

VOLUME 18
NUMBER 2
JUNE 1995

An International Journal of Current Research
and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Appearing in this issue, with Commentary . . .

On a confusion about a function of consciousness Ned Block

**Preparedness and phobias: Specific evolved associations
or a generalized expectancy bias?** Graham C. L. Davey

Multiple book review of *Images of Mind* Michael I. Posner & Marcus E. Raichle

Also, Continuing Commentary on

"Coevolution of neocortical size, group size, and language in humans"

(R. I. M. Dunbar)

**"How we know our minds: The illusion of first-person knowledge of
intentionality"** (Alison Gopnik)

"The psychology of folk psychology" (Alvin I. Goldman)

CAMBRIDGE

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editor

Stevan Harnad

E-mail: bbs@ecs.soton.ac.uk

Behavioral and Brain Sciences
Department of Psychology
University of Southampton
Highfield, Southampton SO17 1BJ
United Kingdom

Managing Editor

Henriette Korthals Altes

Production Coordinator

Edward D. Miller

Chief Copy Editor

Erika Kors

Associate Editors

Behavioral Biology

Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin
Hubert Markl/U. Konstanz

Biosocial Behavior

Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence
Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London

Computational Neuroscience

Stephen Grossberg/Boston U.

Evolutionary Biology

Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

History and Systems

Julian Jaynes/Princeton

Language and Cognition

Philip Johnson-Laird/Princeton

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

Linguistics

Robert Freidin/Princeton

Neurobiology

Irving Kupfermann/Columbia

Neurobehavioral Genetics

Wim E. Crusio/Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique

Neuropsychology

Jeffrey A. Gray/Inst. Psychiatry, London
John C. Marshall/Radcliffe Infirmary, Oxford

Neurophysiology

Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

Paleoneurology

Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

Perception

Bruce Bridgeman/U. California
Richard Gregory/U. Bristol

Philosophy

Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts
Gilbert Harman/Princeton

Philosophy of Science

Adolf Grünbaum/U. Pittsburgh
Massimo Piatelli-Palmarini/MIT

Primateology

Horst D. Steklis/Rutgers

Psychobiology

Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut

Vision and Artificial Intelligence

Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

Editorial Policy *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write the editor.

Copying This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (222 Rosewood Dr., Danvers, MA 01923). Organizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. ISI Genuine Article Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

Subscriptions *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December. The subscription price for institutions of Volume 18 (1995) is US \$222.00 net in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £150.00 in the rest of the world; for individuals US \$90.00 net (£59.00); for BBS Associates and for students (in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico only) with proof of eligibility with order US \$50.00 net (£37.00). Subscription price includes surface postage.

Single parts cost US \$57.00 net (£36.00) plus postage. Institutional orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20 Street, New York, NY 10011-4211; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. Individuals must order direct from the Press. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y., and at additional mailing offices. **Postmaster:** Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Dept., 110 Midland Ave., Port Chester, NY 10573.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Advertising Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Contents Volume 18:2 June 1995

Block, N. On a confusion about a function of consciousness 227

Open Peer Commentary

Armstrong, D. M. Perception-consciousness and action-consciousness?	247	Lycan, W. G. We've only just begun	262
Atkinson, A. P. & Davies, M. Consciousness without conflation	248	Morton, A. Phenomenal and attentional consciousness may be inextricable	263
Baars, B. J. Evidence that phenomenal consciousness is the same as access consciousness	249	Natsoulas, T. How access-consciousness might be a kind of consciousness	264
Bachmann, T. More empirical cases to break the accord of phenomenal and access-consciousness	249	Navon, D. A-consciousness: The local newspaper of the mind?	265
Church, J. Fallacies or analyses?	251	Revonsuo, A. Conscious and nonconscious control of action	265
Dennett, D. The path not taken	252	Rey, G. Block's philosophical anosognosia	266
Dixon, N. F. Breakthrough on the consciousness front or much ado about nothing?	253	Shepard, R. N. What is an agent that it experiences P-consciousness? And what is P-consciousness that it moves an agent?	267
Farah, M. J. Is consciousness of perception really separable from perception?	254	Tye, M. Blindsight, orgasm, and representational overlap	268
Graham, G. Guilty consciousness	255	Van Brakel, J. Consciousness is not a natural kind	269
Harman, G. Phenomenal fallacies and conflation	256	Warren, R. M. Should we continue to study consciousness?	270
Humphrey, N. Blocking out the distinction between sensation and perception: Superblindsight and the case of Helen	257	Young, A. W. More on prosopagnosia	271
Katz, L. D. On distinguishing phenomenal consciousness from the representational functions of mind	258	Zalla, T. & Palma, A. P. Feeling of knowing and phenomenal consciousness	271
Kitcher, P. Triangulating phenomenal consciousness	259	EDITORIAL COMMENTARY	272
Kobes, B. W. Access and what it is like	260	Author's Response	
Levine, J. Phenomenal access: A moving target	261	Block, N. How many concepts of consciousness?	272
Lloyd, D. Access denied	261		

Davey, G. C. L. Preparedness and phobias: Specific evolved associations or a generalized expectancy bias? 289

Open Peer Commentary

Delprato, D. J. Heredity x environment or developmental interactions?	297	Mineka, S. & Cook, M. Expectancy bias as sole or partial account of selective associations?	307
Edelmann, R. J. Innateness versus expectation in human fears: Causal versus maintaining factors?	298	Neese, R. M. & Abelson, J. L. Natural selection and fear regulation mechanisms	309
Fantino, E. & Goldshmidt, J. Rule-governed and contingency-governed fears	299	Öhman, A. Eggs in more than one basket: Mediating mechanisms between evolution and phobias	310
Figueredo, A. J. A stochastic optimality theory of preparedness and plasticity	300	Plaud, J. J. The generalized expectancy bias: An explanatory enigma	311
Hamm, A. Biologically primed acquisition of aversions and association of expected stimulus pairs: Two different forms of learning	301	Schell, A. M. & Dawson, M. E. Responses conditioned to fear-relevant stimuli survive extinction of the expectancy of the UCS	312
Klein, D. F. Counterevidence from psychopharmacology, psychopathology, and psychobiology	302	Sokolov, E. N. Phobias and anxiety in the framework of the defense reflex	313
Lovibund, P. F., Siddle, D. A. T. & Bond, N. W. Why are phobias irrational?	303	Tomarken, A. J. What is the critical evidence favoring expectancy bias theory, and where is it?	313
McNally, R. J. Preparedness, phobias, and the Panglossian paradigm	303	Vaitl, D. Associative learning: Stimulus arrangement and response consistency	314
Mealey, L. Enhanced processing of threatening stimuli: The case of face recognition	304	Author's Response	
Menzies, R. G. The uneven distribution of fears and phobias: A nonassociative account	305	Davey, G. C. L. Expectancy bias and phobias: Accounting for the uneven distribution of fears and the characteristics of clinical phobias	315
Miller, D. B. Nonlinear experiential influences on the development of fear reactions	306		

Open Peer Commentary

Burghardt, G. M. Brain imaging, ethology, and the nonhuman mind	339	Jacobs, A. M. & Carr, T. H. Mind mappers and cognitive modelers: Toward cross-fertilization	362
Cotterill, R. M. J. Mindwatching	340	Jonides, J. & Reuter-Lorenz, P. Redefining cognitive psychology	363
Dalenoort, G. J. Is attention an appropriate concept for explaining brain processes?	341	Kapur, N. Looking for images of memory	364
Donald, M. Tough times for dualists	342	Kristeva-Feige, R. & Feige, B. Is the human brain only responsive?	365
Fidelman, U. The three attentional networks and the two hemispheric mechanisms	343	O'Mara, S. M. When is it sensible to use PET to study brain function?	366
Fox, P. T. Broca's area: Motor encoding in somatic space	344	Paller, K. A. If a picture is worth a thousand words, how many pictures is a word worth?	367
Freides, D. A major advance in neuropsychology	345	Perrone, A. L. & Basti, G. Neural images and neural coding	368
Frith, C. D. & Dolan, R. J. Brain imaging the psychoses	346	Poeppl, D. & Johnson, S. Neuroimaging studies of language should connect with (psycho)linguistic theories	369
Goertzel, B. Images in search of a theory	347	Robinson, D. L. The meaning of baselines	370
Goldberg, G. & Mayer, N. H. The neurodynamics of heavy PETing, at/intention, learning, functional recovery, and rehabilitation	348	Schmitt, G. J. E. Bright red spots or—the meaning of the meaning	370
Grafman, J., Partiot, A. & Hollnagel, C. Fables of the prefrontal cortex	349	Solso, R. L. <i>Images of mind</i> : A window to the brain	371
Halgren, E. PET may image the gates of awareness, not its center	358	Tsotsos, J. K. Computation, PET images, and attention	372
Hari, R. Tracking brain functions in space and time	359	Authors' Response	
Horwitz, B. Regions, networks: Interpreting functional neuroimaging data	360	Posner, M. I. & Raichle, M. E. Interaction of method and theory in cognitive neuroscience	372
Ingber, L. Multiple scales of brain-mind interactions	360		

Continuing Commentary

<i>On</i> Dunbar, R. I. M. (1993) Coevolution of neocortical size, group size and language in humans. BBS 16:681–735.			385
---	--	--	-----

Bradshaw, J. Another far more ancient tongue	385	Thompson, N. S. Does language arise from a calculus of dominance?	387
Jaffe, K. & Chacon, G. Nonlinear trends in the evolution of the complexity of nervous systems, group size, and communication systems: A general feature in biology	386	Author's Response	
Solso, R. L. The origin of language: More words needed.	386	Dunbar, R. I. M. Neocortical size and language	388

<i>On</i> Gopnik, A. (1993) How we know our minds: The illusion of first-person knowledge of intentionality. BBS 16:1–14; Goldman, Alvin I. (1993) The psychology of folk psychology. BBS 16:15–28.			390
--	--	--	-----

Bogdan, R. J. The epistemological illusion	390	Authors' Responses	
Greve, W. & Buchner, A. Speaking of beliefs: Reporting or constituting mental entities?	391	Goldman, A. I. Epistemology, two types of functionalism, and first-person authority	395
Pust, J. Two kinds of representational functionalism: Defusing the combinational explosion	392	Gopnik, A. How to understand beliefs	398
Van Brakel, J. Interpreting self-ascriptions	393		