

# ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY

*volume 55: 2012*



## SOCIETY OF ARCHITECTURAL HISTORIANS OF GREAT BRITAIN

*The Alice Davis Hitchcock Medallion is presented annually to authors of outstanding contributions to the literature of architectural history. A full list of winners since 1959 may be found on the SAHGB website. Recent awards have been:*

- 2011: John Goodall for *The English Castle: 1066-1650*
- 2010: Mark Girouard for *Elizabethan Architecture: Its Rise and Fall, 1540-1640*
- 2009: Peter Draper for *The Formation of English Gothic: Architecture and Identity*
- 2008: Eitan Karol for *Charles Holden Architect, 1887-1960*
- 2007: David Robinson for *The Cistercians in Wales*
- 2006: Peter Guillery for *The Small House in Eighteenth-Century London*
- 2005: Georgia Clarke for *Roman House - Renaissance Palaces*
- 2004: Kathryn A. Morrison for *English Shops and Shopping*
- 2003: Nicola Coldstream for *Medieval Architecture*
- 2002: Mark Wilson Jones for *Principles of Roman Architecture*

*The Society's Essay Medal is presented annually to the winner of the Society's Essay Competition, the regulations for which are available on the SAHGB website along with a full list of winners since 1982. Recent winners have been:*

- |                               |                         |
|-------------------------------|-------------------------|
| 2011: Otto Saumarez Smith     | 2006: Matthew Whitfield |
| 2010: Jessica Holland         | 2005: No award was made |
| 2009: Philip Aspin            | 2004: Tom Nickson       |
| 2008: Tristram Bainbridge     | 2003: James Weeks       |
| 2007: James Maxwell Stevenson | 2002: Alex Bremner      |

## ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY INTERNATIONAL ADVISORY PANEL

The Editorial Team gratefully acknowledges the support of the Architectural History International Advisory Panel, the membership of which is as follows:

- Guido Beltrami (Andrea Palladio Study Centre, Vicenza, Italy)
- Maarten Delbeke (University of Ghent, Belgium; Leiden University, The Netherlands)
- Eric Fernie (Courtauld Institute of Art, London)
- Charles Hind (RIBA Drawings and Archives Collection, London)
- Maurice Howard (University of Sussex)
- Tim Knox (Soane Museum, London)
- Ron Lewcock (University of Queensland, Australia)
- Mary McLeod (Columbia University, USA)
- Stefan Muthesius (University of East Anglia)
- Konrad Ottenheim (Utrecht University, The Netherlands)
- Sarah Pearson (independent scholar, formerly of the Royal Commission on Historic Monuments in England)
- Alan Powers (University of Greenwich)
- Christine Stevenson (Courtauld Institute of Art, London)
- Nancy Stieber (University of Massachusetts, Boston, USA)
- Robert Thorne (Alan Baxter and Associates, London)

Cover image: *Kashmir House, Prithviraj Road, Delhi, by Lutyens and George, 1927-29: main entrance. Photographed by Penelope Chetwode, c. 1931 (Photograph supplied by Gavin Stamp)*

# ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY

*Journal of the Society of Architectural  
Historians of Great Britain*

*Volume 55: 2012*

SOCIETY OF ARCHITECTURAL HISTORIANS OF GREAT BRITAIN

Founded 1956: incorporated 1964

*The Society exists to encourage an interest in the history of architecture, to provide opportunities for the exchange and discussion of ideas related to this subject and to publish, in its journal, Architectural History, significant source material and the results of original research.*

OFFICERS AND EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE 2011–12

*President:* Malcolm Airs

*Chairman:* Kathryn Morrison

*Past President:* Frank Kelsall

*Honorary Secretary:* Simon Green

*Honorary Treasurer:* David Lerman

*Honorary Editor:* Alistair Fair

*Honorary Conference Secretaries:* Olivia Horsfall Turner, Libby Wardle

*Honorary Events Secretaries:* Andrew Martindale, Pete Smith

*Honorary Executive Committee Members:* Joanne O'Hara, Caroline Stanford, Neil Jackson, Barbara Penner

*Honorary Newsletter Editor:* Lee Prosser

*Honorary Reviews Editor:* Kathryn Morrison

*Honorary Education Officer:* Julian Holder

*Honorary Publicity Officer:* Jonathan Kewley

*Honorary Research Register:* Kerry Bristol

*Honorary Membership Secretary:* David McKinstry

*Honorary Website Manager:* Robert Proctor

ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY EDITORIAL TEAM 2012

*Honorary Editor:* Alistair Fair

*Deputy Editors:* David Hemsoll, Judi Loach

*Assistant Editors:* Jocelyn Anderson, John Schofield

*All correspondence concerning the Society except applications for membership should be addressed to: Simon Green, RCAHMS, 16 Bernard Terrace, Edinburgh EH8 9NX, or [secretary@sahgb.org.uk](mailto:secretary@sahgb.org.uk)*

*Applications for membership should be sent to: (for individual membership) The Membership Secretary, SAHGB, Heritage House, PO Box 21, Baldock, Herts., SG7 5SH; (for institutional membership) David McKinstry, 6 Fitzroy Square, London W1T 5DX; alternatively membership can be obtained online, through the SAHGB website, at [www.sahgb.org.uk/index.cfm/display\\_page/membership](http://www.sahgb.org.uk/index.cfm/display_page/membership)*

*Proposals for papers for Architectural History should be e-mailed in the first instance to: Dr Alistair Fair, [architecturalhistory@sahgb.org.uk](mailto:architecturalhistory@sahgb.org.uk)*

*Correspondence concerning the Society's Newsletter should be addressed to:*

*Lee Prosser, Kensington Palace and Kew Palace, Apt. 25, Hampton Court Palace, Surrey, KT8 9AU.*

*Books for review in the Society's Newsletter should be sent to:*

*Kathryn Morrison, English Heritage, Brooklands, 24 Brooklands Avenue, Cambridge CB2 8BU, or [reviewseditor@sahgb.org.uk](mailto:reviewseditor@sahgb.org.uk)*

*Correspondence concerning purchase of the Society's publications, including printed copies of Architectural History, should be addressed to: [outsetservices@gmail.com](mailto:outsetservices@gmail.com)*

copyright © 2012

Society of Architectural Historians of Great Britain and Authors

ISSN: 0066-622X

*Produced by Outset Services Limited  
Boston Spa, West Yorkshire*

## CONTENTS

THE ENGLISH GATEHOUSE by John Goodall	1
BETWEEN ST BERNARD AND ST FRANCIS: A REASSESSMENT OF THE EXCAVATED CHURCH OF BEAULIEU ABBEY, NICOSIA by Michalis Olympios	25
A FIFTEENTH-CENTURY PLAN OF THE CATHEDRAL OF SEVILLE by Begoña Alonso Ruiz and Alfonso Jiménez Martín	57
BATTLE OF THE STYLES? CLASSICAL AND GOTHIC ARCHITECTURE IN SEVENTEENTH-CENTURY NORTH-EAST ENGLAND by Richard Pears	79
JAMES SMITH AT HAMILTON: A STUDY IN SCOTTISH CLASSICISM by Rebecca Di Mambro	111
BUILDING A MONUMENT: WILLIS, CLARK AND <i>THE ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE</i> by Alexandrina Buchanan	145
VICTORIAN MARKET HALLS, ORNAMENTAL IRON AND CIVIC INTENT by Paul Dobraszczyk	173
ARNOLD MITCHELL (1863–1944): ‘FECUNDITY’ AND ‘VERSATILITY’ IN AN EARLY TWENTIETH-CENTURY ARCHITECT by Clare Sherriff	199
THE ANGLO-INDIAN ARCHITECT WALTER SYKES GEORGE (1881–1962): A MODERNIST FOLLOWER OF LUTYENS by Richard Butler	237
RETHINKING THE TWENTIETH-CENTURY CATHOLIC CHURCH IN BELGIUM: THE INTER-RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN LITURGY AND ARCHITECTURE by Anne-Françoise Morel and Stephanie van de Voorde	269
INSTITUTIONALIZING ENGLISH MODERNISM 1924–33: FROM THE VERS GROUP TO MARS by Elizabeth Darling	299
‘BUILT-IN VARIETY’: DAVID AND MARY MEDD AND THE CHILD-CENTRED PRIMARY SCHOOL, 1944–80 by Geraint Franklin	321
ROBINSON COLLEGE, CAMBRIDGE, AND THE TWILIGHT OF A COLLEGIATE MODERNISM, 1974–81 by Otto Saumarez Smith	369



## NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

DR JOHN GOODALL is Architectural Editor of the weekly magazine *Country Life*. His doctoral thesis was published in 2001 as *God's House at Ewelme. Life, Architecture and Devotion in a Fifteenth-Century Almshouse*, and won the Royal Historical Society Whitfield Prize. John previously worked as a Senior Properties Historian at English Heritage, helping to launch the new Red Guide series of site guidebooks. In 2011, he published *The English Castle: 1066-1650*, which has won awards including the Society of Architectural Historians of Great Britain's Alice Davis Hitchcock Medallion. John is a Fellow of the Society of Antiquaries of London, and sits on the Fabric Advisory Committees of St George's Chapel, Windsor Castle, and St Albans Cathedral.

DR MICHALIS OLYMPIOS studied History and Archaeology at the University of Athens before undertaking his M.A. and Ph.D. at the Courtauld Institute of Art. His PhD, completed in 2010, examined Gothic architecture in Lusignan Cyprus in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries. His main research interests lie in the field of medieval architectural history and material culture in the Latin East as well as in western Europe. He has been Lecturer in the History of Western Art at the Department of History and Archaeology of the University of Cyprus since 2011.

DR BEGOÑA ALONSO RUIZ is Professor in the History of Art at the University of Cantabria, Spain. Her research has focussed on the architectural history of the Kingdom of Castile in the late medieval and early modern periods, considering in particular masonry, patronage and typologies, on all of which she has published extensively.

DR ALFONSO JIMÉNEZ MARTÍN is a specialist in the architectural history of Seville Cathedral and was awarded the 2002 National Prize of Restoration for his work. He has for many years been Professor in the Technical School of Architecture at the University of Seville, Spain.

RICHARD PEARS is a librarian at Durham University Library and a Vice-President of the Society of Antiquaries of Newcastle upon Tyne. He is completing his Ph.D. thesis on the architect William Newton (1730-98) at Newcastle University.

REBECCA DI MAMBRO recently completed a degree in History of Art at the University of Cambridge and is interested in seventeenth-century Scottish architecture.

DR ALEXANDRINA BUCHANAN is Lecturer in Archive Studies at the University of Liverpool. She has a B.A. in History and History of Art, an M.Sc. in the History of Modern Architecture from the Bartlett, and a Ph.D. from University College London. Her thesis, entitled 'Robert Willis (1800-1875)' has been substantially reworked for publication by Boydell and Brewer in 2013. As Munby Fellow in Bibliography at the University of Cambridge (1996-97) she undertook a catalogue of the Willis archive, after which she completed a Diploma in Archives and Records Management from the University of London. Her research in architectural history explores the study, reception and preservation of medieval architecture and art in the post-medieval period and its representation within textual, oral and display cultures.

DR PAUL DOBRASZCZYK is a Leverhulme Early Career Research Fellow at the University of Manchester, working on a two-year project researching the use of ornamental cast iron in Victorian architecture. His research interests broadly cover visual culture in the nineteenth century, including the urban underground, print culture, industrial architecture and ruins. His first book, *Into the Belly of the Beast: Exploring London's Victorian Sewers*, was published by Spire in 2009.

DR CLARE SHERRIFF studied Art History at Winchester College of Art (Southampton University) and completed her Ph.D. at Newcastle University in 2004 on the Edwardian Public Library. She works as an independent historian, writing histories of houses and buildings. She is the author of *The Oxford College Barges* (Unicorn Press, 2003) and *Boathouses* (Unicorn Press, 2008).

RICHARD BUTLER is a Gates Scholar and Ph.D. candidate in the Department of History of Art at the University of Cambridge. He is researching a history of public architecture in Ireland from the Act of Union (1801) to the Great Famine (1845-52). A paper on Walter Sykes George's archaeological work will be presented at the *Byzantium and British Heritage* conference in London in September 2013. He also organised an exhibition and conference at the Prince of Wales' Museum in Bombay entitled *Sir Gilbert Scott's Architecture in Bombay*, to mark the bicentenary of Scott's birth.

DR ELIZABETH DARLING is an architectural historian and Senior Lecturer in the Department of History, Philosophy and Religion at Oxford Brookes University. Her research focuses on inter-war British Modernist architecture, with particular interests in its patronage and mediation, and in the work of Wells Coates. Recent publications include a study of the early Modernist interior at Finella, Cambridge (*Journal of British Studies*, 2011), the student journal *Focus* (*Journal of Modern Periodical Studies*, 2012), and a monograph for the RIBA Press, *Wells Coates* (2012).

DR ANNE-FRANÇOISE MOREL is a Post-Doctoral Researcher at the Université-Catholique de Louvain-la-Neuve (Group for Early Modern Cultural Analysis) and Ghent University (Department of Architecture). Her research focuses on architectural representation and religion. She has published articles on Early Modern church consecrations and architectural metaphors. She has spoken on inter-war parish churches in Brussels at international conferences organised by the Society of Architectural Historians (USA, 2006) and the European Association for Urban History (2010).

DR STEPHANIE VAN DE VOORDE graduated from Ghent University in 2005 as a civil engineer-architect; her M.A. dissertation examined the history of twentieth-century Belgian church architecture. She subsequently worked as a Research Assistant at Ghent for the Department of Architecture and Urban Planning, and the Department of Structural Engineering, whilst researching her Ph.D. thesis on building in concrete in Belgium. Having been awarded her Ph.D. in 2011, she is currently undertaking research on the history of architectural education in Belgium at Centrum Vlaamse Architectuurarchieven CVAa (Centre for Flemish Architectural Archives) and Artesis University College, Antwerp.

DR GERAINT FRANKLIN is an architectural historian at English Heritage. He is currently completing a study of later twentieth-century schools.

OTTO SAUMAREZ SMITH is reading for a Ph.D. at St John's College, Cambridge, on British architect-planners of the post-war period. His research is funded by the Kemp Scholarship. He is a regular contributor to *Building Design*, and is currently co-editing the 2013 volume of the Twentieth Century Society's journal, which will focus on twentieth-century buildings in Oxford and Cambridge. In 2011 he won the SAHGB Hawksmoor Essay Medal with an earlier version of the article printed here.