

International Labor and Working-Class History

WHAT NEXT
FOR LABOR
AND
WORKING-CLASS
HISTORY?



INTERNATIONAL LABOR AND WORKING-CLASS HISTORY

Founded by
Robert F. Wheeler

EDITORS

Helmut Gruber
Polytechnic University

Ira Katznelson
*New School for
Social Research*

ASSISTANT EDITOR

Kim Geiger
*New School for
Social Research*

REPORTS EDITOR

Bruce Levine
University of Cincinnati

Lizabeth Cohen
New York University

Geoff Field
*State University of
New York, Purchase*

Michael Hanagan
*New School for
Social Research*

Stephen Kotkin
Princeton University

Bruce Levine
University of Cincinnati

David Montgomery
Yale University

EDITORIAL BOARD

Mary Nolan
New York University

Anson Rabinbach
The Cooper Union

Judith Stein
*City College
of New York*

Louise Tilly
*New School for
Social Research*

Barbara Weinstein
SUNY, Stony Brook

Sean Wilentz
Princeton University

International Labor and Working-Class History (ISSN 0147-5479) is published twice yearly, in the spring and the fall, by Cambridge University Press for the editors of *ILWCH*. Additional support is provided by the New School for Social Research. Annual subscription rates for Numbers 45 and 46, 1994: Institutional US \$36.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico, UK £28.00 in the rest of the world; Individual US \$18.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico, UK £14.00 in the rest of the world; Single parts US \$20.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico, UK £15.00 in the rest of the world. Prices include surface postage and insurance. Add UK £5.00 for airmail.

Editorial Office: Manuscripts, editorial correspondence, and books for review should be addressed to Editor, *ILWCH*, Center for Studies of Social Change, New School for Social Research, 64 University Place, 4th Floor, New York, NY 10003. Tel. (212) 533-9341; Fax (212) 477-5409; INTERNET: ILWCH@CSSC.NEWSCHOOL.EDU.

Publishing, Subscription, and Advertising Offices: Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211; or Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England.

Copyright © 1994 International Labor and Working-Class History, Inc. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Photocopying information for users in the USA: The Item-Fee Code for this publication (ISSN 0147-5479/94 \$5.00 + .00) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the US Copyright Law is authorized for duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance of \$5.00 per article is paid directly to: CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying.

The Board of Consulting Editors may be found immediately following the contents. See the back of the journal for subscription information.

Cover photo: Roy Lichtenstein. *Modern Painting with Bolt*. (1966). Synthetic polymer paint and oil partly silkscreened on canvas, 68 $\frac{1}{4}$ × 68 $\frac{3}{8}$ ". The Museum of Modern Art, New York. The Sidney and Harriet Janis Collection. Photograph © 1994 The Museum of Modern Art, New York.

NO. 46

FALL 1994

Editors' Remarks	1
In Memoriam: E. P. Thompson	2

***ILWCH* ROUNDTABLE: WHAT NEXT FOR LABOR
AND WORKING-CLASS HISTORY?**

The "Bourgeois" Dimension: A Provocation About Institutions, Politics, and the Future of Labor History <i>Ira Katznelson</i>	7
Katznelson's Working Within the System Now <i>Lizabeth Cohen</i>	33
Signs of Crisis, Fin-de-Siècle Doldrums, or Middle Age? <i>Geoffrey Field</i>	37
Yesterday, Today, and Tomorrow: Neither Crisis Nor Stasis <i>Helmut Gruber</i>	45
A Return to Liberalism in Labor History? <i>Michael Hanagan</i>	51
The History of Politics and the Politics of History <i>Bruce Levine</i>	58
From Scientific Socialism to Political Science? <i>David Montgomery</i>	63
Is Liberalism Really the Answer? <i>Mary Nolan</i>	67
Intellectual Crisis or Paradigm Shift? <i>Anson Rabinbach</i>	73
Engaged History <i>Judith Stein</i>	81

History's Noncrisis <i>Louise A. Tilly</i>	86
Labor History: Out of Vogue? <i>Sean Wilentz</i>	89

ARTICLES

Rethinking the Relation of Labor to the Politics of Urban Social Reform in Late Nineteenth-Century America: The Case of Chicago <i>Richard Schneirov</i>	93
Working-Class Consumer Power <i>Marcel van der Linden</i>	109
Industrial-Relations Theory and Labor History <i>Dave Lyddon</i>	122

RESPONSE TO CONTROVERSY: RACE AND THE CIO

Race and the CIO: Reply to Critics <i>Michael Goldfield</i>	142
--	-----

REVIEW ESSAY

Australian Labor History <i>Greg Patmore</i>	161
---	-----

REPORTS AND CORRESPONDENCE

Social History Conference <i>Thomas Winter and Andrew Kersten</i>	172
North American Labor History Conference <i>Eric Fure-Slocum, Kim Nielsen, Dorsey Phelps, Anthony Quiroz, Mark Stemen, and Paul Young</i>	173
Eighth Biennial Southern Labor Studies Conference: Race and Culture <i>Colin Davis and Michael Conniff</i>	176
Labor History at the Social Science History Association <i>Lisa McGirr</i>	179
“Ordinary People, Extraordinary Lives”: Conference for Historians and Archivists <i>David V. Quigley</i>	182

BOOK REVIEWS

- Gendered Domains: Rethinking Public and Private in Women's History*,
by Dorothy O. Helly and Susan M. Reverby
Reviewed by Marilyn J. Boxer 186
- Labour and Liberalism in Nineteenth-Century Europe: Essays
in Comparative History*, by John Breuilly
Reviewed by David Crew 189
- The United States and the European Trade Union Movement, 1944–1951*,
by Federico Romero
Reviewed by Stephen Burwood 191
- Fish and Chips and the British Working Class, 1870–1940*, by John K. Walton
Reviewed by William J. Baker 194
- Labour's War: The Labour Party during the Second World War*,
by Stephen Brooke
Reviewed by Geoffrey Field 196
- Marxism at Work: Ideology, Class and French Socialism during the Third
Republic*, by Robert Stuart
Reviewed by Christopher H. Johnson 199
- Marxism and Communism in Twentieth-Century Mexico*, by Barry Carr
Reviewed by Vivianne Brachet-Marquez 202
- Slaves, Peasants, and Rebels: Reconsidering Brazilian Slavery*,
by Stuart Schwartz
Reviewed by Ira Berlin 205
- The Brazilian Workers' ABC: Class Conflict and Alliances in Modern
São Paulo*, by John D. French
Reviewed by Cliff Welch 207
- Politics and Class in Milan, 1881–1901*, by Louise A. Tilly
Reviewed by Alexander De Grand 208
- How Fascism Ruled Women: Italy, 1922–1945*, by Victoria de Grazia
Reviewed by Marta Petrusiewicz 211
- Geographical Inquiry and American Historical Problems*, by Carville Earle
Reviewed by Richard Bense 214
- In the Shadow of the Statue of Liberty: Immigrants, Workers, and Citizens
in the American Republic, 1880–1920*, edited by Marianne Debouzy
Reviewed by John J. Bukowczyk 216

<i>The Course of Industrial Decline: The Boott Cotton Mills of Lowell, Massachusetts, 1895–1955</i> , by Laurence F. Gross	
Reviewed by Gerald G. Eggert	219
<i>Creating the Modern South: Millhands and Managers in Dalton, Georgia, 1884–1984</i> , by Douglas Flammig	
Reviewed by James A. Hodges	221
<i>Industrial Democracy in America: The Ambiguous Promise</i> , edited by Nelson Lichtenstein and Howell John Harris	
Reviewed by Melvyn Dubofsky	223
NEWS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS	227

BOARD OF CONSULTING EDITORS

Kathryn Amdur
Emory University

Ira Berlin
University of Maryland

Frederick Cooper
University of Michigan

Geoff Eley
University of Michigan

Patrick Fridenson
*Ecole des Hautes Etudes
en Sciences Sociales*

Andrew Gordon
Duke University

Emily Honig
University of California, Santa Cruz

Michael F. Jiménez
University of Pittsburgh

Linda Kerber
University of Iowa

Alex Keyssar
Duke University

Nelson Lichtenstein
University of Virginia

Mahmood Mamdani
Centre for Basic Research, Kampala

Louis Menashe
Polytechnic University

Ruth Milkman
University of California, Los Angeles

Lutz Niethammer
Kulturwissenschaftliches Institut, Essen

Bryan Palmer
Queens University, Ontario

Luisa Passerini
Wissenschaftskolleg, Berlin

Jean-Luc Pinol
*Centre de Recherches Historiques sur
la Ville, Strasbourg*

Elizabeth Roberts
*Centre for North-West Regional
Studies, Lancaster University*

Joan Scott
Institute for Advanced Study

Ronald G. Suny
University of Michigan

Marcel van der Linden
*International Review of Social History,
Amsterdam*

Adelheid von Saldern
Universität Hannover

Judith Walkowitz
Johns Hopkins University

J. M. Winter
*Pembroke College, Cambridge
University*

Olivier Zunz
University of Virginia