

PHILOSOPHY  
OF  
SCIENCE

*Official Journal of the Philosophy of  
Science Association*



VOLUME 57, NUMBER 4

**December, 1990**

# PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

(ISSN 0031-8248)

JOURNAL OF THE PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE ASSOCIATION

## EDITORIAL BOARD:

ROBERT E. BUTTS, *Editor-in-Chief*

WILLIAM DEMOPOULOS AND ALISON WYLIE, *Associate Editors*

PETER ACHINSTEIN	GARY GUTTING	THOMAS NICKLES
PETER ASQUITH	IAN HACKING	ILKKA NIINILUOTO
JOHN BEATTY	WILLIAM HARPER	GLENN PEARCE
JEFFREY BUB	MARY HESSE	ALEXANDER ROSENBERG
RICHARD BURIAN	DAVID HULL	MICHAEL RUSE
NANCY CARTWRIGHT	PHILIP KITCHER	KENNETH SCHAFFNER
LINDLEY DARDEN	HENRY KYBURG, JR.	DUDLEY SHAPERE
JOHN EARMAN	LARRY LAUDAN	LAWRENCE SKLAR
ANNE FAGOT	ANDREW LUGG	BRIAN SKYRMS
ARTHUR FINE	PETER MACHAMER	FREDERICK SUPPE
JERRY FODOR	VAUGHN MCKIM	PATRICK SUPPES
MICHAEL FRIEDMAN	DAVID MALAMENT	BAS VAN FRAASSEN
RONALD GIERE	ROBERT MATTHEWS	
CLARK GLYMOUR	JOHN NICHOLAS	

## EDITORIAL ASSISTANT:

Andrea Purvis

## COPY ASSISTANTS:

Philip Catton and Darcy Cutler

## GOVERNING BOARD OF THE ASSOCIATION:

**Thomas S. Kuhn**, President (1990)

**Bas C. van Fraassen**, President-elect (1990)

**Arthur Fine**, Past President (1990)

**John Earman** (1991)

**Philip Kitcher** (1990)

**Michael Friedman** (1990)

**Brian Skyrms** (1990)

**Daniel Garber** (1991)

**Paul Teller** (1990)

**William Harper** (1991)

**William Wimsatt** (1991)

## EXECUTIVE SECRETARY:

**Peter D. Asquith**

MADE AND PRINTED IN THE USA BY  
EDWARDS BROTHERS, INC., ANN ARBOR, MI

---

PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE is published quarterly by the Philosophy of Science Association, 18 Morrill Hall, Department of Philosophy, Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan 48824. 1990 Subscription price \$50.00 U.S.A. (\$55.00 non-U.S.A.) per Volume. Single numbers \$15.00. 1990 Membership dues, which include subscription, \$40.00. Subscription inquiries should be directed to the Executive Secretary. Second-class postage paid at East Lansing, Michigan and at additional mailing offices. © 1990 by the Philosophy of Science Association.

## CONTENTS\*

<b>TWO DOGMAS OF NEO-EMPIRICISM: THE “THEORY-IN-FORMITY” OF OBSERVATION AND THE QUINE-DUHEM THESIS, JOHN D. GREENWOOD</b> . . . . .	553
<b>MOLECULAR BIOLOGY AND THE UNITY OF SCIENCE, HAROLD KINCAID</b> . . . . .	575
<b>PROLEGOMENON TO A PROPER INTERPRETATION OF QUANTUM FIELD THEORY, PAUL TELLER</b> . . . . .	594
<b>AUTONOMY AND QUANTUM PHYSICS: NIETZSCHE, HEIDEGGER AND HEISENBERG, HANS SEIGFRIED</b> . . . . .	619
<b>TWO QUALMS ABOUT FUNCTIONALIST MARXISM, JOEL DICKMAN</b> . . . . .	631
<b>THE IRRELEVANCE OF BOOTSTRAPPING, DAVID CHRISTENSEN</b> . . . . .	644
<b>DISCUSSION: QUANTUM COSMOLOGY AND THE NATURE OF THE UNIVERSE, GERRIT SMITH AND ROBERT WEINGARD</b> . . . . .	663
<b>DISCUSSION: THE “TALLY” ARGUMENT AND THE VALIDATION OF PSYCHOANALYSIS, ROBERT C. RICHARDSON</b> . . . . .	668
<b>DISCUSSION: DARWIN’S LONG AND SHORT ARGUMENTS, MATTI SINTONEN</b> . . . . .	677
<b>DISCUSSION: PROBABILISTIC CAUSALITY: A REJOINER TO ELLERY EELLS, JOHN DUPRÉ</b> . . . . .	690
<b>DISCUSSION: HORWICH, HEMPEL, AND HYPOTHETICO-DEDUCTIVISM, KEN GEMES</b> . . . . .	699
<b>DISCUSSION: MORE ON RUSSELL’S HYPOTHESIS, HILTON HINDERLITER</b> . . . . .	703
<b>CRITICAL NOTICE: GEREON WOLTERS’ <i>MACH I, MACH II, EINSTEIN, UND DIE RELATIVITÄTSTHEORIE. EINE FÄLSCHUNG UND IHRE FOLGEN</i>, ROBERT DiSALLE</b> . . . . .	712
<b>BOOK REVIEWS</b> . . . . .	724
<i>Aristotle on Nature and Living Things: Philosophical and Historical Studies</i> , Allan Gotthelf (editor)—William Wians; <i>Toward a New Philosophy of Biology</i> , Ernst Mayr—Marc Ereshefsky; <i>The Fortunes of Inquiry</i> , Nicholas Jardine—Paul D. Forster; <i>Explaining Science: The Cognitive Approach</i> , Ronald N. Giere—Paul Teller.	

<b>REFEREES FOR <i>PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE</i> .....</b>	<b>733</b>
<b>INDEX TO VOLUME 57 .....</b>	<b>737</b>

This issue of *Philosophy of Science* is the last to appear under the editorship of Robert Butts, who has managed the journal for a decade. His leadership has maintained the journal's high editorial standards and at the same time broadened its coverage to reflect the rapid and still continuing changes in the profession. That combination could not have been achieved without his outstanding judgment, tact, and efficiency. On behalf of the membership, the Governing Board offers him very special thanks.

\*The contents of PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE are utilized in compiling the following bibliographic sources: *Arts and Humanities Citation Index*; *Biological Abstracts*; *Bulletin Signalétique 519*; *Current Contents/Arts and Humanities*; *Current Contents/Social and Behavioral Sciences*; *Current Index to Statistics*; *Humanities Index*; *Index to Book Reviews in the Humanities*; *Isis Critical Bibliography*; *Language & Language Behavior Abstracts*; *Mathematical Reviews*; *Philosopher's Index*; *Philosophie*; *Psychological Abstracts*; *Repertoire Bibliographique de la Philosophie*; *Social Sciences Citation Index*; *Sociological Abstracts*.