928 and 1929, this clearly served to instill a sense of crisis in Bolshevik minds. The drive against the peasants that began tentatively with the use of the "Ural-Siberian method" in 1928 and spread to the whole country in November 1929 was at bottom a domestic confrontation. It nevertheless reflected in part a conviction within the party that desperate measures were necessary at home in response to gathering hostility abroad.

Another impression that comes from reading these two volumes concerns the persistent ineptness of Comintern approaches to the West. Again, hindsight makes the choice among alternative policies seem deceptively obvious, and one must acknowledge the analytic plausibility of several policy directions that were competing for acceptance in Comintern circles. There was nevertheless a harsh and divisive thrust to Moscow's pressure on the Comintern and all foreign Communist parties that shows up in chapter after chapter of these volumes. In reciprocal reaction, the labor movement, major political parties, and liberal public opinion in the West responded with growing disillusionment as hopes for a "brave new world" were undermined.

All libraries and all serious students of Soviet history will want to have these volumes. If the eleven previous parts of Carr's *History of Soviet Russia* form the nave and transepts of an intellectual cathedral, these next two parts clearly begin the tower. Professor R. W. Davies collaborated in preparing volume 1 of *Foundations of a Planned Economy*, and since much Soviet history remains to be examined, perhaps Professor Carr, Professor Davies, or others will continue erecting the structure. In any case, it is already a magnificent accomplishment, standing out as a landmark in Western scholarship.

HOLLAND HUNTER  
*Haverford College*