

STUDIES IN
CHURCH HISTORY

VOLUME 60

THE CHURCH, HYPOCRISY
AND DISSIMULATION

Edited by CATHERINE CUBITT
CHARLOTTE METHUEN
and ANDREW SPICER

For the Ecclesiastical History Society
CAMBRIDGE

Studies in Church History

60

(2024)

THE CHURCH, HYPOCRISY AND
DISSIMULATION

THE CHURCH, HYPOCRISY AND
DISSIMULATION

EDITED BY

CATHERINE CUBITT
CHARLOTTE METHUEN
ANDREW SPICER

PUBLISHED FOR
THE ECCLESIASTICAL HISTORY SOCIETY
BY
CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
2024

© Ecclesiastical History Society 2024

Published by Cambridge University Press & Assessment
on behalf of the Ecclesiastical History Society
University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

This publication is subject to copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provision of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of the copyright holder.

First published 2024

ISBN 9781009567176

ISSN 0424–2084

The Authorized (King James) Version. Rights in the Authorized Version in the United Kingdom are vested in the Crown. Reproduced by permission of the Crown's patentee, Cambridge University Press.

English Standard Version (ESV). The Holy Bible, English Standard Version. ESV® Text Edition: 2016. Copyright © 2001 by Crossway Bibles, a publishing ministry of Good News Publishers.

New English Translation (NET). NET Bible® copyright ©1996–2017 by Biblical Studies Press, L.L.C. <http://netbible.com> All rights reserved.

New Revised Standard Version Bible: Anglicized Edition, copyright © 1989, 1995, Division of Christian Education of the National Council of the Churches of Christ in the United States of America. Used by permission. All rights reserved.

New Revised Standard Version Updated Edition (NRSVUE). New Revised Standard Version, Updated Edition. Copyright © 2021 National Council of Churches of Christ in the United States of America. Used by permission. All rights reserved worldwide.

SUBSCRIPTIONS: *Studies in Church History* is an annual subscription journal (ISSN 0424–2084). The 2024 subscription price (excluding VAT), which includes print and electronic access, is £144 (US \$230 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for institutions and £79 (US \$127 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for individuals ordering direct from the Press and certifying that the volume is for their personal use. An electronic-only subscription is also available to institutions at £87 (US \$139 in the USA, Canada and Mexico). Special arrangements exist for members of the Ecclesiastical History Society.

Previous volumes are available online at www.cambridge.org/StudCH

Printed in Great Britain by Henry Ling Limited, The Dorset Press, Dorchester, DT1 1HD

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Contents

Preface	ix
List of Contributors	xi
List of Abbreviations	xiii
List of Illustrations	xv
Introduction	1
Catherine Cubitt	
The Devil as ‘Father of Lies’: Ideas of Diabolical Deceit in the Donatist Controversy	17
Sophie Lunn-Rockliffe	
‘In Defiance of his Cloth’: Monastic (Im)Piety in Late Antique Egypt (<i>President’s Prize</i>)	43
Paula Tutty	
Ostriches, Spiders’ Webs and Antichrist: Hypocrisy in Writings of Pope Gregory the Great and Archbishop Wulfstan II of York (<i>Presidential Address</i>)	64
Catherine Cubitt	
Cannibal, Scorpion, Horse, Owl: Institutional Hypocrites and the Early Fourteenth-Century Church	91
John Sabapathy	
False Religion and Hypocrisy in Signorelli’s <i>Antichrist</i>	121
Konstantinos Gravanis	
‘God really hated the hypocrites’: Hypocrisy and Anti-clerical Rhetoric in the Early Lutheran Reformation	148
Charlotte Methuen	
Hypocrisy and Humour in the English Reformation	176
Ethan H. Shagan	

Contents

<i>Prudentes sicut serpentes</i> : Dissimulation and Concealment in Japanese and Chinese Missions in the Seventeenth Century Iveta Nakládalová	197
Hypocrisy, 'Prudence', 'Conscience' in Administration: The Congregation of Bishops and Regulars in Seventeenth-Century Italy Simone Maghenzani	216
'See sincerity sparkle in thy practice': Antidotes to Hypocrisy in British Print Sermons, 1640–95 Anna Pravdica	238
Providence and Puritan Deceit: John Davenport's Forgery Revisited Christy Wang	264
'A Herd of snivelling, grinning Hypocrites': Religious Hypocrisy in Restoration Drama David Fletcher	290
Laughing at Hypocrisy: <i>The Turncoats</i> (1711), Visual Culture and Dissent in Early Eighteenth-Century England Adam Morton	312
The Problems of Performing Piety in some Exeter Dissenting Sermons c.1660–1745 David Parry	340
The Rev. John Stainsby and the 'diffusion of Gospel truth' in Early Nineteenth-Century Jamaica (<i>Kennedy Prize</i>) Alice Kinghorn	363
Dissimulation as an Editorial Strategy in the <i>Life of William Wilberforce</i> Mark Smith	387
Bishops, Brothels and Byron: Hypocrisy and the 1844 Brothel Suppression Bill Emily Baylor	408

Contents

Cavalier South vs Puritan North? Hypocrisy and Identity in the American Civil War Edward G. Manger	431
Enjoying what comes naturally: The Church of England and Sexuality in the 1930s Mark D. Chapman	453
Humanity Defined, Hypocrisy Defied: Sacralizing the Black Freedom Struggle, 1930–60 Dennis C. Dickerson	477
Vocation, Hypocrisy and Secularization: Iris Murdoch and the Clergy of the Church of England Peter Webster	511
OutRage! Hypocrisy, Episcopacy and Homosexuality in 1990s England William Whyte	533
Corrigenda	
Ministering to Body and Soul: Medical Missions and the Jewish Community in Nineteenth-Century London – CORRIGENDUM Jemima Jarman	558
Unbelief, the Senses and the Body in Nicholas Bownde's <i>The vnbeleefe of S. Thomas</i> (1608) – CORRIGENDUM Patrick S. McGhee	559
Pain as a Spiritual Barometer of Health: A Sign of Divine Love, 1780–1850 – CORRIGENDUM Angela Platt	560

Preface

Studies in Church History 60 collects papers presented at the Summer Conference held at the University of York in July 2022 and the Winter Meeting held online in January 2023, under the presidency of Professor Catherine Cubitt. The Summer Conference was seriously affected by falling on the hottest days ever recorded in the UK, which caused significant travel disruption. The president and editors are grateful to those who managed to attend nonetheless, and also to those who could not attend but gave their papers online.

The articles in this volume provide a range of fascinating insights into the understudied question of the role of hypocrisy in the Church. We are grateful to Professor Cubitt for proposing the theme. We also wish to thank the Society's Conference Secretary, Professor Elizabeth Tingle, for her meticulous and careful planning of both the Summer Conference and Winter Meeting, and to the Society's Secretary and Treasurer, Dr Jacqueline Rose and Simon Jenkins, for their invaluable contributions to the Society's work. Dr Rose stepped down as Secretary while this volume was in preparation.

The editors also wish to express their gratitude to all who offered contributions and submitted papers for consideration, and to those who peer reviewed the contributions. The volume has benefitted from Dr Alice Soulieux-Evans' careful work as assistant editor, and the editors are very grateful to the Society for funding her post. Studies in Church History 60 is the final volume to be co-edited by Professor Andrew Spicer. On behalf of the EHS Committee, we wish to express our thanks to him for his contribution not only to Studies in Church History as co-editor for volumes 51 to 60, but also for his introduction of a rigorous peer review system, his role in liaising with Cambridge University Press, but also for his vision for the Society as a whole through the reconceiving of the Winter Meeting and the initiation of the EHS book prize. We are very grateful to Professor Spicer for his inspirational contribution as co-editor.

The Ecclesiastical History Society is pleased to award the Kennedy Prize, for the best contribution by a postgraduate student, to Alice

Preface

Kinghorn for her fascinating article ‘The Rev. John Stainsby and the “diffusion of Gospel truth” in Early Nineteenth-Century Jamaica.’ The President’s Prize, for the best article by an early career scholar, is awarded to Paula Tutty for her thought-provoking study “‘In Defiance of his Cloth”: Monastic (Im)piety in Late Antique Egypt.’

Charlotte Methuen
University of Glasgow

Andrew Spicer
Oxford Brookes University

Contributors

Emily Baylor

Postgraduate student, University of Edinburgh

Mark D. Chapman

Professor of the History of Modern Theology, University of Oxford

Catherine Cubitt

Professor Emerita of Medieval History, University of East Anglia

Dennis C. Dickerson

Reverend James Lawson Chair in History, Vanderbilt University

David Fletcher

Honorary Research Fellow, University of Warwick

Konstantinos Gravanis

Postdoctoral researcher, National and Kapodistrian University of Athens, Greece

Alice Kinghorn

Lecturer in British History, University of Gloucester

Sophie Lunn-Rockliffe

Associate Professor in Patristics, University of Cambridge

Simone Maghenzani

Dame Marilyn Strathern Associate Professor of History, Fellow and Director of Studies, Girton College, University of Cambridge

Edward G. Manger

Independent scholar and licensure candidate with the Associate Reformed Presbyterian Church

Contributors

Charlotte Methuen

Professor of Ecclesiastical History, University of Glasgow

Adam Morton

Senior Lecturer in British History, Newcastle University

Iveta Nakládalová

Assistant Professor, Palacký University Olomouc, Czech Republic

David Parry

Lecturer in English, University of Exeter

Anna Pravdica

Postgraduate student, Department of History, University of Warwick

John Sabapathy

Professor of History, University College London

Ethan H. Shagan

Professor of History, University of California, Berkeley

Mark Smith

Associate Professor in History, University of Oxford

Paula Tutty

Freelance researcher, Liverpool

Christy Wang

JSPS Postdoctoral Fellow, The University of Tokyo

Peter Webster

Independent scholar, Chichester

William Whyte

Professor of Social and Architectural History, St John's College, Oxford

Abbreviations

ACW	J. Quasten and J. C. Plumpe, eds, <i>Ancient Christian Writers</i>
AV	Authorized [King James] Version
BIA	Borthwick Institute for Archives
BN	Bibliothèque nationale de France
Bodl.	Bodleian Library
<i>CathHR</i>	<i>Catholic Historical Review</i> (1915–)
CChr.CM	Corpus Christianorum, <i>continuatio medievalis</i> (1966–)
CChr.SL	Corpus Christianorum, series Latina (1953–)
<i>ChH</i>	<i>Church History</i> (1932–)
CRL	Cadbury Research Library, University of Birmingham
CSEL	Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum (Vienna, 1866–)
<i>DOP</i>	<i>Dumbarton Oaks Papers</i> (1941–)
DWL	Dr Williams's Library
EETS	Early English Text Society
<i>EHR</i>	<i>English Historical Review</i> (1886–)
<i>ELH</i>	<i>English Literary History</i> (1934–)
<i>EME</i>	<i>Early Medieval Europe</i> (1992–)
ESV	English Standard Version
ET	English translation
GCS	Die Griechischen Christlichen Schriftsteller
HC Deb.	House of Commons Debates
<i>HistJ</i>	<i>Historical Journal</i> (1958–)
HL Deb.	House of Lords Debates
<i>HR</i>	<i>Historical Research</i> (1986–)
<i>HThR</i>	<i>Harvard Theological Review</i> (1908–)
<i>JBS</i>	<i>Journal of British Studies</i> (1961–)
<i>JECS</i>	<i>Journal of Early Christian Studies</i> (1993–)
<i>JEH</i>	<i>Journal of Ecclesiastical History</i> (1950–)
<i>JRH</i>	<i>Journal of Religious History</i> (1960–)
<i>JRS</i>	<i>Journal of Roman Studies</i> (1911–)
<i>JThS</i>	<i>Journal of Theological Studies</i> (1899–)
LCL	Loeb Classical Library
LMA	London Metropolitan Archive
LPL	Lambeth Palace Library

Abbreviations

<i>LW</i>	J. Pelikan and H. Lehmann, eds, <i>Luther's Works</i> , 55 vols (St Louis, MO, 1955–75)
n.d.	no date
NET	New English Translation
n.pl.	no place
NRSV	New Revised Standard Version
NRSVUE	New Revised Standard Version Updated Edition
<i>OED</i>	<i>Oxford English Dictionary</i>
<i>P&P</i>	<i>Past and Present</i> (1952–)
<i>PH</i>	<i>Parliamentary History</i> (1982–)
PL	J.-P. Migne, ed., <i>Patrologia Latina</i> , 217 vols + 4 index vols (Paris, 1844–65)
<i>RTAM</i>	<i>Recherches de théologie ancienne et médiévale</i> (1929–97)
SC	Sources Chrétiennes (Paris, 1941–)
SCH	Studies in Church History (1964–)
SCH Sub	Studies in Church History Subsidia, 14 vols (1978–2012)
<i>SCJ</i>	Sixteenth Century Journal (1970–2006)
<i>s.v.</i>	<i>sub verbo</i> ('under the word')
TNA	The National Archives (Kew)
<i>TRHS</i>	<i>Transactions of the Royal Historical Society</i> (1871–)
<i>WA</i>	J. K. F. Knaake et al., eds, <i>D. Martin Luthers Werke: Kritische Gesamtausgabe</i> (Weimar, 1883–)
TTH	Translated Texts for Historians

Illustrations

John Sabapathy, 'Cannibal, Scorpion, Horse, Owl: Institutional Hypocrites and the Early Fourteenth-Century Church'

Fig. 1. Paris, BN, MS français 146, fol. 1^r detail, 'de torcher Fauvel doucement | Trop i a grant assement' (ll. 33–4). Reproduced by permission of the Bibliothèque nationale de France. 109

Fig. 2. The Beast of the Apocalypse, London, BL, MS Additional 54180, fol 14^v, 'Ceste beste senefie le deable'. Reproduced courtesy of the British Library Board. 114

Konstantinos Gravanis, 'False Religion and Hypocrisy in Signorelli's *Antichrist*'

Fig. 1. Luca Signorelli, *Sermon and Deeds of the Antichrist*, c.1502–4, fresco, San Brizio Chapel, Orvieto Cathedral, Orvieto. Image in the Public Domain on Wikimedia Commons, online at: <https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Luca_Signorelli_-_Sermon_and_Deeds_of_the_Antichrist_-_WGA21202.jpg>, accessed 21 December 2022. 125

Fig. 2. Michael Wohlgemut, 'Sermon of the Antichrist', in Hartmann Schedel, *Liber chronicarum* (Nuremberg, 1493), fol. 262^v, woodcut, Cambridge University Library, Inc.0.A.7.2[888]. Reproduced by permission of the Syndics of Cambridge University Library. 130

Fig. 3. Luca Signorelli, *The Encounter of Dante and Virgil with Count Ugolino and Archbishop Ruggieri*, c.1500–3, drawing, black chalk on paper, 31.2 × 25.6 cm, British Museum, London, Department of Prints and Drawings, inv. 1885,0509.41. Reproduced by permission of the Trustees of the British Museum, London. 141

Fig. 4. Luca Signorelli, *Torments of the Damned*, c.1500–3, fresco, San Brizio Chapel, Orvieto Cathedral, Orvieto. Image in the Public Domain on Wikimedia Commons, online at: <https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Luca_Signorelli_-_The_Damned_-_WGA21220.jpg>, accessed 21 December 2022. 143

Fig. 5. Luca Signorelli, *Four Demons Inspecting a Book*, c.1500–3, drawing, black chalk on paper, 35.5 × 28.4 cm, The Morgan Library and Museum, New York, inv. 1965.15. Photographic credit: The Morgan Library and Museum, New York. 144

Fig. 6. Luca Signorelli, *Signs of the End of the World*, c.1502–4, fresco, San Brizio Chapel, Orvieto Cathedral, Orvieto. Image in the Public Domain on Wikimedia Commons, online at: <https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/File:Luca_signorelli,_cappella_di_san_brizio,_apocalisse_01.jpg>, accessed 21 December 2022. 146

Anna Pravdica, “See sincerity sparkle in thy practice”: Antidotes to Hypocrisy in British Print Sermons, 1640–95’

Fig. 1. Title page of one edition of the sermon collection that included Love’s preaching on sincerity and hypocrisy, 1654. Reproduced by permission of Llyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru / National Library of Wales. 242

Fig. 2. Frequency of ‘sincerity’ and ‘hypocrisy’ proportional to total print output, 1540–1699. 244

Fig. 3. Frequency of ‘sincerity’ and ‘hypocrisy’ in print sermons, 1600–99. 245

Adam Morton, ‘Laughing at Hypocrisy: *The Turncoats* (1711), Visual Culture and Dissent in Early Eighteenth-Century England’

Fig. 1. *The Turncoats* (1711). Reproduced by permission of The British Museum. Copyright of the Trustees of The British Museum. 313

Illustrations

Fig. 2. William Hogarth, *A Harlot's Progress* (1732), plate 3. Reproduced by permission of The British Museum. Copyright of the Trustees of The British Museum.

324