

The  
Journal  
of  
Ecclesiastical  
History



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# The Journal of Ecclesiastical History

## *Editors*

James Carleton Paget, University of Cambridge

Alec Ryrie, University of Durham

## *Assistant Editor*

Christine Linehan, Cambridge

## *Advisory Editorial Board*

David Bebbington, *University of Stirling*

Martin Brett, *University of Cambridge*

Euan Cameron, *Union Theological Seminary, New York*

David d'Avray, *University College, London*

Eamon Duffy, *University of Cambridge*

Alana Harris, *King's College London*

Henrietta Harrison, *University of Oxford*

Judith Herrin, *King's College, London*

Simon Keynes, *University of Cambridge*

Zoe Knox, *University of Leicester*

Diarmaid MacCulloch, *University of Oxford*

David Maxwell, *University of Cambridge*

Miri Rubin, *Queen Mary, University of London*

Julia Smith, *University of Oxford*

Brian Stanley, *University of Edinburgh*

Alexandra Walsham, *University of Cambridge*

Frances Young, *University of Birmingham*

## *International Advisory Board*

J. Kwabena Asamoah-Gyadu, *Trinity Theological Seminary, Ghana*

Joel Cabrita, *Stanford University, USA*

Matthew Champion, *University of Melbourne, Australia*

Tim Cooper, *University of Otago, New Zealand*

Anne Dunan-Page, *University of Aix-Marseille, France*

Renate Dürr, *University of Tübingen, Germany*

Sergei Filatov, *Institute of Eastern Studies, Moscow, Russia*

Robert Frykenberg, *University of Wisconsin-Madison, USA*

Ruth Mazo Karras, *Trinity College, Dublin*

Peter Lake, *Vanderbilt University, USA*

Anne Lester, *Johns Hopkins University, USA*

Harry O. Maier, *Vancouver School of Theology, Canada*

Katherine Massam, *Pilgrim Theological College, Australia*

Claudia Rapp, *University of Vienna, Austria*

Shulamith Shahar, *Tel Aviv University, Israel*

Vera Shevzov, *Smith College, Northampton, MA, USA*

Dorothea Weltecke, *Goethe University, Frankfurt am Main, Germany*

---

Contributions and books for review should be addressed to the Editors, *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, Robinson College, Cambridge CB3 9AN, UK; e-mail [jeh@robinson.cam.ac.uk](mailto:jeh@robinson.cam.ac.uk). The Articles should normally be no longer than 8,000 words including notes. The Editors may be willing to consider longer articles of up to 12,000 words in length, but authors should be aware that this extends only to articles of the highest quality where a longer treatment is essential to the subject and argument. A copy of the *Journal's* style sheet will be sent to intending contributors on application to the Editors.

## **Subscriptions**

*The Journal of Ecclesiastical History* (ISSN 0022-0469) is published quarterly by Cambridge University Press in January, April, July and October. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price, which includes delivery by air where appropriate, plus electronic access to institutional subscribers (but excluding VAT) of volume 73 in 2022 is £573 (US \$986 in USA, Canada and Mexico) for institutions; the print only price for institutions is £550 (US \$953) and £115 (US \$208) for individuals ordering direct from the publishers and certifying that the journal is for their personal use. Single parts are £158 net (US \$274 in USA, Canada and Mexico) plus postage. The electronic only price available to institutional subscribers is £448 (\$774 in USA, Canada and Mexico). EU subscribers (outside the UK) who are not registered for VAT should add VAT at their country's rate. VAT registered members should provide their VAT registration number. Japanese prices for institutions (including ASP delivery) are available from Kinokuniya Company Ltd, P.O. Box 55, Chitose, Tokyo 156, Japan.

Orders, which must be accompanied by payment, may be sent to a bookseller, subscription agent or direct to the publisher: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK; or in the USA, Canada and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006, USA. Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY, and at additional mailing offices.

POSTMASTER: send address changes in USA, Canada and Mexico to *The Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006.

# THE JOURNAL OF ECCLESIASTICAL HISTORY

Volume 73 Number 4

October 2022

## Contents

### ARTICLES

- SHRINE AND IDOL DESTRUCTION IN THREE CAROLINGIAN HAGIOGRAPHIC TEXTS: BY DAVID APPLEBY 697
- SIGN THEORY: SOME SCHOLASTIC ENCOUNTERS WITH 'THE FIFTEEN SIGNS BEFORE THE DAY OF JUDGEMENT': BY ROBERT E. LERNER 720
- JACQUES FOURNIER AND THE POVERTY CONTROVERSY: NEW EVIDENCE FROM A NEGLECTED GOSPEL COMMENTARY: BY IRENE BUENO 737
- THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE AND THE CHANTRIES ACT OF 1545: BY RICHARD REX 765
- GASPAR SANZ'S 'ECOS SAGRADOS DE LA FAMA GLORIOSA DE INNOCENCIO XI' (1681) AND CLERICAL CULTURES OF DIVERSION IN BAROQUE SPAIN: BY MILES PATTENDEN 783
- HERBERT HENSLEY HENSON, J. N. FIGGIS AND THE ARCHBISHOPS' COMMITTEE ON CHURCH AND STATE, 1913–1916: TWO COMPETING VISIONS OF THE CHURCH OF ENGLAND: BY JULIA STAPLETON 814

### NOTE AND DOCUMENT

- ON THE VULGATE OF THOMAS BILNEY: BY COLIN MICHAEL DONNELLY 837
- THE EUSEBIUS ESSAY PRIZE AND THE WORLD CHRISTIANITIES ESSAY PRIZE* 845

### REVIEWS

- BELAYCHE and MASSA (eds), *Mystery cults in visual representation in Graeco-Roman antiquity*: by Hugh Bowden 846
- BÜHNER, *Messianic high Christology. New Testament variants of Second Temple Judaism*: by William Horbury 848
- BIRD and HARROWER (eds), *The Cambridge companion to the Apostolic Fathers*: by James Carleton Paget 850
- LOOKADOO, *The shepherd of Hermas. A literary, historical, and theological handbook*: by Travis W. Proctor 852
- DURST (ed.), *Lettre sur les synods. Hilaire de Poitiers*: by Thomas Graumann 854
- MOTIA, *Imitations of infinity. Gregory of Nyssa and the transformation of mimesis*: by Ryan Gilfeather 855
- CAIN, *Jerome's commentaries on the Pauline epistles and the architecture of exegetical authority*: by Scott G. Bruce 857
- BERKMÜLLER, *Schriftauslegung und Bildgebrauch bei Isidor von Pelusium*: by Madalina Toca 858
- KALAS and VAN DIJK (eds), *Urban developments in late antique and medieval Rome. Revising the narrative of renewal*: by Uta-Renate Blumenthal 861

HEIDUK, HERBERS and LEHNER (eds), <i>Prognostication in the medieval world. A handbook</i> : by Matthias Kaup	863
GASTGEBER, MITSIOU, PREISER-KAPELLER and ZERVAN (eds), <i>A companion to the patriarchate of Constantinople</i> : by Octavian-Adrian Negoită	865
HUMPHREYS, <i>A companion to Byzantine iconoclasm</i> : by Francesca Dell'Acqua	867
STAUNTON, <i>The historians of Angevin England</i> ; BAINTON, <i>History and the written word. Documents, literary, and language in the age of the Angevins</i> : by Nicholas Vincent	869
MACLELLAN, <i>Donations to the Knights Hospitaller in Britain and Ireland, 1291–1400</i> : by Ross S. Kennedy	871
WILLIAMSON, <i>Reliquary tabernacles in fourteenth-century Italy. Image, relic and material culture</i> : by Krisztina Ilko	872
DILLENBURG, LOUTHAN and THOMAS (eds), <i>Print culture and the crossroads. The book and Central Europe</i> : by Sergiej Slavinski	873
LEHMANN, <i>Reformation auf der Kanzel. Luther als Reiseprediger</i> : by Mary Jane Haemig	876
REINHARDT, <i>Martin Luther und die Wittenberger Konkordie (1536)</i> : by Wolf-Friedrich Schäufele	877
REX (ed.), <i>Henry VIII and Martin Luther. The second controversy, 1525–1527</i> : by David Bagchi	879
CLARK, <i>The dissolution of the monasteries. A new history</i> : by Joan Greatrex	880
CHRIST, <i>Biographies of a reformation. Religious change and confessional coexistence in Upper Lusatia, 1520–1635</i> : by Christine Marianne Schoen	881
SALOMONI, <i>Educating the Catholic people. Religious orders and their schools in early modern Italy (1500–1800)</i> : by Matteo Binasco	883
LANGLEY, McMILLAN and NEWTON (eds), <i>The clergy in early modern Scotland</i> : by Jenna M. Schultz	885
KIZENKO, <i>Good for the souls. A history of confession in the Russian Empire</i> : by Shane O'Rourke	887
WESTERKAMP, <i>The passion of Anne Hutchinson. An extraordinary woman, the Puritan patriarchs, and the world they made and lost</i> : by David Hall	889
MANCHESTER, <i>Puritan family and community in the English Atlantic world. Being 'much afflicted with conscience'</i> : by Anna French	891
GREGORY, <i>Catholics during the English revolution, 1642–1660. Politics, sequestration and loyalty</i> : by Lucy Underwood	892
VAN DEN BERG, <i>A forgotten Christian deist. Thomas Morgan</i> : by Diego Lucci	894
LEWIS, <i>Anti-Methodism and theological controversy in eighteenth-century England. The struggle for true religion</i> : by William Gibson	896
SMITH, <i>Rational Dissenters in late eighteenth-century England. 'An ardent desire of truth.'</i> : by R. J. W. Mills	898
SMITH, <i>Mark Twain. Preacher, prophet, and social philosopher</i> : by P. C. Kemeny	899
BYRD, <i>A holy baptism of fire and blood. The Bible and the American Civil War</i> : by David T. Gleeson	900
WILD-WOOD, <i>The mission of Apolo Kivebulaya. Religious encounter and social change in the Great Lakes, c.1865–1935</i> : by J. J. Carney	902
KIRBY, <i>Historians and the Church of England. Religion and historical scholarship, 1870–1920</i> : by Gareth Atkins	904
HIRSCHFELD (ed.), <i>Die katholische Kirche in Ostmitteleuropa nach dem Ersten Weltkrieg. Neuordnung der Staaten - Neuordnung der Seelsorge</i> : by Jeffrey T. Zalar	906
VON WEYHE, <i>Franz Graf von Galen, 1879–1961. Ein »Miles Christianus« im Spannungsfeld zwischen Katholizismus, Adel und Nation</i> : by Martin Menke	908
SMITH, <i>Duty and destiny. The life and faith of Winston Churchill</i> : by Warren Dockter	910
REDDING, <i>One nation under Graham. Apocalyptic rhetoric and American exceptionalism</i> : by Isaac B. Sharp	911

STRASBURG, <i>God's Marshall Plan. American Protestants and the struggle for the soul of Europe.</i> by Markku Ruotsila	912
FEJÉRDY and DIERA (eds), <i>The trial of Cardinal József Mindszenty from the perspective of seventy years. The fate of church leaders in Central and Eastern Europe.</i> by Thomas Lorman	914
RAHEB, <i>The politics of persecution. Middle Eastern Christians in an age of empire;</i> DI GIOVANNI, <i>The vanishing. The twilight of Christianity in the Middle East.</i> by John Binns	915
EARLE and CARNEY, <i>Contesting Catholics. Benedicto Kivunuka and the birth of postcolonial Uganda.</i> by Reuben A. Loffman	918
ATHERSTONE, HUTCHINSON and MAIDEN (eds), <i>Transatlantic charismatic renewal, c.1950–2000:</i> by Jeremy Morris	920
GRIBBEN, <i>Survival and resistance in Evangelical America. Christian reconstruction in the Pacific Northwest.</i> by Jill K. Gill	921
BOOKS RECEIVED	924

#### AUTHORS' ADDRESSES

- David Appleby, Thomas Aquinas College, 10.000 N.Ojai Road, Santa Paula, CA 93060, USA; e-mail: dappleby@thomasaquinas.edu
- Professor Irene Bueno, Dipartimento de Storia Culture Civiltà, Università de Bologna, Piazza S. Giovanni in Monte 2, 40124 Bologna, Italia; e-mail: Irene.bueno@unibo.it
- Colin Michael Donnelly, University of Durham; e-mail: colin.m.donnelly@durham.ac.uk
- Professor Robert E. Lerner, Department of History, Northwestern University, Evanston, IL 60201, USA; e-mail: rlerner@northwestern.edu
- Dr Miles Pattenden, Institute for Religion and Critical Inquiry, Faculty of Theology and Philosophy, Australian Catholic University, Level 4, 250 Victoria Parade, East Melbourne, VIC 3002, Australia; e-mail: miles.pattenden@acu.edu.au
- Dr Richard Rex, Queens' College, Cambridge, CB3 9ET; e-mail: rawr1@cam.ac.uk
- Professor Julia Stapleton, School of Government and International Affairs, Durham University, South End House, South Road, Durham DH1 3TU; e-mail: julia.stapleton@durham.ac.uk