

Contents

List of Tables and Figures vii

Acknowledgements viii

-
- 1 **Evidence in Times of Crisis** 1
 - 1.1 The Status of Evidence in Evidence-Based Medicine 3
 - 1.2 Organization of Chapters 5
 - 2 **Narrative Rationality and the Logic of Good Reasons** 8
 - 2.1 The Narrative Paradigm: Basic Tenets 8
 - 2.2 Narrative Paradigm vs Rational World Paradigm 11
 - 2.3 Narrative Probability, Narrative Fidelity and the Logic of Good Reasons 14
 - 2.3.1 Narrative Probability (Coherence) 15
 - 2.3.2 Narrative Fidelity 23
 - 3 **Whose Evidence? What Rationality? The Face Mask Controversy** 28
 - 3.1 Structural and Material (In)coherence in Expert Narratives 28
 - 3.2 Transcendental Values, Narrative Accrual and Narrative Identification 35
 - 3.2.1 The Logic of Good Reasons, Narrative Accrual and Identification: Public Safety and Structural Racism 36
 - 3.2.2 Good Reasons, Precarious Manhood and Homophobia 40
 - 3.3 Beyond Precariousness: Personal Freedom vs Social Responsibility 42
 - 4 **Whose Lives? What Values? Herd Immunity, Lockdowns and Social/Physical Distancing** 45
 - 4.1 Structural/Material (In)coherence or Science vs Values in the Great Barrington and John Snow Declarations 47
 - 4.2 Health, the Economy and the State: Resonance and Lived Experience 53
 - 4.3 Transcendental Values and Conceptions of Freedom 56
 - 4.4 Public Health Recommendations and the Values and Principles of Evidence-based Policy Making 59
 - 5 **The Rational World Paradigm, the Narrative Paradigm and the Politics of Pharmaceutical Interventions** 61
 - 5.1 Structural and Material (In)coherence: Science and Public Policy under Pressure 62
 - 5.2 Characterological Coherence and Public Confidence in Vaccines 66
 - 5.3 Transcendental Values and Conceptions of Freedom 69
 - 5.4 Pure Bodies, Microchips and Genetically Modified Organisms 73
 - 5.5 Resonance, Lived Experience and Trust 77
 - 6 **Objectivist vs Praxial Knowledge: Towards a Model of Situated Epistemologies and Narrative Identification** 81

6.1 Limitations of Fisher's Narrative
Paradigm 82

6.2 Revisiting and Extending the
Narrative Paradigm 85

6.3 Narrative Identification in the Age
of Fragmented Narratives 88

6.4 A Final Note on Critical Appraisal in
the EBM Model 90

References 92

Index 103