

# THE REVIEW OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC

## **Edited by**

Sean Walsh, *Coordinating Editor*

Andrew Bacon

Walter Dean

Fernando Ferreira

Salvatore Florio

Hans Halvorson

Simon Huttegger

Juliette Kennedy

Wilfried Sieg

Jamie Tappenden

**VOLUME 13 • NUMBER 1 • MARCH 2020 • ISSN 1755-0203**

Copyright © 2020 by the Association for Symbolic Logic. All rights reserved.  
Reproduction by photostat, photo-print, microfilm, or like process by permission only.



PUBLISHED QUARTERLY BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC, INC.  
WITH SUPPORT FROM INSTITUTIONAL MEMBERS.

# **THE REVIEW OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC**

## **Coordinating Editor**

Sean Walsh

*Department of Philosophy, University of California, Los Angeles*

## **Editors**

Andrew Bacon

*Department of Philosophy  
University of Southern California*

Walter Dean

*Department of Philosophy  
University of Warwick*

Fernando Ferreira

*Department of Mathematics  
University of Lisbon*

Salvatore Florio

*Department of Philosophy  
University of Birmingham*

Hans Halvorson

*Department of Philosophy  
Princeton University*

Simon Huttegger

*Department of Logic and Philosophy  
of Science  
University of California, Irvine*

Juliette Kennedy

*Department of Mathematics  
and Statistics  
University of Helsinki*

Wilfried Sieg

*Department of Philosophy  
Carnegie Mellon University*

Jamie Tappenden

*Department of Philosophy  
University of Michigan*

## **Advisory Board**

Maria Aloni

*Department of Philosophy and Institute  
for Logic, Language and Computation  
University of Amsterdam*

Roy Cook

*Department of Philosophy and Minnesota  
Center for Philosophy of Science  
University of Minnesota*

J. Michael Dunn

*Departments of Computer Science  
and Philosophy  
Indiana University*

Richard Kimberly Heck

*Department of Philosophy  
Brown University*

Geoffrey Hellman

*Department of Philosophy  
University of Minnesota*

Elaine Landry

*Department of Philosophy  
University of California, Davis*

Bernard Linsky

*Department of Philosophy  
University of Alberta*

Penelope Maddy

*Department of Logic and Philosophy  
of Science  
University of California, Irvine*

Edwin Mares

*School of History, Philosophy, Political  
Science & International Relations  
Victoria University of Wellington*

Rohit Parikh

*Department of Computer  
and Information Science Brooklyn College,  
City University of New York*

Greg Restall

*Department of Philosophy  
University of Melbourne*

Stewart Shapiro

*Department of Philosophy  
Ohio State University*

Gila Sher

*Department of Philosophy  
University of California, San Diego*

Achille C. Varzi

*Department of Philosophy  
Columbia University*

Rineke Verbrugge

*Institute of Artificial Intelligence  
University of Groningen*

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Syllogistic Logic with Cardinality Comparisons, on Infinite Sets LAWRENCE S. MOSS AND SELÇUK TOPAL .....	1
Motivated Proofs: What They Are, Why They Matter and How to Write Them REBECCA LEA MORRIS .....	23
Modularity in Mathematics JEREMY AVIGAD .....	47
A Recovery Operator for Nontransitive Approaches EDUARDO ALEJANDRO BARRIO, FEDERICO PAILOS AND DAMIAN SZMUC .....	80
Formal Representations of Dependence and Groundedness EDOARDO RIVELLO .....	105
The Peripatetic Program in Categorical Logic: Leibniz on Propositional Terms MARKO MALINK AND ANUBAV VASUDEVAN .....	141
Mechanizing <i>Principia Logico-Metaphysica</i> in Functional Type-Theory DANIEL KIRCHNER, CHRISTOPH BENZMÜLLER AND EDWARD N. ZALTA .....	206

**Subscription Information:** *Review of Symbolic Logic* (ISSN 1755-0203) is published quarterly in the months of March, June, September and December by Cambridge University Press for the Association for Symbolic Logic, 341 Mansfield Road, U-1009, Storrs, CT 06269-1009. Application to mail at Periodicals Postage Prices is pending at Storrs, CT. Annual subscription rates for Volume 13 (2020): Institutional subscription rates, print and online: US \$1221.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £768.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription rates, online only: US \$1048.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £659.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription rates, print only: US \$1188.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £740.00 + VAT elsewhere. Individual subscription rates, online only: US \$252.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £158.00 + VAT elsewhere. Individual subscription rates, print only: US \$284.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £158.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription correspondence should be sent to: Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006, USA, for customers in the USA, Canada, or Mexico. Customers elsewhere should contact: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to: **Association for Symbolic Logic, c/o Journals Customer Services Department, Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006, USA, USmemberservices@cambridge.org.**

**Association for Symbolic Logic.** Individual Members of the Association for Symbolic Logic receive a print subscription to *The Review of Symbolic Logic* as a benefit of membership. Requests for information, applications for membership, orders for back volumes, business correspondence, and notices and announcements for publication in the *The Bulletin of Symbolic Logic* should be sent to the Secretary-Treasurer of the Association: **ASL, Department of Mathematics, University of Connecticut, 341 Mansfield Road, U-1009, Storrs, CT 06269-1009, USA.** The email address of the Association's business office is [asl@uconn.edu](mailto:asl@uconn.edu). The ASL website is located at <http://www.aslonline.org>. Links from that site provide further information on the *Review* and on submitting papers for publication.

**Coordinating Editor:** Sean Walsh, Department of Philosophy, University of California, Los Angeles, 398 Dodd Hall, Los Angeles, CA 90095-1451, USA. Email: [walsh@ucla.edu](mailto:walsh@ucla.edu).

**Copyright:** All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopy, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Photocopying information for users in the U.S.A.: Copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance per article is paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying. General enquiries from the USA, Mexico, and Canada should be addressed to the New York office of Cambridge University Press <http://www.cambridge.org/us/information/rights/contacts/newyork.htm>; general enquiries from elsewhere should be addressed to the Cambridge office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/cambridge.htm>; permission enquiries from Australia and New Zealand should be addressed to the Melbourne office [http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts\\_melbourne.htm](http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts_melbourne.htm); enquiries regarding Spanish-language translation rights (only) should be addressed to the Madrid office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/madrid.htm>

Copyright © Association for Symbolic Logic, 2020