

Volume 112 ■ Issue 1 ■ January 2018

ISSN 0002-9300

AJIL

American Journal of International Law

INSIDE THIS ISSUE

- Customary International Law:
A Third World Perspective
B. S. Chimni
- Editorial Comment:
Multilateralism's Life Cycle
Harlan Grant Cohen
- Notes and Comments:
Behavioral Aspects of the International Law
of Global Public Goods and Common Pool
Resources
Anne van Aaken



American Society
of International Law

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

Vol. 112

January 2018

No. 1

CONTENTS

PAGE

Customary International Law: A Third World Perspective	<i>B. S. Chimni</i>	1
<p>The article offers an alternative account of the evolution, formation, and function of customary international law (CIL) from a third world perspective. It argues that there is an intimate link between the rise, consolidation, and expansion of capitalism in Europe since the nineteenth century and the development of CIL that is concealed by the supposed distinction between “formal” and “material” sources of CIL. In fact, both “traditional” and “modern” CIL sustain the short-term and systemic interests of global capitalism. It proposes a “postmodern” conception of CIL that would contribute to the global common good.</p>		
Editorial Comment		
Multilateralism’s Life Cycle	<i>Harlan Grant Cohen</i>	47
Notes and Comments		
Behavioral Aspects of the International Law of Global Public Goods and Common Pool Resources	<i>Anne van Aaken</i>	67
International Decisions	<i>Edited by Ingrid Wuerth</i>	
<i>Prime Minister v. Parliament of Catalonia</i> (Asier Garrido-Muñoz)		80
<p>Spanish Constitutional Court decision on Catalan independence</p>		
<i>Ghana v. Ivory Coast</i> (Nuwan Peiris)		88
<p>Judgement by a Special Chamber of the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea concerning maritime boundary delimitation</p>		
Contemporary Practice of the United States Relating to International Law	<i>Edited by Jean Galbraith</i>	
Tensions Rise Between the United States and North Korea		95
United States Lifts Economic Sanctions on Sudan		100
United States Imposes Broad Economic Sanctions on Venezuela After Constitutional Crisis		103
United States Gives Notice of Withdrawal from UNESCO, Citing Anti-Israel Bias		107
Presidential Proclamation Indefinitely Restricting Entry of Individuals from Designated Countries Is Fully Implemented Amid Ongoing Legal Challenges		109

U.S. District Court Convicts Mohammad Jabbateh of Perjury and Immigration Fraud for Concealing His Role as Former Liberian Warlord “Jungle Jabbah”	118
President Trump Refuses to Recertify Iran Nuclear Deal, But No Sanctions Are Reimposed on Iran	120
Recent Books on International Law	
Book Reviews	
Alvarez, José E. <i>The Impact of International Organizations on International Law</i> (Ian Johnstone)	126
Shaw, Malcolm N. <i>Rosenne’s Law and Practice of the International Court 1920–2015</i> ; Thirlway, Hugh. <i>The International Court of Justice</i> (Stephen M. Schwebel)	133
Priemel, Kim Christian. <i>The Betrayal: The Nuremberg Trials and German Divergence</i> (Jochen A. Frowein)	134
Marceau, Gabrielle (ed.). <i>A History of Law and Lawyers in the GATT/WTO</i> (Meredith Kolsky Lewis)	136
Bergsmo, Morten, Cheah Wui Ling and Yi Ping (eds.). <i>Historical Origins of International Criminal Law: Volume 1</i> ; Bergsmo, Morten, Cheah Wui Ling and Yi Ping (eds.). <i>Historical Origins of International Criminal Law: Volume 2</i> ; Bergsmo, Morten, Cheah Wui Ling, Song Tianying and Yi Ping (eds.). <i>Historical Origins of International Criminal Law: Volume 3</i> ; Bergsmo, Morten, Cheah Wui Ling, Song Tianying and Yi Ping (eds.). <i>Historical Origins of International Criminal Law: Volume 4</i> ; Bergsmo, Morten, Klaus Rackwitz and Song Tianying (eds.). <i>Historical Origins of International Criminal Law: Volume 5</i> (Beth Van Schaack)	142
Books Received	147
International Legal Materials , Contents, Vol. 56, No. 6	150

BOARD OF EDITORS

Editors in Chief

JOSÉ ENRIQUE ALVAREZ
New York University School of Law

BENEDICT KINGSBURY
New York University School of Law

DAPO AKANDE
Oxford University
KAREN J. ALTER
Northwestern University
ANTONY ANGHIE
National University of Singapore
EYAL BENVENISTI
Cambridge University
LAURENCE BOISSON DE CHAZOURNES
University of Geneva School of Law
CURTIS A. BRADLEY
Duke University School of Law
CHRISTOPHER BRUMMER
Georgetown University Law Center
BHUPINDER SINGH CHIMNI
Jawaharlal Nehru University
HARLAN COHEN
University of Georgia School of Law
GRÁINNE DE BÚRCA
New York University School of Law
JAMES THUO GATHII
Loyola University Chicago School of Law
TOM GINSBURG
University of Chicago Law School
JACK GOLDSMITH
Harvard Law School
MONICA HAKIMI
University of Michigan Law School

LAURENCE R. HELFER
Duke University School of Law
ALEXANDRA HUNEEUS
University of Wisconsin Law School
KAREN KNOP
University of Toronto Faculty of Law
KATERINA LINOS
Univ. of California, Berkeley School of Law
DONALD M. McRAE
University of Ottawa Faculty of Law
CATHERINE POWELL
Fordham Law School
KAL RAUSTIALA
Univ. of California (UCLA) School of Law
NATALIE REID
Debevoise & Plimpton
HENRY J. RICHARDSON III
Temple University Beasley School of Law
ANNELISE RILES
Cornell Law School
ANTHEA ROBERTS
Australian National University
GREGORY SHAFFER
Univ. of California, Irvine School of Law
ALAN O. SYKES
Stanford Law School
INGRID WUERTH
Vanderbilt Law School

ex officio

LUCINDA LOW
MARK DAVID AGRAST
Honorary Editors

GEORGE H. ALDRICH
St. Michaels, Maryland
MAHNOUSH ARSANJANI
New Haven, Connecticut
RICHARD B. BILDER
University of Wisconsin Law School
CHARLES N. BROWER
The Hague, the Netherlands
EDITH BROWN WEISS
Georgetown University Law Center
THOMAS BUERGENTHAL
George Washington Univ. Law School
DAVID D. CARON
The Hague, the Netherlands
CHRISTINE M. CHINKIN
London School of Economics
JAMES R. CRAWFORD
The Hague, the Netherlands
JOHN R. CROOK
Potomac, Maryland
ANTHONY D'AMATO
Northwestern University School of Law
RICHARD FALK
University of California, Santa Barbara
TOM J. FARER
University of Denver
MICHAEL J. GLENNON
Fletcher School, Tufts University

ROSALYN HIGGINS
The Hague, the Netherlands
FREDERIC L. KIRGIS
Washington and Lee Univ. School of Law
CYNTHIA CRAWFORD LICHTENSTEIN
Boston College Law School
DAVID A. MARTIN
University of Virginia School of Law
MICHAEL J. MATHESON
George Washington Univ. Law School
THEODOR MERON
The Hague, the Netherlands
JOHN NORTON MOORE
University of Virginia School of Law
BERNARD H. OXMAN
University of Miami School of Law
W. MICHAEL REISMAN
Yale Law School
STEPHEN M. SCHWEBEL
South Woodstock, Vermont
DINAH SHELTON
George Washington Univ. Law School
DAVID P. STEWART
Georgetown University Law Center
PETER D. TROOBOFF
Covington & Burling LLP
RUTH WEDGWOOD
Johns Hopkins University

Senior Copyeditor
ERIN LOVALL

Cite-checker
CATHERINA VALENZUELA

Assistant to the Editors in Chief
RACHEL JONES

Submissions Editor 2017–18
SEBASTIAN DUTZ

Associate Submissions Editors 2017–18
SARAH COCO
NAHUEL MAISLEY
CLAIRE SCHUPMANN

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

The *American Journal of International Law (AJIL)* has been published quarterly since 1907. It features articles, editorials, notes, and comments by pre-eminent scholars on developments in international law and international relations. *AJIL* contains summaries and analyses of decisions by national and international courts and arbitral or other tribunals, and of contemporary U. S. practice in international law. Each issue lists recent publications in English and other languages, many of which are reviewed in depth. The *AJIL* is indispensable for all professionals working in international law, economics, trade, and foreign affairs.

It is the policy of the American Society of International Law not to take an official position, by resolution or otherwise, upon controversial questions. The views expressed in the articles, editorial comments, book reviews, and all other contributions to the *AJIL* are those of the individual authors and are not to be taken as representing the views of the Board of Editors or the Society.

THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

The American Society of International Law (ASIL) is a nonprofit, nonpartisan, educational membership organization founded in 1906 by U.S. Secretary of State Elihu Root and chartered by Congress in 1950. Headquartered in Washington, D.C., its mission is “to foster the study of international law and to promote the establishment and maintenance of international relations on the basis of law and justice.” ASIL holds Special Consultative Status with the Economic and Social Council of the United Nations and is a constituent society of the American Council of Learned Societies.

ASIL’s nearly four thousand members hail from more than one hundred nations with nearly 40 percent residing outside the United States. Its members include scholars, jurists, practitioners, government officials, leaders in international and nongovernmental organizations, students, and others interested in international law. Through its many publications, conferences, briefings, and educational events, ASIL seeks to serve the needs of its diverse membership and to advance understanding of international law among policymakers and the public.

ASIL is a volunteer-led organization governed by a sixty-member Executive Council elected by its membership. In partnership with the elected leadership, ASIL is led by an executive director and supported by a professional staff.

Become a member

asil.org/membership

Join one of the Society’s Partner Programs and receive complimentary ad space in *AJIL*

asil.org/financial-support/sponsors-and-institutional-supporters

Follow the Society on Twitter

twitter.com/asilorg

Like us on Facebook

facebook.com/AmericanSocietyofInternationalLaw

OFFICERS AND EXECUTIVE COUNCIL OF THE SOCIETY, 2016–2017

<i>President</i>	LUCINDA A. LOW
<i>President-Elect</i>	SEAN D. MURPHY
<i>Honorary President</i>	ROSEMARY BARKETT
<i>Vice Presidents</i>	CATHERINE M. AMIRFAR, EDWARD KWAKWA, SEAN D. MURPHY, KAL RAUSTIALA
<i>Executive Vice President and Executive Director</i>	MARK DAVID AGRAST
<i>Secretary</i>	JAMES A. R. NAFZIGER
<i>Treasurer</i>	NANCY L. PERKINS
<i>Assistant Treasurer</i>	RONALD J. BETTAUER

Past Presidents: JOSÉ E. ALVAREZ, CHARLES N. BROWER, EDITH BROWN WEISS, DAVID D. CARON, JAMES H. CARTER, LORI FISLER DAMROSCH, DONALD FRANCIS DONOVAN, LUCY REED, ARTHUR W. ROVINE, ANNE-MARIE SLAUGHTER, PETER D. TROOBOFF

Honorary Vice Presidents: LORI FISLER DAMROSCH, DONALD FRANCIS DONOVAN, DAVID D. CARON

Council Members: STANIMIR A. ALEXANDROV, KAREN J. ALTER, ANGELA M. BANKS, R. DOAK BISHOP, ANNA SPAIN BRADLEY, TODD F. BUCHWALD, DONALD EARL CHILDRESS III, SARAH H. CLEVELAND, OLUFEMI ELIAS, SUSAN D. FRANCK, CHIARA GEORGETTI, DAWN YAMANE HEWETT, SANDRA L. HODGKINSON, DUNCAN B. HOLLIS, MEG KINNEAR, SAIRA MOHAMED, BLANCA MONTEJO, VINCENT O. NMEHIELLE, JIDE NZELIBE, JAYA RAMJI-NOGALES, DAVID L. SLOSS, BETH VAN SCHAACK, CARLOS M. VÁZQUEZ, SAMUEL M. WITTEN

Councillors: DANIEL BETHLEHEM, JEFFREY L. BLEICH, HANNAH L. BUXBAUM, TAI-HENG CHENG, MARCELLA DAVID, JOAN E. DONOGHUE, JAMES T. GATHII, HAROLD HONGJU KOH, PETER MASON, ELISA MASSIMINO, M. MARGARET MCKEOWN, MARY MCLEOD, JOSEPH E. NEUHAUS, DANIEL M. PRICE, HÉLÈNE RUIZ-FABRI, LEILA NADYA SADAT, STEVEN M. SCHNEEBAUM, RICHARD H. STEINBERG, JANE E. STROMSETH, PETER TOMKA, JOEL P. TRACHTMAN, PAUL R. WILLIAMS, ADRIEN K. WING, NASSIB G. ZIADÉ

PHILANTHROPY AND THE SOCIETY

The American Society of International Law is grateful to its Patrons and the many members who contribute to the Annual Fund and the Endowment, to its Academic, Law Firm, and Publisher Partners, and to its Heritage Circle members who have included the Society in their estate plans. Patron-level donors and Heritage Circle members are acknowledged below. Annual gifts of \$500 and above and contributions from institutional partners are acknowledged in the Society's annual Year-in-Review for the year in which the gift was made.

LEADERSHIP PATRONS

This category recognizes sustained and extraordinary philanthropic support of the Society.

HOWARD M. HOLTZMANN*

CHARLES N. BROWER

PATRONS (2014–2018)

Ilihu Root Patron (\$50,000)

ANONYMOUS
DONALD K. ANTON
GARY B. BORN
DAVID D. CARON* AND SUSAN SPENCER
LORI FISLER DAMROSCH
DONALD FRANCIS DONOVAN AND
JENNIFER LAKE
LUCINDA A. LOW AND
DANIEL B. MAGRAW
LUCY F. REED
W. MICHAEL REISMAN AND
MAHNOUSH H. ARSANJANI
ARTHUR W. ROVINE

Cordell Hull Patron (\$25,000)

CATHERINE M. AMIRFAR
R. DOAK BISHOP

JAMES H. CARTER
TAI-HENG CHENG
ELI WHITNEY DEBEVOISE II
SUSAN L. KARAMANIAN
EDWARD G. KEHOE
JAMES G. LETTNER AND TRACY HIGGINS
ABBY COHEN SMUTNY

James Brown Scott Patron (\$15,000)

MARK D. AGRASST AND DAVID M. HOLLIS
JOSÉ E. ALVAREZ AND SUSAN DAMPLO
ANDREA K. BJORKLUND
CHARLES H. CAMP
DAVID COLSON
GLENN P. HENDRIX
JUDD KESSLER
BENEDICT KINGSBURY
CHARLOTTE KU

EDWARD KWAKWA
ALOYSIUS LLAMZON
STEPHEN C. MCCAFFREY
GABRIELLE KIRK MCDONALD
SEAN D. AND JULIE MURPHY
JOSEPH E. NEUHAUS
MARY ELLEN O'CONNELL
DANIEL M. PRICE
STEVEN M. SCHNEEBAUM
MORTIMER N.S. SELLERS
ANDRES RIGO SUREDA
JUDGE BRUNO E. SIMMA
BETH VAN SCHAACK
ADRIEN K. WING
MARCIA A. WISS

LEGACY PATRONS (TO 2014)

DOMINGO E. ACEVEDO
GERALD ARSEN
ARTHUR R. ALBRECHT
TEYMOUR A. ALIREZA*
GEORGE H. ALDRICH
DIANE MARIE AMANN
JAMES G. APPLE
FRANK A. BAUMAN*
MRS. RICHARD BAXTER*
DAVID J. BEDERMAN* AND
LORRE B. CUZZE
DANIEL L. BETHLEHEM
RICHARD B. BILDER
JOHN A. BOYD
JOHN BRISCOE
CHARLES N. BROWER
IAN BROWNLIE*
EDITH BROWN WEISS
LEE C. BUCHHEIT
THOMAS BUERGENTHAL
WILLIAM J. BUTLER
HUGO AND SUSANA CAMINOS
JAMES RICHARD CRAWFORD
JOHN R. CROOK
ANTHONY D'AMATO
ARTHUR H. DEAN*
SARAH WHITCRAFT DEFORD*
TIMOTHY L. DICKINSON

THOMAS A. DUBBS
EDWARD DUMBAULD*
RICHARD W. EDWARDS, JR.
ALONA E. EVANS*
BENJAMIN B. FERENCZ
DONALD FERENCZ
THOMAS M. FRANCK*
ALWYN V. FREEMAN*
JOHN KING GAMBLE
RONALD E.M. GOODMAN
CHRISTOPHER J. GREENWOOD
JOHN LAWRENCE HARGROVE
VICTORIA M. HARIRI*
OONA A. HATHAWAY
RITA E. HAUSER
JOHN N. HAZARD*
ALICE AND LOUIS* HENKIN
ROBERT E. HERZSTEIN*
ROSALYN HIGGINS
KEITH HIGGET*
HOWARD M. HOLTZMANN*
CHARLES A. HUNNICUTT
JOHN H. JACKSON*
ANDREW J. JACOVIDES
MARK R. JOELSON
RICHARD A. JOHNSON
KENNETH I. JUSTER
FREDERIC L. KIRGIS

JEFFREY LANG
SIR ILIHU LAUTERPACHT*
ROY S. LEE
JEREMY I. AND CANDACE C. LEVITT
CYNTHIA CRAWFORD
LICHTENSTEIN
RICHARD B. LILLICH* AND
GERDA HEIDEL*
A. VAUGHAN LOWE
ANDREAS F. LOWENFELD*
HOUSTON PUTNAM LOWRY
BRUNSON MACCHESNEY
ROBERT MACCRATE*
RONALD ST. JOHN MACDONALD*
D. STEPHEN MATHIAS
EDWARD WATSON MCWHINNEY*
ROBERT F. MEAGHER*
THEODOR MERON
HUSAM MESHAL
W. ROBERT MORGAN*
JAMES A.R. NAZIGER
VED P. NANDA
ANDRE NEWBURG
SHIGERU ODA
BERNARD H. OXMAN
JAN PAULSSON
NANCY L. PERKINS
HERMAN PHLEGER*

B. DONOVAN PICARD
SANG-MYON RHEE
DAVIS R. ROBINSON
WILLIAM D. ROGERS*
SEYMOUR J. RUBIN*
PHILIPPE J. SANDS
OSCAR SCHACHTER*
STEPHEN M. SCHWEBEL
ANNE-MARIE SLAUGHTER
EARL A. SNYDER*
BARBARA STARK
ERIC STEIN*
CHARLES W.T. STEPHENSON
JOHN R. STEVENSON*
DAVID P. STEWART
LAURENCE STORCH
ENRIQUE P. SYQUIA
GENEVIEVE EAGON TILLAR*
PETER D. TROOBOFF
DETLEV F. VAGTS*
CHARLES O. VERRILL, JR.
JILL MCCLANAHAN WATSON
RUTH WEDGWOOD
BURNS H. WESTON*
EDWIN D. WILLIAMSON
BASIL S. YANAKAKIS
NASSIB G. ZIADÉ

THE ASIL HERITAGE CIRCLE

Members who have advised the Society that they made provisions to include the Society in their estate plans.

ANONYMOUS (2)
ELIZABETH ANDERSEN
JAMES G. APPLE
FRANK A. BAUMAN*
CHARLES N. BROWER
JAMES H. CARTER

SARAH WHITCRAFT DEFORD*
MICHAEL AND MARY ANN FARLEY
THOMAS M. FRANCK*
CHRISTIAN A. HERTER, JR.*
CHIMENE KEITNER

CHARLOTTE KU
CYNTHIA CRAWFORD LICHTENSTEIN
H.C.L. MERILLAT*
SEAN D. AND JULIE MURPHY
MARY ELLEN O'CONNELL

OSCAR SCHACHTER*
STEPHEN SCHER
ERIC STEIN*
JOHN R. STEVENSON*
GENEVIEVE EAGON TILLAR*
RICHARD YOUNG*

* deceased

JOURNAL INFORMATION

AJIL is published in print and digitally by Cambridge University Press on behalf of the American Society of International Law. The journal publishes quarterly, in January, April, July, and October, and to reduce time between acceptance and publication, contributions may appear online as *FirstView* publications in advance of their scheduled publication in an issue. Discover the entire *AJIL* back archive at cambridge.org/ajil/issues.

Subscriptions

The electronic version of *AJIL* is available to all members of the American Society of International Law by login to the ASIL website www.asil.org. Print copies are also supplied to all members.

To subscribe as a non-member or recommend a subscription to your librarian go to cambridge.org/ajil.

Submission of Manuscripts

AJIL invites submission of manuscripts on international law subjects. *AJIL*'s coverage extends beyond public international law to closely related issues of global governance, transnational law, and national or sub-state law. It generally does not publish manuscripts focused on purely private or commercial law or on comparative or foreign law, including the internal law of the European Union. *AJIL* will not consider submissions whose content has been, or will be, published before it appears in this journal.

AJIL welcomes submissions for **Lead Articles**, and shorter **Current Developments** and **Notes & Comments** pieces via *AJIL*'s electronic submission website mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ajil.

Editorial Comments are written by members of the Board of Editors. Content for the **Contemporary Practice of the United States Relating to International Law** section of *AJIL* is generated by the editors of that section and outside submissions are not accepted. The **Recent Books on International Law** section contains book reviews that are solicited by invitation of the editor, Richard Bilder. *AJIL* strongly encourages authors and publishers to submit books for review in hard copy to: AJIL Book Review Office, 2223 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20008-2864, USA.

The **International Decisions** section, edited by Ingrid Wuerth, focuses on particularly significant decisions concerning important issues of (or developments in) international law. It consists of contributions that are mostly proposed to the editor by readers of the *AJIL*. Proposals for International Decisions should be sent to ingrid.wuerth@law.vanderbilt.edu.

AJIL Unbound, an online initiative to supplement *AJIL* by publishing short, original essays, periodically issues open calls for short contributions on specified topics.

AJIL is committed to publishing a diversity of authors, whether based in the United States or abroad, and to covering a wide range of subjects and approaches. Suggestions for topics for *AJIL* **symposia or Agora** should be sent to law.ajil.admin@nyu.edu.

All submissions must follow the *AJIL* Style Guide. Full instructions on how to prepare and submit your paper may be found here:
cambridge.org/ajil/afc

Claims and Address Updates

subscriptions_newyork@cambridge.org (in the USA, Canada and Mexico)

journals@cambridge.org (elsewhere)

Copyright and Permissions

cambridge.org/about-us/rights-permissions.

To Advertise in the Journal

ad_sales@cambridge.org

Abstracting and Indexing Services

cambridge.org/ajil/abstracting

For other ASIL Publications

www.asil.org

Proper Citation

AJIL shall be cited according to the following example:

112 *AJIL* 219 (2018)

ISSN: 0002-9300

E-ISSN: 2161-7953

© American Society of International Law