

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XI NUMBER 2 1985

## ARTICLES

THE PATIENT WHO REFUSES MEDICAL TREATMENT: A DILEMMA FOR HOSPITALS AND PHYSICIANS Martha Swartz

NURSE PRACTITIONER CHALLENGES TO THE ORTHODOX STRUCTURE OF HEALTH CARE DELIVERY: REGULATION AND RESTRAINTS ON TRADE Karla Kelly

## NOTES AND COMMENTS

*KELLY V. GWINNELL*: SOCIAL HOST LIABILITY—HOW GREAT A BURDEN?

*HECKLER V. CHANEY*: JUDICIAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE REGULATION OF CAPITAL PUNISHMENT BY LETHAL INJECTION

## MEDICOLEGAL REFERENCE LIBRARY

SELECTED RECENT COURT DECISIONS

SELECTED BOOK RELEASES

PUBLISHED BY THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE AND THE  
BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE is published in the Spring, Summer, Fall, and Winter by the American Society of Law & Medicine and the Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by the joint American Society of Law & Medicine/Boston University School of Law Editorial Policy Committee. Statements of fact and opinion are the responsibility of the authors alone, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, the Society, or the law school.

The Editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts and requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, 765 Commonwealth Ave., Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Editorial phone: (617) 353-2912.

Business correspondence, including subscription and advertising correspondence, should be addressed to the Executive Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Business phone: (617) 262-4990.

Subscriptions: \$40.00 per year for institutions, and for individuals who are not members of the American Society of Law & Medicine. Foreign subscribers should remit, for a year's subscription, an additional \$15.00 for air mail postage or an additional \$5.00 for surface rate postage.

Missing copies of the JOURNAL will be sent free of charge to subscribers or members of the Society provided that notice of such claim is received at the Society's subscription office within one month of receipt of the next issue published. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular issue price of \$10.

Members of the American Society of Law & Medicine receive a free subscription to the JOURNAL as part of their dues (\$85.00 for 1984). Information concerning membership is available from the Executive Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Society phone: (617) 262-4990.

Articles in the JOURNAL are indexed in *Index to Legal Periodicals*, *Legal Contents*, *Index Medicus*, *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*, and *Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts*.

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445).  
ISSN 0098-8588.

U.S. postage paid at Worcester, Massachusetts, in accordance with Permit No. 5 (Nonprofit Org.).

#### **ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS OF BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW**

JOHN R. SILBER, B.A., M.A., PH.D., LL.D., (hon.), LH.D., (hon.), *President, University*

*Professor and Professor of Philosophy and Law*

WILLIAM SCHWARTZ, M.A., J.D., *Dean and Professor of Law*

COLIN S. DIVER, B.A., LL.B., *Associate Dean*

BARBARA LAUREN, B.A., J.D., PH.D., *Assistant Dean*

LOIS H. KNIGHT, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*

CATHERINE TIERNY, B.A., M.S., *Interim Director, Law Library*

MARGARET D. HAGOPIAN, A.C.S., *Executive Assistant to the Dean*

#### **OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE**

AUBREY MILUNSKY, M.D., *President*

ANGELA R. HOLDER, LL.M., *President-Elect*

MARGARET A. SOMERVILLE, A.U.A., LL.B., D.C.L., *Secretary*

JANE L. GREENLAW, R.N., M.S., J.D., *Treasurer*

ELLIOT L. SAGALL, M.D., *Founder and First President*

THOMAS E. CARGILL, JR., *Immediate Past President*

JO ANN KANTOROWITZ, J.D., M.T.S., *Acting Executive Director*

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

## BOARD of EDITORS

### FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

**Frances H. Miller, J.D.**  
Boston University School of Law

### EDITOR-IN-CHIEF EMERITUS AND FOUNDER

**John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.**

### EXECUTIVE EDITOR

**Jo Ann Kantorowitz, J.D., M.T.S.**

### EDITORS

**Michael Baram, J.D.**  
Boston University Schools of Law  
and Public Health

**Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.**  
Boston College Law School

**Henry Beyer, J.D.**  
Boston University School of Law

**Patrick R. Carroll, J.D.**  
Senior Vice Pres. & Legal Counsel,  
Massachusetts Hospital Association

**William J. Curran, LL.M., S.M. Hyg.**  
Harvard University School of  
Public Health

**Lee J. Dunn, Jr., J.D., LL.M.**  
Shagory & Shagory  
Boston, Massachusetts

**Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D.**  
Harvard Medical School

**Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.**  
Texas A&M University  
College Station, Texas

**Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.**  
Duke University School of Law

**Nathan Hershey, J.D.**  
University of Pittsburgh  
Graduate School of Public Health

**Bernard D. Hirsh, J.D.**  
General Counsel  
American Medical Association

**Edward E. Hollowell, J.D.**  
Hollowell & Silverstein  
Raleigh, North Carolina

**Richard G. Huber, J.D.**  
Dean, Boston College Law School

**Jay Katz, M.D.**  
Yale Law School

**Sylvia A. Law, J.D.**  
New York University School of Law

**Peter Martin, J.D.**  
Dean, Cornell Law School

**Aubrey Milunsky, MB.B.Ch., D.Sc.,  
F.R.C.P., D.C.H.**  
Boston University School of Medicine

**Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.**  
University of Medicine and Dentistry  
of New Jersey

**Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.**  
Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida  
Jacksonville, Florida

**Honorable Max Rosenn**  
United States Court of Appeals for the  
Third Circuit

**Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.**  
Founder, American Society of  
Law & Medicine  
Harvard Medical School

**William Schwartz, J.D., M.A.**  
Dean, Boston University School of Law

**E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.**  
New York Law School

**Margery W. Shaw, M.D., J.D.**  
Director, Medical Genetics Center  
University of Texas at Houston

**Robert B. Shira, D.D.S.**  
Dean, Tufts University School of  
Dental Medicine

**Arthur F. Southwick, J.D., M.B.A.**  
Grad. Sch. of Business Administration  
University of Michigan

**David G. Warren, J.D.**  
Duke University

**Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.**  
Director, Pittsburgh Institute of Legal  
Medicine

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XI NUMBER 2 1985

BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW  
STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS

**EDITOR-IN-CHIEF**

Abby B. Wayne

**EXECUTIVE EDITOR**

Catherine Butler

**MANAGING EDITOR**

Michael A. Berkowitz

**PROJECTS EDITOR**

Stephen Filler

**CASE & NOTE EDITORS**

John Arbab  
Bill Bogdan  
Greg Chafee  
Steve Golub  
Jennifer Goodnow  
Linda Gorby  
Ellen Holzman  
Anne Murphy

**ARTICLES EDITORS**

Edward Gelles  
Mark Gregory  
David M. Levine  
Michele Stolls  
Bruce Todesco

**THIRD YEAR EDITORS**

Brian Bosch  
James Burton  
Lincoln Briggs  
Timothy Caron  
Elizabeth Cohen  
Donna DeSisto  
Kevin Donnelly

Eric Gouvin  
Cynthia Greco  
Joe Jacobson  
Gary Kessler  
Paul Kleinman  
Jeff Knisley  
Laurence Moelis  
Lynn Norman

Frederic Pratt  
Rosalind Rowen  
Joseph Simon  
Ellen Tepperman  
Robert Treat  
Douglas Warner  
Jordan Yospe

**MEMBERS**

Bruce Bagdasarian  
Deborah Barnard  
Seth W. Brewster  
David A. Bunis  
Scott Caplan-Cotenoff  
John Catino  
Margaret Daley  
Lawrence DiGiammarino  
Leslie Demaree  
Steven Ellis  
Helaine C. Fisher  
Laura B. Frankel

Christopher Genther  
Alan Gordee  
Nicholas S. Guerrero  
Gregg A. Hand  
David C. Harlow  
Daniel R. Holland  
Jonathan M. Joseph  
Tracey Kammerer  
Gregg Kander  
James Kaufman  
Dina Khajezadeh  
Kenneth Lench  
Nina Lubell

Lois R. Lupica  
Peter J. Martin  
Paul McDowell  
Jeffrey S. Perlstein  
Dixon Pike  
John C. Re  
Shari Ann Rivkind  
Carolyn Rosenthal  
Carolyn Shuko  
Peter Silverman  
Scott Sinrich  
Gary Tischler

**PUBLICATIONS ASSISTANT**

Kathryn M. Gavigan

**FACULTY ADVISOR**

Frances H. Miller

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XI NUMBER 2 1985

## ARTICLES

- |  |     |               |
|--|-----|---------------|
| THE PATIENT WHO REFUSES<br>MEDICAL TREATMENT: A<br>DILEMMA FOR HOSPITALS AND<br>PHYSICIANS   | 147 | Martha Swartz |
| NURSE PRACTITIONER<br>CHALLENGES TO THE<br>ORTHODOX STRUCTURE OF<br>HEALTH CARE DELIVERY:<br>REGULATION AND RESTRAINTS<br>ON TRADE | 195 | Karla Kelly   |

Copyright 1986 by the American Society of Law & Medicine, Inc. and the Boston University School of Law. All or any part of materials appearing in the Journal may not be republished without the express written consent of the Editor-in-Chief.

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XI NUMBER 2 1985

## NOTES AND COMMENTS

*Kelly v. Gwinnell*: Social Host Liability—How Great a Burden? 229

*Heckler v. Chaney*: Judicial and Administrative Regulation of Capital Punishment by Lethal Injection 251

## MEDICOLEGAL REFERENCE LIBRARY

SELECTED RECENT COURT DECISIONS 279

Federal Preemption—Blood Donor Policy—*Hillsborough County, Florida v. Automated Medical Laboratories, Inc.*

Federal Preemption—Mental Health Benefits—*Metropolitan Life Insurance Co. v. Massachusetts*

Handicapped Minors—Education—*Parks v. Pavkovic*

Medical Licensing Boards—Immunity from Civil Rights Actions—*Manion v. Michigan Board of Medicine*

Rehabilitation Act of 1973—Sovereign Immunity—*Atascadero State Hospital v. Scanlon*

SELECTED BOOK RELEASES 289

Copyright 1986 by the American Society of Law & Medicine, Inc. and the Boston University School of Law. All or any part of materials appearing in the Journal may not be republished without the express written consent of the Editor-in-Chief.