

FALL 1995

# Slavic Review

AMERICAN QUARTERLY OF RUSSIAN, EURASIAN AND  
EAST EUROPEAN STUDIES

## ARTICLES

- Diana Greene : *Gender and Genre in Pavlova's A Double Life*  
Thomas M. Barrett : *The Frontiers of the North Caucasus*  
Jonathan W. Daly : *Emergency Legislation in Late Imperial Russia*

## RESEARCH NOTES

- William Zimmerman : *Synoptic Thinking in Post-Soviet Russia*  
R. W. Davies, M. B. Tauger, & S. G. Wheatcroft : *Stalin, Grain Stocks  
and the Famine of 1932-1933*

## DISCUSSION

- Mark von Hagen : *Does Ukraine Have a History?*  
George G. Grabowicz : *Ukrainian Studies: Framing the Contexts*

## REPLIES

- Andreas Kappeler : *The German Perspective*  
Iaroslav Isaievych : *Ukrainian Studies*  
Serhii Plokhyy : *History of a "Non-Historical" Nation*  
Yuri Slezkine : *Our Nation State*

## EDITOR

ELLIOTT MOSSMAN

ASSOCIATE EDITOR, JEAN GURLEY

BOOKS EDITORS

BEN EKLOF, INDIANA UNIVERSITY

CATHERINE ALBRECHT, UNIVERSITY OF BALTIMORE

FILM EDITOR, SVETLANA BOYM, HARVARD UNIVERSITY

ASSISTANT EDITORS, BRONWYN GURLEY, ELENA COLER, AND RICHARD FROST

RESEARCH BIBLIOGRAPHER

TAMARA ORZHEKHOVSKY

## EDITORIAL BOARD

### *History*

Laura Engelstein, *Princeton University* • Boris Mironov, *Institute of Russian History, St. Petersburg* • Norman Naimark, *Stanford University* • Nancy Shields Kollmann, *Stanford University* • Ronald G. Suny, *University of Michigan* • Roman Szporluk, *Harvard University* • Gale Stokes, *Rice University* • Richard S. Wortman, *Columbia University*

### *Literature & Linguistics*

Caryl Emerson, *Princeton University* • Viacheslav Ivanov, *Moscow University & UCLA* • Gary Saul Morson, *Northwestern University* • Stephanie Sandler, *Amherst College*

### *Social Sciences*

Donna Bahry, *Vanderbilt University* • Mark R. Beissinger, *University of Wisconsin* • Ellen T. Comisso, *University of California, San Diego* • Mary McAuley, *Oxford University* • Brian D. Silver, *Michigan State University* • Katherine M. Verdery, *Johns Hopkins University*

The editors assume no responsibility for statements of fact or opinion made by contributors.

*Slavic Review* (formerly *The American Slavic and East European Review*) is published quarterly by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc., and is sent to all Association members. Members also receive the *AAASS Newsletter*. Membership is open to individuals interested in Slavic studies and study of the non-Slavic peoples of eastern Europe and Eurasia. Applications are accepted by the AAASS, 8 Story Street, Cambridge, MA 02138; (617) 495-0677.

Membership dues: salary \$10,000–19,999—\$25.00; \$20,000–29,999—\$35.00; \$30,000–39,999—\$45.00; \$40,000–49,999—\$55.00; \$50,000–59,999—\$65.00; \$60,000–69,999—\$75.00; \$70,000 or more—\$85.00. Joint members with one subscription to *Slavic Review*, add \$20.00 to dues of higher paid member. Dues for students or those with salaries under \$10,000 are \$25.00. Subscriptions without membership are \$50.00. Single current issues and back issues to subscribers are \$15.00; for members, \$10.00 each. For overseas postage, please add \$6.00; for Canada, add \$5.00. Correspondence regarding membership, subscriptions, changes of address or items for the *Newsletter* should be sent to the AAASS headquarters at Cambridge.

Articles, books for review, and correspondence concerning editorial matters or advertising should be sent to *Slavic Review*, 636 Williams Hall, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA 19104-6305. Building address is 36th & Spruce Streets. Telephone: 215-898-8096; FAX: 215-898-2998. E-mail: slavrev@sas.upenn.edu. Technical requirements for manuscript submissions may be found at the end of the advertising section.

Published by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc. Text set in Baskerville by Automated Composition Service, Inc., Lancaster, PA. Printed by Science Press, Ephrata, PA. Second-class postage paid at Boston, MA. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to AAASS, 8 Story Street, Cambridge, MA 02138.

Copyright © 1995 *Slavic Review*: ISSN 0037-6779 by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc. Permission to reproduce must generally be obtained from the Association's office. Copying is permitted in accordance with the fair use guidelines of the US Copyright Act of 1976. The Association permits the following additional educational uses without permission or payment of fees: academic libraries may place materials from *Slavic Review* on reserve (in multiple photocopied or electronically retrievable form) for students enrolled in specific courses; teachers may reproduce or have reproduced multiple copies (in photocopied or electronic form) for students in their courses. Those wishing to reproduce material from *Slavic Review* for any other purpose (general distribution, advertising or promotion, creating new collective works, resale, etc.) must obtain permission from the Association.

# Slavic Review

AMERICAN QUARTERLY OF RUSSIAN, EURASIAN AND  
EAST EUROPEAN STUDIES

---

VOLUME 54 NUMBER 3 • FALL 1995

<b>CONTRIBUTORS</b>	x
<b>FROM THE EDITOR</b>	xi
<b>ARTICLES</b>	
Gender and Genre in Pavlova's <i>A Double Life</i> DIANA GREENE	563
Lines of Uncertainty: The Frontiers of the North Caucasus THOMAS M. BARRETT	578
On the Significance of Emergency Legislation in Late Imperial Russia JONATHAN W. DALY	602
<b>RESEARCH NOTES</b>	
Synoptic Thinking and Political Culture in Post-Soviet Russia WILLIAM ZIMMERMAN	630
Stalin, Grain Stocks and the Famine of 1932–1933 R.W. DAVIES, M.B. TAUGER, S.G. WHEATCROFT	642
<b>DISCUSSION</b>	
Does Ukraine Have a History? MARK VON HAGEN	658
Ukrainian Studies: Framing the Contexts GEORGE G. GRABOWICZ	674

## REPLIES

- Ukrainian History from a German Perspective 691  
ANDREAS KAPPELER
- Ukrainian Studies—Exceptional or Merely Exemplary? 702  
IAROSLAV ISAIEVYCH
- The History of a “Non-Historical” Nation: Notes on the  
Nature and Current Problems of Ukrainian  
Historiography 709  
SERHII M. PLOKHY
- Can We Have Our Nation State and Eat It Too? 717  
YURI SLEZKINE

## FEATURED REVIEWS

- Andreas Kappeler, *Kleine Geschichte der Ukraine* (David A.  
Frick) 720
- George S.N. Luckyj, *Ukrainian Literature in the Twentieth  
Century: A Reader's Guide* (Mykola Riabchouk) 721
- G.M. Adibekov, *Kominform i poslevoennaia Evropa, 1947–1956  
gg.*; Bernd Bonwetsch, Genadii Bordiugov and Norman  
Naimark, eds., *SVAG. Upravlenie propagandy (informatsii) i  
S.I. Tiul'panov. 1945–1949. Sbornik dokumentov* (Hiroaki  
Kuromiya) 723
- Moshe Gammer, *Muslim Resistance to the Tsar: Shamil and the  
Conquest of Chechnia and Daghestan* (Thomas M. Barrett) 725
- Victor Erlich, *Modernism and Revolution: Russian Literature in  
Transition* (Clare Cavanagh) 726

## BOOK REVIEWS

- Roger Anderson and Paul Debreczeny, eds., *Russian Narrative  
and Visual Art: Varieties of Seeing* (John E. Bowlt) 729
- Árpád Kovács, *Personal'noe povestvovanie: Pushkin, Gogol',  
Dostoevskii* (Gunther Schaarschmidt) 730
- V.A. Keldysh, ed., *Sviz' vremen: Problemy preemstvennosti v  
russkoi literature kontsa XIX-nachala XX v.* (David Sloane) 731
- C.J.G. Turner, *Time and Temporal Structure in Chekhov* (Andrew  
R. Durkin) 732
- Avril Pyman, *A History of Russian Symbolism* (Michael Wachtel) 733

Diana Lewis Burgin, <i>Sophia Parnok: The Life and Work of Russia's Sappho</i> (Diane Nemeč Ignashev)	734
Irina Paperno and Joan Delaney Grossman, eds., <i>Creating Life: The Aesthetic Utopia of Russian Modernism</i> (Tim Scholl)	735
Carol Any, <i>Boris Eikhenbaum: Voices of a Russian Formalist</i> (Donna Orwin)	736
Matthias Freise, <i>Michail Bachtins philosophische Ästhetik der Literatur</i> (Sidney Monas)	737
M.M. Bakhtin, <i>Toward a Philosophy of the Act</i> , Vadim Liapunov, trans. and ed., Michael Holquist, ed.; David Shepherd, ed., <i>Bakhtin: Carnival and Other Subjects. Selected Papers from the Fifth International Bakhtin Conference, University of Manchester, July 1991</i> (Tony Anemone)	739
Lily Feiler, <i>Marina Tsvetaeva: The Double Beat of Heaven and Hell</i> (Natasha Kolchevska)	740
Munir Sendich, <i>Boris Pasternak: A Reference Guide</i> (Neil Cornwell)	741
David M. Bethea, <i>Joseph Brodsky and the Creation of Exile</i> (Gerald Pirog)	743
Willi Beitz, ed., <i>Vom 'Tauwetter' zur Perestroika: Russische Literatur zwischen den fünfziger und neunziger Jahren</i> (Sigrid McLaughlin)	744
Edith W. Clowes, <i>Russian Experimental Fiction: Resisting Ideology after Utopia</i> (Kevin M.F. Platt)	746
Vlada Petrić, <i>Constructivism in Film: The Man with the Movie Camera. A Cinematic Analysis</i> (Bohdan Y. Nebesio)	747
Andrey Tarkovsky, <i>Time within Time: The Diaries, 1970–1986</i> , Kitty Hunter-Blair, trans. (Denise J. Youngblood)	749
Daniel J. Goulding, ed., <i>Five Filmmakers: Tarkovsky, Forman, Polanski, Szabó, Makavejev</i> (Dina Iordanova)	750
Susan Hardy Aiken, Adele Marie Barker, Maya Koreneva and Ekaterina Stetsenko, <i>Dialogues/Dialogi: Literary and Cultural Exchanges between (Ex)Soviet and American Women</i> (Pamela Chester)	751
Marianne Liljeström, Eila Mantysaari and Arja Rosenholm, eds., <i>Gender Restructuring in Russian Studies: Conference Papers—Helsinki, August 1992</i> ; Jane T. Costlow, Stephanie Sandler and Judith Vowles, eds., <i>Sexuality and the Body in Russian Culture</i> (Nadya Peterson)	753

- John O. Norman, ed., *New Perspectives on Russian and Soviet Artistic Culture: Selected Papers from the 4th World Congress for Soviet and East European Studies, 1990* (James Cracraft) 755
- Jan Mazur, *Geschichte der polnischen Sprache* (Oscar E. Swan) 756
- Bärbel Miemietz, *Motivation zur Motion: Zur Bezeichnung von Frauen durch Feminina und Maskulina im Polnischen* (Robert A. Rothstein) 757
- Joanna Radwańska Williams, *A Paradigm Lost* (Henry M. Hoenigswald) 758
- Philip A. Luelsdorff, Jarmila Panevová and Petr Sgall, eds., *Praguiana 1945–1990* (George M. Cummins, III) 759
- A.A. Barentsen, B.M. Groen and R. Sprenger, eds., *Dutch Contributions to the Eleventh International Congress of Slavists, Bratislava: Linguistics* (Charles E. Townsend) 760
- Hélène Carrère d'Encausse, *The Russian Syndrome: One Thousand Years of Political Murder*, Caroline Higgitt, trans. (Richard Hellie) 762
- William G. Wagner, *Marriage, Property and Law in Imperial Russia* (Albert J. Schmidt) 763
- Marc Raeff, *Political Ideas and Institutions in Imperial Russia* (Cynthia Hyla Whittaker) 764
- Bayara Aroutunova, *Lives In Letters: Princess Zinaida Volkonskaya and Her Correspondence* (Janet Hartley) 765
- David M. Goldfrank, *The Origins of the Crimean War* (William C. Fuller, Jr.) 766
- L.S. Gatagova, *Pravitel'stvennaia politika i narodnoe obrazovanie na Kavkaze v XIX v.* (Wayne Dowler) 767
- Elise Kimerling Wirtschafter, *Structures of Society: Imperial Russia's "People of Various Ranks"* (Louise McReynolds) 768
- Christoph Schmidt, *Ständerecht und Standeswechsel in Rußland 1851–1897* (Elise Kimerling Wirtschafter) 770
- Mary Schaeffer Conroy, *In Health and in Sickness: Pharmacy, Pharmacists, and the Pharmaceutical Industry in Late Imperial, Early Soviet Russia* (Kate Schecter) 771
- N.G. Dumova, *Liberal v Rossii: Tragediia nesovmestimosti. Istoricheskii portret P.N. Miliukova. Chast' pervaiia: Zhizn' v nauke* (M. Birman) 772
- Stephen Frank and Mark Steinberg, eds., *Cultures in Flux: Lower-Class Values, Practices and Resistance in Late Imperial Russia* (Gary Thurston) 773

- Anna Geifman, *Thou Shalt Kill: Revolutionary Terrorism in Russia, 1894–1917* (Jay Bergman) 775
- Anna Horsbrugh-Power, eds., *Memories of Revolution: Russian Women Remember* (Anne D. Rassweiler) 776
- Albert Resis, ed., *Molotov Remembers: Inside Kremlin Politics* (William Taubman) 777
- Mark B. Adams, ed., *The Evolution of Theodosius Dobzhansky: Essays on His Life and Thought in Russia and America* (Alexander Vucinich) 778
- Allan Laine Kagedan, *Soviet Zion: The Quest for a Russian Jewish Homeland* (Robert Weinberg) 779
- A.V. Blium, *Za kulisami "Ministerstva Pravdy": Tainaia istoriia sovetskoï tsenzury, 1917–1929* (Jeffrey Brooks) 780
- Donny Gluckstein, *The Tragedy of Bukharin* and Theodor Bergmann, Gert Schaeffer and Mark Selden, eds., *Bukharin in Retrospect* (Paul Hollander) 782
- M. Wayne Morris, *Stalin's Famine and Roosevelt's Recognition of Russia* (Christine A. White) 784
- Lucjan Dobroszycki and Jeffrey S. Gurock, eds., *The Holocaust in the Soviet Union: Studies and Sources on the Destruction of the Jews in the Nazi Occupied Territories of the USSR, 1941–1945*; Ronald Headland, *Messages of Murder: A Study of the Reports of the Einsatzgruppen of the Security Police and the Security Service, 1941–1943* (Henry Abramson) 785
- Nanci Adler, *Victims of Soviet Terror: The Story of the Memorial Movement* (Kathy Transchel) 786
- Rasma Karklins, *Ethnopolitics and Transition to Democracy: The Collapse of the USSR and Latvia* (J. Dreifelds) 787
- I.D. Parfenov, ed., *Istoriia Rossii: Dialog rossiiskikh i amerikanskikh istorikov* (Eileen Consey Maniichuk) 788
- A.V. Pavlovskaja, ed., *Rossii i Zapad: Dialog kul'tur* (Abbott Gleason) 789
- Ben Slay, *The Polish Economy: Crisis, Reform, and Transformation* (Anne Ellen Henderson) 790
- Henryk Kierzkowski, Marek Okolski and Stanislaw Wellisz, eds., *Stabilization and Structural Adjustment in Poland* (Zbigniew M. Fallenbuchl) 791
- Adam Michnik, *The Church and the Left* (James H. Satterwhite) 793

- Andrzej Jastrzębski, comp., *Dokumenty Komitetu Obrony Robotników i Komitetu Samoobrony Społecznej "KOR"* (Michael Bernhard) 794
- Janina W. Hoskins, *Visual Art in Poland: An Annotated Bibliography of Selected Holdings in the Library of Congress* (Anna M. Rachwald) 795
- Robert B. Pynsent, *Questions of Identity: Czech and Slovak Ideas of Nationality and Personality* (Elizabeth Pribic) 796
- Stanislav J. Kirschbaum, *A History of Slovakia: The Struggle for Survival* (Zdeněk V. David) 797
- Mozes F. Heinschink and Ursula Hemetek, eds., *Roma. Das unbekannte Volk: Schicksal und Kultur* (David M. Crowe) 798
- Jan Zaprudnik, *Belarus: At a Crossroads in History* (David R. Marples) 799
- Manfred Wille, Johannes Hoffmann and Wolfgang Meinicke, eds., *Sie hatten alles verloren: Flüchtlinge und Vertriebene in der sowjetischen Besatzungszone Deutschlands* (Katie Trumpener) 801
- Roger Kirk and Mircea Raceanu, *Romania Versus the United States: Diplomacy of the Absurd, 1985–1989* (Joseph F. Harrington) 803
- Ion Alexandrescu, *A Short History of Bessarabia and Northern Bucovina* (Fred Stambrook) 804
- Peter F. Sugar, Péter Hanák and Tibor Frank, eds., *A History of Hungary* (András Boros-Kazai) 805
- Lawrence Sondhaus, *The Naval Policy of Austria-Hungary, 1867–1918: Navalism, Industrial Development, and the Politics of Dualism* (István Deák) 806
- Wilhelm Baum, *Kaiser Sigismund: Hus, Konstanz und Türkenkriege* (Paula Sutter Fichtner) 807
- Martin Seger and Pal Beluszky, eds., *Bruchlinie Eiserner Vorhang: Regionalentwicklung im österreichischen-ungarischen Grenzraum* (Blair R. Holmes) 808
- Zsuzsanna Bjørn Andersen, *The Voice from Outside: A Study in the Reception of Georg Brandes in Hungary*, Tom and Jean Lundskaer-Nielsen, trans. (Lee Congdon) 809
- James H. Gapinski, *The Economic Structure and Failure of Yugoslavia* (Evan Kraft) 810
- Jan Adam, *Planning and Market in Soviet and East European Thought, 1960s–1992* (Aleksander Bajt) 811



- Stjepan G. Meštrović with Slaven Letica and Miroslav Goreta, *Habits of the Balkan Heart: Social Character and the Fall of Communism* (Andrei Simić) 813
- Blaga Dimitrova, ed., *Penelope of the Twentieth Century: Selected Poems of Elisaveta Bagryana*, Brenda Walker with Valentine Borrisov and Beline Tonchev, trans. (Lyubomira P. Gribble) 814
- F.W. Carter and David Turnock, eds., *Environmental Problems in Eastern Europe* (Boian Koulov) 815
- Michael Waller, Bruno Coppieters and Kris Deschouwer, eds., *Social Democracy in a Post-Communist Europe* (James Felak) 816
- Josephine Wtulich, *American Xenophobia and the Slav Immigrant: A Living Legacy of Mind and Spirit*; Susan Wiley Hardwick, *Russian Refuge* (Thaddeus C. Radzilowski) 817
- Touraj Atabaki, *Azerbaijan: Ethnicity and Autonomy in Twentieth-Century Iran* (Adeeb Khalid) 819
- Marsil' Nurullovič Farkhshatov, *Narodnoe obrazovanie v Bashkirii v poreformennyi period 60-90-e gody XIX v.* (Steven Duke) 820
- Michael Mandelbaum, ed., *Central Asia and the World: Kazakhstan, Uzbekistan, Tajikistan, Kyrgyzstan and Turkmenistan* (Muriel Atkin) 821
- Sergei P. Poliakov, *Everyday Islam: Religion and Tradition in Rural Central Asia*, Martha Brill Olcott, ed. (Ronald Wixman) 822
- Anders Åslund, ed., *Economic Transformation in Russia* (James Millar) 823
- Guoli Liu, *States and Markets: Comparing Japan and Russia* (Deborah Anne Palmieri) 824
- Andrei Kuznetsov, *Foreign Investment in Contemporary Russia: Managing Capital Entry* (George D. Holliday) 826
- Charles K. Dodd, *Industrial Decision-Making and High-Risk Technology: Siting Nuclear Power Facilities in the USSR* (David L. Ruffley) 827
- Deborah Anne Palmieri, ed., *Russia and the NIS in the World Economy: East-West Investment, Financing and Trade* (Richard E. Ericson) 828
- Josef C. Brada, Inderjit Singh and Adám Török, *Firms Afloat and Firms Adrift: Hungarian Industry and the Economic Transition* (Catherine Sokil Milnikiewicz) 829

Victor A. Kremenjuk, <i>Conflicts in and around Russia: Nation-Building in Difficult Times</i> (Robert J. Kaiser)	830
Michael Rywkin, <i>Moscow's Lost Empire</i> (Yuri Slezkine)	831
John Murray, <i>The Russian Press from Brezhnev to Yeltsin: Behind the Paper Curtain</i> (Vera Tolz)	832
Victor Peppard and James Riordan, <i>Playing Politics: Soviet Sport Diplomacy to 1992</i> (Alfred Erich Senn)	833
Donald V. Schwartz and Razmik Panossian, eds., <i>Nationalism and History: The Politics of Nation Building in Post-Soviet Armenia, Azerbaijan, and Georgia</i> (Firuz Kazemzadeh)	834
David Mandel, <i>Rabotyagi: Perestroika and After Viewed from Below. Interviews with Workers in the Former Soviet Union</i> (Vladimir D. Shkolnikov)	835
Simon Clarke, Peter Fairbrother, Michael Burawoy and Pavel Krotov, <i>What about the Workers? Workers and the Transition to Capitalism in Russia</i> (Vladimir D. Shkolnikov)	836
Charles W. Kegley, Jr. and Gregory A. Raymond, <i>A Multipolar Peace? Great-Power Politics in the Twenty-first Century</i> (Raymond L. Garthoff)	837
Peter G. Boyle, <i>American-Soviet Relations: From the Russian Revolution to the Fall of Communism</i> (David W. McFadden)	838
Ole Wæver, Barry Buzan, Morten Kelstrup and Pierre Lemaitre, <i>Identity, Migration and the New Security Agenda in Europe</i> (Allison K. Stanger)	839
Melvyn P. Leffler and David S. Painter, eds., <i>Origins of the Cold War: An International History</i> ; Hall Gardner, <i>Surviving the Millennium: American Global Strategy, the Collapse of the Soviet Empire, and the Question of Peace</i> (Richard Ned Lebow)	840
Odd Arne Westad, <i>Cold War and Revolution: Soviet-American Rivalry and the Origins of the Chinese Civil War, 1944–1946</i> (Kathryn Weathersby)	841

## **SLAVIC REVIEW ON LINE**

A More Powerful Teaching and Research Tool

Upon publication of each new number of *Slavic Review*, the articles from the preceding issue will be placed on the internet utilizing the 'Gopher' and 'World Wide Web' nets. The access protocol from Telnet:

gopher ccat.sas.upenn.edu Select Elec Pub & Res, then #21, *Slavic Review*  
or, for World Wide Web

lynx <http://ccat.sas.upenn.edu/slavrev/slavrev.html>

(Those with Netscape or Mosaic software can view the graphic components [e.g., maps and figures] of *Slavic Review* by accessing the WWW through either program, using the address above **without** the "lynx" preface.)

For America On-Line subscribers, use the keyword 'gopher', then select 'Search All Gophers'. Type 'slavic review' into the Veronica search option.

Please see inside front cover, last paragraph, for copyright exclusions. The previous issue is now on line. Please send your comments, suggestions and advice to users to us at: [slavrev@sas.upenn.edu](mailto:slavrev@sas.upenn.edu)

## **TO THOSE WISHING TO SUBMIT MANUSCRIPTS**

Manuscripts for consideration should be submitted by post or courier service in four double-spaced typed copies. (If computer generated, they should be letter quality or near letter quality. Continuous form sheets must be separated.) Notes and block quotations should be double-spaced; notes should be placed at the end of the manuscript and not at the bottoms of pages. Library of Congress transliteration for quotations of fewer than 50 words and the *Chicago Manual of Style* are to be followed. In general, articles should not exceed 30 typed pages 8½" by 11" in dimension—including endnotes.

Manuscripts are sent to outside readers in anonymous form and should be prepared accordingly.

The policy of *Slavic Review* is not to consider materials that have been published or that are being considered for publication elsewhere. Please consult us in advance of submitting an uninvited book review.

Publication of articles in *Slavic Review* is ordinarily limited to those submitted by members of AAASS. Nonmembers wishing to submit manuscripts will be sent a manuscript application; please see the inside front cover for information on membership.