

# RELIGIOUS STUDIES

---

---

VOLUME II

*Editor*

PROFESSOR H. D. LEWIS

*Editorial Board*

PROFESSOR C. F. BECKINGHAM

PROFESSOR F. C. COPLESTON

MR. K. D. D. HENDERSON

PROFESSOR J. HICK

PROFESSOR TREVOR LING

PROFESSOR D. M. MACKINNON

PROFESSOR E. L. MASCALL

PROFESSOR B. MITCHELL

PROFESSOR G. PARRINDER

PROFESSOR NINIAN SMART

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

1975

CAMBRIDGE · LONDON · NEW YORK

*Printed in Great Britain by Unwin Brothers Limited  
The Gresham Press, Old Woking, Surrey*

*and published by the Syndics of the Cambridge University Press  
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP  
Bentley House, 200 Euston Road, London NW1 2DB  
32 East 57th Street, New York, N.Y. 10022*

*© Cambridge University Press 1975*

## CONTENTS LIST AND INDEX

VOL. 11 (1975)

- ABE, MASAO, article: 'Non-being and *mu*', 181  
 'A. C. Ewing—a critical survey of Ewing's recent work', article by John Knox (Jr.), 229
- ADAMS, MARILYN McCORD, article: 'Hell and the God of justice', 433
- ANDERSON, NORMAN, *A Lawyer Among the Theologians*, reviewed by H. P. Owen, 510
- APA PANT, *A Moment in Time*, reviewed by K. D. D. Henderson, 376
- ARCHIMANDRITE SOPHRONY, *The Monk of Mount Athos: Staretz Silouan 1866–1938*, reviewed by E. L. Mascall, 370
- 'Argument from religious experience', article by D. G. Attridge, 335
- Art and the Religious Experience: The 'Language' of the Sacred*, by F. David Martin, reviewed by Eric J. Sharpe, 381
- Asceticism and Eroticism in the Mythology of Śiva*, by Wendy Doniger O'Flaherty, reviewed by Geoffrey Parrinder, 359
- Atheism and Alienation*, by Patrick Masterson, reviewed by Brian A. Davies, 127
- ATTRIDGE, D. G., article: 'The argument from religious experience', 335
- BAHYA BEN JOSEPH IBN PAQUDA, *The Book of Direction to the Duties of the Heart*, reviewed by E. I. J. Rosenthal, 117
- BASTOW, DAVID, review of *Exploring Buddhism*, by Christmas Humphreys, 503  
 — review of *Paths of Life: Preface to a World Religion*, by Charles W. Morris, 378
- BELL, RICHARD H., article: 'Theology as grammar: Is God an object of understanding?', 307
- Bernard Lonergan's Philosophy of God*, by Bernard Tyrrell, reviewed by E. L. Mascall, 506
- 'Bishop Robinson and Christology', article by Robert Butterworth, 73
- Book of Direction to the Duties of the Heart (The)*, by Bahya Ben Joseph Ibn Paquda, reviewed by E. I. J. Rosenthal, 117
- BRICKE, JOHN, article: 'On the interpretation of Hume's *Dialogues*', 1
- BRUCE, F. F., *Jesus and Christian Origins Outside the New Testament*, reviewed by John Ferguson, 373
- BURKE, PATRICK T., *The Reluctant Vision*, reviewed by Michael Pye, 383
- BURKE, T. E., review of *A Philosophical Approach to Religion*, by W. D. Hudson, 352
- BURKILL, T. A., *New Light on the Earliest Gospel: Seven Markan Studies*, reviewed by Sophie Laws, 375
- BUTTERWORTH, ROBERT, article: 'Bishop Robinson and Christology', 73  
 — review article: 'The identity of Jesus', 481
- BYRNE, PETER, review of *Wittgenstein*, by Anthony Kenny, 489
- CAPON, ROBERT FARRAR, *Hunting the Divine Fox: Images and Mystery in Christian Faith*, reviewed by Hugo Meynell, 505
- 'Castaneda and Don Juan: some preliminary observations', article by Stephen J. Reno, 449
- Chance and Necessity—An Essay on the Natural Philosophy of Modern Biology*, by Jacques Monod, reviewed by Wilfrid Hodges, 366
- 'Christian belief—an unchanging essence?', article by Michael Ramsey, 193
- Christianity in the Roman World*, by R. A. Markus, reviewed by Marcel Simon, 502
- CHRYSSIDES, GEORGE D., article: 'Miracles and agents', 319

## CONTENTS LIST AND INDEX

- CLARK, ROBERT E. D., *Science and Christianity—A Partnership*, reviewed by John Habgood, 384
- COCKING, J. M., review of *The Dilemma of Narcissus*, by Louis Lavelle, 360  
*Concept of God (The)*, by Keith Ward, reviewed by Michael Durrant, 490
- CONNELLAN, COLM, *Why Does Evil Exist?* reviewed by John Hick, 494
- COPLESTON, FREDERICK C., *Religion and Philosophy*, reviewed by H. P. Owen, 349  
— review of *Selections*, by Schopenhauer, 360
- ‘Cosmological argument, The’, article by Pheroze S. Wadia, 411
- ‘Criteria of truth in science and theology’, article by Mary Hesse, 385
- CROSS, BREND C., review of *Oxford Apostles—A Character Study of the Oxford Movement*, by Geoffrey Faber, 506
- DAVIES, BRIAN A., review of *Atheism and Alienation*, by Patrick Masterson, 127  
‘Despair and hope of the defeated—Andean Messianism’, article by Friedhelm Hardy, 257
- DEVINE, PHILIP E., article: ‘The religious significance of the ontological argument’, 97  
*Dilemma of Narcissus (The)*, by Louis Lavelle, reviewed by J. M. Cocking, 360  
*Discovery of the Individual 1050–1200*, by Colin Morris, reviewed by D. O. Thomas, 495
- ‘Divine goodness and the problem of evil, The concept of’, article by Stanley G. Kane, 49
- Dramas, Field, and Metaphors: Symbolic Action in Human Society*, by Victor Turner, reviewed by Nancy Tapper, 498
- DURRANT, MICHAEL, review of *The Concept of God*, by Keith Ward, 490
- ECHELBARGER, CHARLES, article: ‘Hume’s tacit atheism’, 19
- Editorial notes, 129
- EDWARDS, DAVID L., *Religion and Change*, reviewed by Illtyd Trethowan, 362  
*Essays in Biblical Culture and Bible Translation*, by Harry M. Orlinsky, reviewed by Louis Jacobs, 377
- Existentialism*, by John Macquarrie, reviewed by Thomas McPherson, 364
- ‘Experience, knowledge and understanding’, article by J. Kitagawa, 201
- Exploring Buddhism*, by Christmas Humphreys, reviewed by David Bastow, 503
- FABER, GEOFFREY, *Oxford Apostles—A Character Study of the Oxford Movement*, reviewed by Brend C. Cross, 506
- FERGUSON, JOHN, review of *Jesus and Christian Origins Outside the New Testament*, by F. F. Bruce, 373
- FINDLAY, J. N., article: ‘Religion and its three paradigmatic instances’, 215
- FIRTH, RAYMOND, *Symbols: Public and Private*, reviewed by C. von Fürer-Haimendorf, 355
- ‘Freedom and God: the meeting of East and West’, article by Frederick Sontag, 421
- FÜRER-HAIMENDORF, C. VON, review of *Mind, Body and Wealth. A Study of Belief and Practice in an Indian Village*, by David Pocock, 357  
— review of *Symbols: Public and Private*, by Raymond Firth, 355
- GALLOWAY, A. D., article: ‘Theology and religious studies—the unity of our discipline’, 157

## CONTENTS LIST AND INDEX

- God and Man*, by Metropolitan Anthony, reviewed by Illyd Trethowan, 362  
GRAINGER, ROGER, *The Language of the Rite*, reviewed by Nancy Tapper, 125  
GUNTON, COLIN, article: 'The knowledge of God according to two process theologians: a twentieth-century gnosticism', 87
- HABGOOD, JOHN, review of *Science and Christianity—A Partnership*, by Robert E. D. Clark, 384  
HARDY, FRIEDHELM, article: 'Despair and hope of the defeated—Andean Messianism', 257  
*Hebrew Humanism of Martin Buber (The)*, by Grete Schaeder, reviewed by Steven T. Katz, 120  
'Hell and the God of justice', article by Marilyn McCord Adams, 433  
HENDERSON, K. D. D., review of *A Moment in Time*, by Apa Pant, 376  
HESSE, MARY, article: 'Criteria of truth in science and theology', 385  
HICK, JOHN (ed.), *Truth and Dialogue, The Relationship between World Religions*, reviewed by Michael Pye, 354  
— review of *Why Does Evil Exist?* by Colin Connellan, 494  
HODGES, WILFRID, review of *Chance and Necessity—An Essay on the Natural Philosophy of Modern Biology*, by Jacques Monod, 366  
HORNE, JAMES R., article: 'Which mystic has the revelation', 283  
HUDSON, W. D., *A Philosophical Approach to Religion*, reviewed by T. E. Burke, 352  
'Hume's *Dialogues*, On the interpretation of', article by John Bricke, 1  
'Hume's tacit atheism', article by Charles Echelbarger, 19  
HUMPHREYS, CHRISTMAS, *Exploring Buddhism*, reviewed by David Bastow, 503  
*Hunting the Divine Fox: Images and Mystery in Christian Faith*, by Robert Farrar Capon, reviewed by Hugo Meynell, 505
- 'Identity of Jesus, The', review article by Robert Butterworth, 481  
'Is necessity necessary?', article by J. A. Martin, Jr., 329
- JACOBS, LOUIS, review of *Essays in Biblical Culture and Bible Translation*, by Harry M. Orlinsky, 377  
— *A Jewish Theology*, reviewed by H. P. Owen, 510  
*Jesus and Christian Origins Outside the New Testament*, by J. L. Stocks, reviewed by John Ferguson, 373  
*Jewish Theology (A)*, by Louis Jacobs, reviewed by H. P. Owen, 510  
JONES, O. R., review of *Philosophy and Religious Belief*, by Thomas McPherson, 487  
*Journey to Gorakhpur*, by John Moffitt, reviewed by Julius Lipner, 123
- KANE, STANLEY G., article: 'The concept of divine goodness and the problem of evil', 49  
KATZ, STEVEN T., review of *The Hebrew Humanism of Martin Buber*, by Grete Schaeder, 120  
KENNY, ANTHONY, *Wittgenstein*, reviewed by Peter Byrne, 489  
KITAGAWA, J., article: 'Experience, knowledge and understanding', 201  
KLEMKE, E. D., article: 'On the alleged inseparability of morality and religion', 37  
'Knowledge of God according to two process theologians: a twentieth-century gnosticism', article by Colin Gunton, 87  
KNOX, JOHN (Jr.), article: 'A. C. Ewing—a critical survey of Ewing's recent work', 229

## CONTENTS LIST AND INDEX

- Language of the Rite (The)*, by Roger Grainger, reviewed by Nancy Tapper, 125
- LAVELLE, LOUIS, *The Dilemma of Narcissus*, reviewed by J. M. Cocking, 360
- LAWS, SOPHIE, review of *New Light on the Earliest Gospel: Seven Marken Studies*, by T. A. Burkill, 375
- Lawyer Among the Theologians (A)*, by Norman Anderson, reviewed by H. P. Owen, 510
- Lindsay Memorial Lectures 1971, and the Swathmore Lecture 1972, by Richard S. Peters, reviewed by T. A. Roberts, 368
- LIPNER, JULIUS, review of *Journey to Gorakhpur*, by John Moffitt, 123
- LONDIS, JAMES J., article: '“Mediated immediacy” in the thought of John E. Smith: a critique', 473
- LONERGAN, BERNARD J. F., *A Second Collection*, reviewed by E. L. Mascall, 509
- MACCORMAC, EARL R., article: 'Scientific and religious metaphors', 401
- MACQUARRIE, JOHN, *Existentialism*, reviewed by Thomas McPherson, 364
- MARKUS, R. A., *Christianity in the Roman World*, reviewed by Marcel Simon, 502
- MARTIN, DAVID F., *Art and the Religious Experience: The ‘Language’ of the Sacred*, reviewed by Eric J. Sharpe, 381
- MARTIN, J. ARTHUR, article: 'What do we study when we study religion?', 467
- MARTIN, J. A. (JR.), article: 'Is necessity necessary?', 329
- MASCALL, E. L., review of *Bernard Lonergan’s Philosophy of God*, by Bernard Tyrrell, 506
- review of *A Second Collection*, by Bernard J. F. Lonergan, 509
- review of *The Monk of Mount Athos: Staretz Silouan 1866–1938*, by Archimandrite Sophrony, 370
- MASTERSON, PATRICK, *Atheism and Alienation*, reviewed by Brian A. Davies, 127
- MCPHERSON, THOMAS, review of *Existentialism*, by John Macquarrie, 364
- *Philosophy and Religious Belief*, reviewed by O. R. Jones, 487
- '“Mediated immediacy” in the thought of John E. Smith: a critique', article by James J. Londis, 473
- METROPOLITAN ANTHONY, *God and Man*, reviewed by Illtyd Trethowan, 362
- MEYNELL, HUGO, review of *Hunting the Divine Fox: Images and Mystery in Christian Faith*, by Robert Farrar Capon, 505
- Mind, Body and Wealth. A Study of Belief and Practice in an Indian Village*, by David Pocock, reviewed by C. von Fürer-Haimendorf, 357
- 'Miracles and agents', article by George D. Chryssides, 319
- MOFFITT, JOHN, *Journey to Gorakhpur*, reviewed by Julius Lipner, 123
- Moment in Time (A)*, by Apa Pant, reviewed by K. D. D. Henderson, 376
- Monk of Mount Athos (The): Staretz Silouan 1866–1938*, by Archimandrite Sophrony, reviewed by E. L. Mascall, 370
- MONOD, JACQUES, *Chance and Necessity—An Essay on the Natural Philosophy of Modern Biology*, reviewed by Wilfrid Hodges, 366
- 'Morality and religion, On the alleged inseparability of', article by E. D. Klemke, 37
- MORRIS, CHARLES W., *Paths of Life: Preface to a World Religion*, reviewed by David Bastow, 378
- MORRIS, COLIN, *The Discovery of the Individual 1050–1200*, reviewed by D. O. Thomas, 495
- New Light on the Earliest Gospel: Seven Marken Studies*, by T. A. Burkill, reviewed by Sophie Laws, 375
- 'Non-being and *mu*', article by Masao Abe, 181

## CONTENTS LIST AND INDEX

- O'FLAHERTY, WENDY DONIGER, *Asceticism and Eroticism in the Mythology of Śiva*, reviewed by Geoffrey Parrinder, 359  
'On the idea of a form of life', article by Stewart R. Sutherland, 293
- ORLINSKY, HARRY M., *Essays in Biblical Culture and Bible Translation*, reviewed by Louis Jacobs, 377
- OWEN, H. P., review of *A Jewish Theology*, by Louis Jacobs, 510  
— review of *A Lawyer Among the Theologians*, by Norman Anderson, 510  
— review of *Religion and Philosophy*, by Frederick C. Copleston, 347  
*Oxford Apostles—A Character Study of the Oxford Movement*, by Geoffrey Faber, reviewed by Brend C. Cross, 506
- PARRINDER, GEOFFREY, review of *Asceticism and Eroticism in the Mythology of Śiva*, by Wendy Doniger O'Flaherty, 359  
*Paths of Life: Preface to a World Religion*, by Charles W. Morris, reviewed by David Bastow, 378
- PETERS, RICHARD S., The Lindsay Memorial Lectures 1971, and the Swathmore Lecture 1972, reviewed by T. A. Roberts, 368  
*Philosophical Approach to Religion (A)*, by W. D. Hudson, reviewed by T. E. Burke, 352  
*Philosophy and Religious Belief*, by Thomas McPherson, reviewed by O. R. Jones, 487
- POCOCK, DAVID, *Mind, Body and Wealth. A Study of Belief and Practice in an Indian Village*, reviewed by C. von Fürer-Haimendorf, 357
- PYE, MICHAEL, review of *The Reluctant Vision*, by Patrick T. Burke, 383  
— review of *Truth and Dialogue, The Relationship between World Religions*, ed. by John Hick, 354
- QUINN, PHILIP L., article: 'Religious obedience and moral autonomy', 265
- RAMSEY, MICHAEL, article: 'Christian belief—an unchanging essence?', 193  
'Rationalist and his critics, The', article by N. H. G. Robinson, 345  
*Religion and Change*, by Metropolitan Anthony, reviewed by Iltyd Trethowan, 362  
*Religion and Philosophy*, by Frederick C. Copleston, reviewed by H. P. Owen, 349  
'*Religionsgeschichtliche Schule* (The), fifty years later', article by Marcel Simon, 135  
'Religion and its three paradigmatic instances', article by J. N. Findlay, 215  
'Religious obedience and moral autonomy', article by Philip L. Quinn, 265  
'Religious significance of the ontological argument', article by Philip E. Devine, 97  
*Reluctant Vision (The)*, by Patrick T. Burke, reviewed by Michael Pye, 383
- RENO, STEPHEN J., article: 'Castaneda and Don Juan: some preliminary observations', 449
- ROBERTS, T. A., review of the Lindsay Memorial Lectures 1971, and the Swathmore Lecture 1972, by Richard S. Peters, 368
- ROBINSON, N. H. G., article: 'The rationalist and his critics', 345
- ROSENTHAL, E. I. J., review of *The Book of Direction to the Duties of the Heart*, by Baḥya Ben Joseph Ibn Paquda, 117
- SCHAEDER, GRETE, *The Hebrew Humanism of Martin Huber*, reviewed by Steven T. Katz, 120
- SCHOPENHAUER, *Selections*, reviewed by Frederick C. Copleston, 360

## CONTENTS LIST AND INDEX

- Science and Christianity—A Partnership*, by Robert E. D. Clark, reviewed by John Habgood, 384
- ‘Scientific and religious metaphors’, article by Earl R. MacCormac, 401
- Second Collection (A)*, by Bernard J. F. Lonergan, reviewed by E. L. Mascall, 509
- Selections*, by Schopenhauer, reviewed by Frederick C. Copleston, 360
- SHARPE, ERIC J., review of *Art and the Religious Experience*, by F. David Martin, 381
- SIMON, MARCEL, review of *Christianity in the Roman World*, by R. A. Markus, 502
- article: ‘The religionsgeschichtliche Schule, fifty years later’, 135
- SONTAG, FREDERICK, article: ‘Freedom and God: the meeting of East and West’, 421
- ‘Studying comparative religion’, article by Zwi R. J. Werblowsky, 145
- SUTHERLAND, STEWART R., article: ‘On the idea of a form of life’, 293
- Symbols: Public and Private*, by Raymond Firth, reviewed by C. von Furer-Haimendorf, 355
- TAPPER, NANCY, review of *Dramas, Field, and Metaphors: Symbolic Action in Human Society*, by Victor Turner, 498
- review of *The Language of the Rite*, by Roger Grainger, 125
- ‘Theology and religious studies—the unity of our discipline’, article by A. D. Galloway, 157
- ‘Theology as grammar: Is God an object of understanding?’, article by Richard H. Bell, 307
- THOMAS, D. O., review of *The Discovery of the Individual 1050–1200*, by Colin Morris, 495
- TREHOWAN, ILLTYD, review of *God and Man*, by Metropolitan Anthony, 362
- review of *Religion and Change*, by Metropolitan Anthony, 362
- Truth and Dialogue, The Relationship between World Religions*, ed. by John Hick, reviewed by Michael Pye, 354
- TURNER, VICTOR, *Dramas, Field, and Metaphors: Symbolic Action in Human Society*, reviewed by Nancy Tapper, 498
- TYRRELL, BERNARD, *Bernard Lonergan’s Philosophy of God*, reviewed by E. L. Mascall, 506
- WADIA, PHEROZE S., article: ‘The cosmological argument’, 411
- WARD, KEITH, *The Concept of God*, reviewed by Michael Durrant, 490
- WERBLOWSKY, R. J. ZWI, article: ‘On studying comparative religion’, 145
- ‘What do we study when we study religion?’, article by J. Arthur Martin, 467
- ‘Which mystic has the revelation?’, article by James R. Horne, 283
- Why Does Evil Exist?*, by Colm Connellan, reviewed by John Hick, 494
- ‘Why not Islam?’, article by R. C. Zaehner, 167
- Wittgenstein*, by Anthony Kenny, reviewed by Peter Byrne, 489
- ZAEHNER, R. C., article: ‘Why not Islam?’, 167



#### NOTES FOR CONTRIBUTORS

1. Contributions and books for review should be sent to the editor, Professor H. D. Lewis, King's College, Strand, London, W.C.2. Books published in America should be sent to Professor J. E. Smith, Department of Philosophy, Yale University, New Haven.
2. Contributions should normally be in English and should preferably be typewritten (double-spaced on quarto paper). Contributors should keep a copy themselves for use when correcting proofs.
3. Submission of an article is taken to imply that it has not previously been published, or is not being considered for publication elsewhere. If rejected manuscripts are to be returned, stamps or international coupons should be sent to cover postage.
4. All contributors receive 50 free separates.

PRINTED BY Unwin Brothers Limited OLD WOKING SURREY ENGLAND

A member of the Staples Printing Group

(708)

# Religious Studies

Volume 11, Number 4, December 1975

## CONTENTS

HESSE, MARY Criteria of Truth in Science and Theology	385
MACCORMAC, EARL R. Scientific and Religious Metaphors	401
WADIA, PHEROZE S. The Cosmological Argument	411
SONTAG, FREDERICK Freedom and God: The Meeting of East and West	421
ADAMS, MARILYN McCORD Hell and the God of Justice	433
RENO, STEPHEN J. Castaneda and Don Juan: Some Preliminary Observations	449
MARTIN, J. ARTHUR What do we Study when we Study Religion	467
LONDIS, JAMES J. 'Mediated Immediacy' in the Thought of John E. Smith: A Critique	473
<i>Review Article</i>	
BUTTERWORTH, ROBERT, S.J. The Identity of Jesus	481
<i>Reviews</i>	487

© Cambridge University Press, 1975

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Bentley House, 200 Euston Road, London NW1 2DB  
32 East 57th Street, New York, N.Y. 10022

*Religious Studies* is indexed in the *Index of Religious Periodical Literature*