

THE BULLETIN OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC

Edited by

Laurent Bienvenu, *Managing Editor*

Matthias Baaz Ali Enayat

James Cummings Leonid Libkin

Paola D'Aquino Øystein Linnebo

Peter Dybjer

Reviews Editors

Clinton Conley, *Managing Editor for Reviews*

Mark van Atten Bernard Linsky

Benno van den Berg Antonio Montalbán

Thomas Colcombet Rahim Moosa

Samuel Coskey Christian Retoré

Bradd Hart Nam Trang

Thesis Abstracts Editor

Christian Rosendal

VOLUME 25 • NUMBER 3 • SEPTEMBER 2019 • ISSN 1079-8986

Copyright © 2019 by the Association for Symbolic Logic. All rights reserved.
Reproduction by photostat, photo-print, microfilm, or like process by permission only.



PUBLISHED BY CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS FOR
AND ON BEHALF OF THE ASSOCIATION OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC.

The BULLETIN, the JOURNAL and the REVIEW OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC are the official organs of the Association for Symbolic Logic, an international organization for furthering research in logic and the exchange of ideas among mathematicians, computer scientists, linguists, and others interested in this field. The BULLETIN encourages submissions of *Articles* and *Communications* in all areas of logic, including mathematical or philosophical logic, logic in computer science or linguistics, the history or philosophy of logic, and applications of logic to other fields. It also encourages the submissions of abstracts for doctoral level theses in logic. The BULLETIN also publishes reviews of publications in logic.

Editors

Laurent Bienvenu (Managing Editor), CNRS & Université de Bordeaux, LaBRI, 351 cours de la Libération, 33405 Talence, France

laurent.bienvenu@computability.fr

Matthias Baaz, Institute for Discrete Mathematics and Geometry, Vienna University of Technology, Weidner hauptstrasse 8-10, 1040 Vienna, Austria

baaz@logic.at

James Cummings, Department of Mathematical Sciences, Carnegie Mellon University, Wean Hall 6113, Pittsburgh, PA 15213, USA

jcummings@andrew.cmu.edu

Paola D'Aquino, Department of Mathematics and Physics, Università della Campania "L. Vanvitelli", viale Lincoln 5, Caserta 81100, Italy

paola.daquino@unia2.it

Peter Dybjer, Department of Computer Science and Engineering, Chalmers University of Technology, SE 412 96 Göteborg, Sweden

peterd@chalmers.se

Ali Enayat, Department of Philosophy, Linguistics, and Theory of Science, University of Gothenburg, Box 200, SE 405 30, Gothenburg, Sweden

ali.enayat@gu.se

Leonid Libkin, Laboratory for Foundations of Computer Science, University of Edinburgh, Informatics Forum, IF 5.33, Crichton Street, Edinburgh, EH8 9AB, UK

libkin@inf.ed.ac.uk

Øystein Linnebo, Department of Philosophy, IFIKK, 0315 Oslo, Norway

oystein.linnebo@ifikk.uio.no

Reviews editors

Clinton Conley (Managing Editor), Department of Mathematical Sciences, Carnegie Mellon University, Pittsburgh, PA 15213, USA, clintonc@andrew.cmu.edu

Mark van Atten mark.vanatten@univ-paris1.fr,

Benno van den Berg bennovdberg@gmail.com,

Thomas Colcombet thomas.colcombet@liafa.univ-paris-diderot.fr,

Samuel Coskey scoskey@boisestate.edu,

Bradd Hart hartb@mcmaster.ca,

Bernard Linsky bernard.linsky@ualberta.ca, Antonio Montalbán antonio@math.berkeley.edu,

Rahim Moosa rmoosa@uwaterloo.ca, Christian Retoré christian.retore@lirmm.fr, and

Nam Trang namtrang35@gmail.com.

Thesis abstracts editor

Christian Rosendal rosendal@math.uic.edu

Articles present topics of broad interest in a way that is accessible to a large audience. They can be purely expository, survey, or historical articles or they may contain, in addition, new ideas or results or new approaches to old ones.

Communications should be announcements of important new results and ideas in any aspect of logic; they may be short papers in their final form or preliminary announcements (extended abstracts, position papers) of longer, full papers that will be published elsewhere. In any case, they should include, in addition to a description of the new results or ideas, enough history, background, and explanation to make the significance of the work apparent to a wide audience. *Communications* will be quickly refereed and published within six months of the submission of final version.

To submit *Articles* or *Communications* please follow the procedure described at <http://www.aslonline.org/journals-bulletin-guide.html>

To submit *Thesis Abstracts* please follow the procedure described at <http://aslonline.org/LogicThesisAbstracts.html>

Books for review in the BULLETIN should be sent to **ASL, Department of Mathematics, University of Connecticut, 341 Mansfield Road, U-1009, Storrs, CT 06269-1009, USA.**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ARTICLES

Large cardinals beyond choice, by JOAN BAGARIA, PETER KOELLNER, AND W. HUGH WOODIN.....	283
Model theory and machine learning, by HUNTER CHASE AND JAMES FREITAG.....	319
Eta-rules in Martin-Löf type theory, by ANSTEN KLEV.....	333

REVIEWS

N. Francez, <i>Proof-theoretic semantics</i> Reviewed by DAVIDE CATTÀ.....	360
-------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

Association for Symbolic Logic 2019 Winter Meeting, Baltimore Convention Center, Baltimore, MD, USA, January 18–19, 2019...363	
Association for Symbolic Logic 2019 Winter Meeting, The Westin Denver Downtown, Denver, Colorado, USA, February 21–22, 2019.....	372
2019 North American Annual Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, City University of New York Graduate Center, New York, New York, USA, May 20–23, 2019.....	381
From Permutation Groups to Model Theory, Edinburgh, UK, September 17–21, 2018.....	413
Hilbert–Bernays Summer School on Logic and Computation 2018, Göttingen, Germany, July 22–28, 2018.....	414
Cantor Meets Robinson, Campinas, Brazil, December 12–15, 2018.....	415
Thirteenth International Conference on Computability, Complexity and Randomness (CCR 2018), Santiago, Chile, December 17–21, 2018.....	416
Syntax Meets Semantics (SYSMICS 2019), Amsterdam, The Netherlands, January 21–25, 2019.....	417
Ph.D.s in Logic XI 2019, Bern, Switzerland, April 24–26, 2019.....	418
ACM/IEEE Symposium on Logic in Computer Science (LICS 2019), Vancouver, Canada, June 24–27, 2019.....	419
12th Panhellenic Logic Symposium (PLS 12, 2019), Anogeia, Crete, Greece, June 26–30, 2019.....	420
26th Workshop on Logic, Language, Information, and Computation (WoLLIC 2019), Utrecht, the Netherlands, July 2–5, 2019.....	421
Notices.....	423