

ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY

volume 57: 2014



SOCIETY OF ARCHITECTURAL HISTORIANS OF GREAT BRITAIN

The Alice Davis Hitchcock Medallion is presented annually to authors of outstanding contributions to the literature of architectural history. A full list of winners since 1959 may be found on the SAHGB website. Recent awards have been:

- 2013: G A Bremner for *Imperial Gothic: Religious Architecture and High Anglican Culture in the British Empire c. 1840-1870*
2012: Richard Fawcett for *The Architecture of the Scottish Medieval Church, 1100-1560*
2011: John Goodall for *The English Castle: 1066-1650*
2010: Mark Girouard for *Elizabethan Architecture: Its Rise and Fall, 1540-1640*
2009: Peter Draper for *The Formation of English Gothic: Architecture and Identity*
2008: Eitan Karol for *Charles Holden Architect, 1887-1960*
2007: David Robinson for *The Cistercians in Wales*
2006: Peter Guillery for *The Small House in Eighteenth-Century London*
2005: Georgia Clarke for *Roman House - Renaissance Palaces*
2004: Kathryn A. Morrison for *English Shops and Shopping*

The Society's Essay Medal is presented annually to the winner of the Society's Essay Competition, the regulations for which are available on the SAHGB website along with a full list of winners since 1982. Recent winners have been:

- | | |
|---------------------------|-------------------------------|
| 2013: Karl Kinsella | 2008: Tristram Bainbridge |
| 2012: No award was made | 2007: James Maxwell Stevenson |
| 2011: Otto Saumarez Smith | 2006: Matthew Whitfield |
| 2010: Jessica Holland | 2005: No award was made |
| 2009: Philip Aspin | 2004: Tom Nickson |

The James Morris Prize is awarded to the best essay received on British Colonial and Post-Colonial Architecture. Winners:

- 2013: Irit Katz

ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY INTERNATIONAL ADVISORY PANEL

The Editorial Team gratefully acknowledges the support of the Architectural History International Advisory Panel, the membership of which is as follows:

- Guido Beltramini (Andrea Palladio Study Centre, Vicenza, Italy)
Maarten Delbeke (University of Ghent, Belgium; Leiden University, The Netherlands)
Eric Fernie (Courtauld Institute of Art, London)
Charles Hind (RIBA Drawings and Archives Collection, London)
Maurice Howard (University of Sussex)
Tim Knox (Fitzwilliam Museum, Cambridge)
Ron Lewcock (University of Queensland, Australia)
Mary McLeod (Columbia University, USA)
Stefan Muthesius (University of East Anglia)
Konrad Ottenheim (Utrecht University, The Netherlands)
Sarah Pearson (independent scholar, formerly of the Royal Commission on Historic Monuments in England)
Alan Powers (independent scholar)
Christine Stevenson (Courtauld Institute of Art, London)
Nancy Stieber (University of Massachusetts, Boston, USA)
Robert Thorne (independent scholar, formerly of Alan Baxter and Associates, London)

Cover image: Chimneys as Classical columns and roofscape at Burghley House
(Photo: P. Henderson)

ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY

*Journal of the Society of Architectural
Historians of Great Britain*

Volume 57: 2014

SOCIETY OF ARCHITECTURAL HISTORIANS OF GREAT BRITAIN

Founded 1956: incorporated 1964

The Society exists to encourage an interest in the history of architecture, to provide opportunities for the exchange and discussion of ideas related to this subject and to publish, in its journal, Architectural History, the results of original research.

OFFICERS AND EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE 2013–14

President: Maurice Howard

Chairman: David Adshead

Past President: Malcolm Airs

Honorary Secretary: Jonathan Kewley

Honorary Treasurer: David Lermon

Honorary Editors: Alistair Fair, David Hemsoll

Honorary Conference Secretaries: Joanne O'Hara, Katie Carmichael

Honorary Events Secretaries: Andrew Martindale, Pete Smith

Honorary Executive Committee Members: Simon Green, Olivia Horsfall Turner, Neil Jackson, Barbara Penner, Matthew Walker

Honorary Minutes Secretary: Lydia Sheldon

Honorary Newsletter Editor: Lee Prosser

Honorary Reviews Editor: Kathryn Morrison

Honorary Education Officer: Julian Holder

Honorary Publicity Officer: Anya Matthews

Honorary Research Register: Kerry Bristol

Honorary Membership Secretary: Matt Gaskin

Honorary Website Manager: Danielle Willkens

ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY EDITORIAL TEAM 2014

Lead Editors: Alistair Fair, David Hemsoll

Deputy Editors: Jocelyn Anderson, Alex Bremner, Judi Loach

All correspondence concerning the Society except applications for membership should be addressed to: Jonathan Kewley, Flat G, 2 Calthorpe Street, London WC1X 0JS, or secretary@sahgb.org.uk

Applications for membership should be sent to: (for individual membership) The Membership Secretary, SAHGB, Heritage House, PO Box 21, Baldock, Herts., SG7 5SH; (for institutional membership) Matt Gaskin, Room AB314, School of Architecture, Oxford Brookes University, Gypsy Lane Campus, Oxford, OX3 0BP; institutions@; alternatively membership can be obtained online, through the SAHGB website, at www.sahgb.org.uk/index.cfm/display_page/membership

Proposals for papers for Architectural History should be e-mailed in the first instance to: David Hemsoll, architecturalhistory@sahgb.org.uk

Correspondence concerning the Society's Newsletter should be addressed to: Lee Prosser, Kensington Palace and Kew Palace, Apt. 25, Hampton Court Palace, Surrey, KT8 9AU.

Books for review in the Society's Newsletter should be sent to: Kathryn Morrison, English Heritage, Brooklands, 24 Brooklands Avenue, Cambridge CB2 8BU, or reviewseditor@sahgb.org.uk

Correspondence concerning purchase of the Society's publications, including printed copies of Architectural History, should be addressed to: outsetservices@gmail.com

copyright © 2014

Society of Architectural Historians of Great Britain and Authors

ISSN: 0066-622X

*Produced by Outset Services Limited
Boston Spa, West Yorkshire*

CONTENTS

ARCHITECTURAL INNOVATION IN EARLY BYZANTINE CYPRUS by Charles Anthony Stewart	1
ARCHITECTURE AND ENVIRONMENT: ST BENET'S HOLM AND THE FASHIONING OF THE ENGLISH MONASTIC GATEHOUSE by Julian Luxford	31
ELIZABETHAN ARCHITECTURE: A VIEW FROM RHETORIC by Lucy Gent	73
AVERLO FORMATO PERFETTAMENTE: BORROMINI'S FIRST TWO YEARS AT THE ROMAN ORATORY by Kerry Downes	109
SERIOUS GOTHIC AND 'DOING THE ANCIENT BUILDINGS': BATTY LANGLEY'S ANCIENT ARCHITECTURE AND 'PRINCIPAL GEOMETRIC ELEVATIONS' by Peter Lindfield	141
THE TEMPORARY HOUSES OF PARLIAMENT AND DAVID BOSWELL REID'S ARCHITECTURE OF EXPERIMENTATION by Henrik Schoenefeldt	175
GEORGE GILBERT SCOTT: A PIONEER OF CONSTRUCTIONAL POLYCHROMY? by Aidan Whelan	217
FREE PLAN FOR THE 1850S: FORGOTTEN IMAGINED ARCHITECTURES FROM MID-CENTURY by Pedro Guedes	239
ΚΑΛΟΙ Κ' ΑΓΑΘΟΙ (<i>THE BEAUTIFUL AND THE GOOD</i>): CLASSICAL SCHOOL ARCHITECTURE AND EDUCATIONAL ELITISM IN EARLY NINETEENTH-CENTURY EDINBURGH by Diane Watters	277
THE PERSISTENCE OF MEDIEVALISM: KENNETH CLARK AND THE GOTHIC REVIVAL by Ayla Lepine	323
'BRUTALISM AMONG THE LADIES': MODERN ARCHITECTURE AT SOMERVILLE COLLEGE, OXFORD, 1947–67 by Alistair Fair	357
GRAEME SHANKLAND: A SIXTIES ARCHITECT-PLANNER AND THE POLITICAL CULTURE OF THE BRITISH LEFT by Otto Saumarez Smith	393

DR CHARLES ANTHONY STEWART is Assistant Professor of Art History at the University of St. Thomas, Houston. His expertise focuses on Late Antique and Early Medieval architectural and sculptural development. Recently he co-authored the book *Cyprus and the Balance of Empires: Art and Archaeology from Justinian I to the Coeur de Lion* (Boston, 2014). The article presented here is based on research he began as a postgraduate student at the University of York, UK. Currently he is researching donjons and the so-called 'palatial areas' of Byzantine fortifications in the eastern Mediterranean.

DR JULIAN LUXFORD is Reader in Art History at the University of St Andrews. Before taking up his current post he completed a PhD on medieval monastic art and architecture at King's College, Cambridge, and held a Junior Research Fellow in the Arts and Humanities at Clare College at the same university. He has published widely on medieval English monastic art and architecture. His publications include *The Art and Architecture of English Benedictine Monasteries, 1300–1540: a Patronage History* (The Boydell Press, 2005, 2007; paperback 2012); *Studies in Carthusian Monasticism in the Late Middle Ages*, *Medieval Church Studies*, 14 (Brepols, 2008) (which he edited); and, related to the current paper, 'The Great Gate of St Augustine's Abbey: Architecture and Context', in *Canterbury: Art and Architecture after 1220*, in A. Bovey (ed.), *British Archaeological Association Conference Transactions*, 35 (Leeds, 2013), pp. 261–75.

LUCY GENT was Senior Lecturer in English at the Polytechnic of North London (now London Metropolitan University) from 1976 to 1988. She is the author of *Picture and Poetry* (1981), co-editor (with Nigel Llewellyn) of *Renaissance Bodies* (1992), and editor of *Albion's Classicism* (1995). She has also written on Marcus Gheeraerts' *Captain Thomas Lee* (in *Aspects of the Visual*, ed. Caroline van Eck and Edward Winters (2005))

PROFESSOR KERRY DOWNES was Professor of the History of Art at the University of Reading until his retirement in 1991. During the course of the last six decades he has produced numerous books and articles on aspects of Early Modern architecture, including major studies of the work of Nicholas Hawksmoor, John Vanbrugh, Christopher Wren, and Francesco Borromini.

DR PETER N. LINDFIELD'S PhD thesis (completed at the University of St Andrews) examined the multi-faceted linkages connecting architectural history and practice with Gothic Revival interiors and furniture in Georgian Britain. In 2012–13 he held a visiting lectureship at the Kunsthochschule, University of Kassel, Germany, and in 2013 contributed to the University of Leicester's Country House MA degree programme. In addition to publishing on medieval and Gothic Revival architecture and applied design, Peter has held two fellowships at Yale University, and in 2013 was the inaugural Dunscombe Colt Fellow in eighteenth-century architecture at the Bodleian Library, University of Oxford. In this capacity he co-organized a symposium on the eighteenth-century Gothic Revival.

AIDAN WHELAN has had a lifelong interest in architectural history. He has been researching George Gilbert Scott for fifteen years after acting as a tour guide at Scott's self-declared 'best work', All Souls, Haley Hill, Halifax. He has published articles in the field of local history and works as a personal development coach near Huddersfield, West Yorkshire. He holds a University of Durham degree and various professional qualifications.

DR PEDRO GUEDES is a senior lecturer at the University of Queensland in Australia, where he completed his PhD on the entry of iron into architecture in the nineteenth century. He read architecture at the University of Cambridge followed by practice and teaching in London at the Architectural Association and the Royal College of Art before emigrating down-under. His current interests include colonial architectures and their embodiment of cross-cultural influences, particularly in warm climates similar to those in which he spent his youth in Mozambique.

DR HENRIK SCHOENEFELDT is a lecturer at the University of Kent's School of Architecture in Canterbury, where he is involved in research, teaching and the development of new curricula in the field of sustainable environmental design. He contributed to the development of the MSc in Architecture and Sustainable Environment through the inclusion of a strand focusing on the reconstruction and analysis of historic environmental principles. Since the completion of his PhD at Cambridge his research has included a study of the Palace of Westminster's historic ventilation system on which this article is based. He is currently a consultant to the Palace of Westminster restoration project, investigating how far the historic system could be re-utilized as part of a sustainable ventilation strategy. Forthcoming publications drawing on this research include a chapter in the book *New Directions in Gothic Revival Studies*, to be published by Leuven University Press.

DIANE WATTERS is an architectural historian who works at the Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland, and teaches at the Scottish Centre for Conservation Studies, University of Edinburgh. A specialist in twentieth-century architecture and conservation in Scotland, she has undertaken a succession of research-based publications for RCAHMS (*Cardross Seminary* [1997], *Home Builders* [1999], *Little Houses* [2006], and *St John's Episcopal Church, Edinburgh* [2008]). She is currently researching the history of Scotland's school architecture.

DR AYL A LEPINE studied Theology and Art History at Oxford and the Courtauld Institute of Art. Following a PhD at the Courtauld on the late Victorian Gothic Revival at sites in Oxford and Cambridge, she was awarded an Andrew W. Mellon Postdoctoral Fellowship to explore the phenomenon of revivalism in Modern art and architecture. A co-edited book, *Revival: Identities, Memories, Utopias* will be published with the Courtauld in 2015. In 2013 she was a Fellow in Religion and the Arts at Yale's Institute of Sacred Music, where she lectured and convened symposia on modern transatlantic medievalism. She is writing a book investigating this phenomenon. Currently a Teaching Associate in the Art History department at the University of Nottingham, she is also a member of the London DAC and a Contributing Historian for the *Architectural Review*.

DR ALISTAIR FAIR is a Chancellor's Fellow in the School of Architecture and Landscape Architecture at the University of Edinburgh, where his research considers aspects of Modern public and institutional architecture. After studying History at Oxford and History of Art at the Courtauld Institute, his Cambridge Ph.D. thesis (2008) examined twentieth-century British theatre architecture. Publications include refereed articles on theatres and hospitals, a co-written book on theatre design (*Geometry and Atmosphere*, Ashgate, 2011), as well as a recent account (*Twentieth Century Architecture*, 11, 2013) of Hugh Casson and Neville Conder's 1950s proposals for the Sidgwick Site in Cambridge. He has lectured in both Oxford and Cambridge on twentieth-century university architecture, and is currently writing a book about post-war British theatre buildings.

OTTO SAUMAREZ SMITH is studying for a PhD at St John's College, Cambridge, funded by the Kemp Scholarship. His doctorate is about city-centre redevelopment schemes of the 1960s. He has also been researching post-war university architecture, which has resulted in an article on Robinson College, Cambridge (*Architectural History*, 2012), and co-editorship of the Twentieth Century Society's recent *Journal 11: Oxford and Cambridge*. He was recently elected Shuffrey Junior Research Fellow in Architectural History at Lincoln College, Oxford, a position he will take up in September 2014.